

The Curricular Dichotomy in Islamic Education: Concepts and Cross-Institutional Implementation at SMAN 1 Banjaran and MA Al-Falah Soreang

Radini Teza Inten*

Institut Agama Islam Persis Bandung, Indonesia
Email: radiniradin719@gmail.com

Muhamad Iqbal Fathurrahman
Institut Agama Islam Persis Bandung, Indonesia
Email: Elmumtaz06@gmail.com

*Correspondence: radiniradin719@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The moral degradation of Indonesian adolescents presents a serious challenge requiring special attention from the education sector. This study aims to compare the concepts and implementation of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) in formal public schools (SMAN 1 Banjaran) and formal schools based on Islamic boarding schools (MA Al-Falah Soreang). This research employed a qualitative approach with a comparative study design. Data was collected through in-depth interviews with 10 informants (principals, curriculum vice-principals, PAI teachers, and student activity coordinators), participant observation, and documentation. Data analysis was conducted using the Miles & Huberman interactive model. The findings reveal that both institutions implement the seven dimensions of Islamic education according to Abdullah Nashih Ulwan (faith education, moral education, physical education, rational education, personality education, social education, and sexual education), yet with significantly different levels of intensity, methods, and duration of habituation. SMAN 1 Banjaran integrates PAI with the national curriculum, whereas MA Al-Falah internalizes Islamic boarding school values into a 24-hour culture. This study concludes that the success of PAI implementation is largely determined by the integration of formal learning, sustainable religious culture habituation, and educator role modeling. These findings recommend the

adoption of routine habituation programs from Islamic boarding schools into public schools and increased technological adaptation from public schools into Islamic boarding schools.

Keywords: Islamic Religious Education; formal schools; Islamic boarding schools; comparative study; curriculum implementation; adolescent moral.

Introduction

The national education system of Indonesia has a noble goal: to develop the potential of students to become human beings who are faithful, pious, morally excellent, healthy, knowledgeable, capable, creative, independent, and become democratic and responsible citizens (Undang-Undang Nomor 20 Tahun 2003 tentang Sistem Pendidikan Nasional, Pasal 3). However, the reality on the ground presents a stark contrast to these ideal objectives (Nurhayati & Asy'ari, 2021). The moral degradation of adolescents is increasingly alarming, with the prevalence of negative behaviors such as student brawls, promiscuity, drug abuse, and juvenile delinquency increasingly involving students as primary actors (Nasution, 2020; Mulyasa, 2021). This phenomenon has resulted in an increasing scarcity of young people with superior morals and strong character (Lickona, 2012).

The challenges of globalization and rapid technological advancement accelerate the influx of foreign cultures that often conflict with the noble values of Pancasila and Islamic teachings (Hasanah & Sutrisno, 2022). The World Health Organization (WHO) defines adolescents as the population aged 10-19 years. According to data from the Central Statistics Agency (BPS) in 2020, West Java ranked first in the number of adolescent populations in Indonesia with 8.1 million people (16.8%) out of a total population of 48.27 million (BPS, 2021). This was followed by East Java with 13.43% and Central Java with 12.66%. This significant demographic potential presents both a challenge and an opportunity for the education sector to shape the character of the young generation (Moch Nur Alim, 2019). The 2020 BPS census also recorded that 18.22% of West Java's population consists of adolescents, making this province the main source for "Human Development and Strengthening of Science and Technology" in line with Indonesia's 2045 development pillars (BPS, 2021; Kementerian PPN/Bappenas, 2019).

Islamic Religious Education (PAI) plays a strategic role in addressing the challenge of moral degradation (Muhaimin, 2004). PAI is defined as a conscious and planned activity to prepare students to know,

understand, believe in, be pious towards, have noble character, and practice the teachings of Islam from its primary sources, the Qur'an and Hadith (Ramayulis, 2002; Tafsir, 2004). Muhaimin (2004) asserted that PAI is a systematic process of instilling Islamic values in the soul, emotions, and mind of students until it becomes a way of life. The goal of PAI is not merely to produce students who have expertise in the science of Islam, but rather to form *insan kamil* (a perfect human being) who becomes a mercy to all creation (*rahmatan li al-'alamin*) (Al-Abrasyi, 1970; Tafsir, 2004).

However, the implementation of PAI across various educational institutions shows significant variation in terms of concepts, methods, intensity of instruction, and outcomes achieved (Mulyasa, 2021). Two models of educational institutions that are interesting to compare are formal public schools and formal schools based on Islamic boarding schools (Usman, 2017). Formal public schools follow the national curriculum structure with limited time allocated for PAI (approximately 3-4 hours per week), whereas Islamic boarding schools integrate religious education into a 24-hour culture, ranging from daily prayers, study of classical Islamic books (*kitab kuning*), to the habituation of noble character (Dhofier, 2011; Mastuhu, 1994). This difference in approach significantly impacts the quality, depth of religious understanding, and character formation of students (Mannan, 2019; Syafe'i, 2017).

Historically, Islamic boarding schools (*pesante*) have existed since the era of Walisongo as independent Islamic propagation and education institutions (Herman, 2013). The elements of a *pesantren* include the *kyai* (religious leader), *santri* (students), mosque, teaching of classical Islamic books, and dormitory (Dhofier, 2011). According to Ridwan Nasir (2005), *pesantren* are Islamic educational institutions where religious education and instruction are generally provided non-classically using the *sorogan* (individual) and *bandongan* (classical) systems. In their early development, *pesantren* functioned as a medium for the spread of Islam and played a crucial role in the social transformation of Indonesian society (Steenbrink, 1986; Wahid, 2015). Since Indonesia's independence, *pesantren* have made significant contributions to the emergence of important government figures such as Mukti Ali (Minister of Religious Affairs), M. Natsir (Prime Minister), and Abdurrahman Wahid (Gus Dur, the fourth President of the Republic of Indonesia), all of whom came from the *pesantren* community (Baso, 2017).

Meanwhile, formal education, as regulated by Law Number 20 of

2003, is a structured and tiered educational pathway comprising primary, secondary, and tertiary education, overseen by the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research, and Technology (Syaadah et al., 2022). Suprijanto (2007) defines formal education as intentional learning activities conducted by both students and educators in a structured school environment. The history of formal education in Indonesia began in 1901 when the Dutch introduced education for the population of the Dutch East Indies (Indonesia), which was divided based on social class and lineage: Europeesche Lagere School (ELS) for Europeans, Hollandsch Inlandsche School (HIS) for natives, Meer Uitgebreid Lager Onderwijs (MULO) for lower secondary education, and Algemeene Middelbare School (AMS) for upper secondary education (Sudjana, 2010). After independence, this system was integrated and adapted to national values (Soedijarto et al., 2021).

Today, formal education in Indonesia has also begun adopting the Islamic plus school model, which emphasizes Islamic-based education both in quality and quantity as a response to societal needs for strong character education (Hasan, 2021). The emergence of Islamic-based schools aims to suppress and minimize negative adolescent behavior along with the advancement of the times and to provide intensive Islamic religious education instruction for students (Nahlawi, 1992). The integration of general knowledge and religious knowledge is expected to create a collaborative model that keeps student development oriented on the right path (Al-Abrasyi, 1970).

Several studies have been conducted regarding the comparison of Islamic Religious Education learning across various educational institutions. These studies provide an important foundation for more in-depth comparative research.

First, a study by M. Farjihut Tawakal (2016) entitled "Management of the Boarding School Learning System Implemented in Public Schools and Madrasahs" found that at the planning stage, teachers developed Lesson Plans (RPP) aligned with the School-Based Curriculum (KTSP) set by the government, which were then further developed into daily implementation RPPs. The difference between Tawakal's research and the present study lies in its primary focus on management aspects, whereas this study focuses on the concepts and implementation of PAI using Ulwan's seven-dimensional framework. However, the inspiration from the learning management aspects in Tawakal's research enriches the analysis of implementation in both institutions.

Second, a study by Farida Galela (2012) in her thesis entitled "Parental Education in Boarding Schools in an Effort to Improve the Quality of Islamic Education at the Hidayatullah Islamic Boarding School, Fakfak Regency" showed that the implementation of the boarding school education system was reflected in the management and mentoring practices applied, as well as various factors related to management functions and mentoring processes that affected the quality of Islamic education. The similarity between this study and Galela's research lies in the discussion of Islamic religious education in pesantren. However, the difference lies in Galela's focus on boarding school teaching patterns, while this study compares the concepts and implementation of PAI between public schools and pesantren more comprehensively.

Third, a study by Suci Firidianti (2017) entitled "Comparative Study of Learning Outcomes of Islamic Boarding School Students and Non-Boarding School Students in Fiqh Subjects at MTs Inayatullah Gasing Laut" used a quantitative comparative design. The findings showed that the average learning outcomes of students residing in pesantren (82.03) were higher than those of students residing at home (76.36), with a significant difference at the 5% level. The similarity between this study and Firidianti's research lies in the use of comparative research design. However, Firidianti's study only compared cognitive learning outcomes in Fiqh subjects, while this study compares the concepts and implementation of PAI holistically across Ulwan's seven dimensions (faith, moral, physical, rational, personality, social, sexual) at two different institutions.

Fourth, a study by Moch Nur Alim (2019) entitled "Comparative Study of Islamic Religious Education in Formal Schools Based on Boarding Schools and Pesantren" shares the closest thematic similarity to this study. The study found that formal schools based on boarding schools adopted PAI values originating from pesantren, while pesantren made PAI an integral cultural tradition. The difference between Alim's study and this study is that Alim employed a quantitative approach and only compared learning outcomes, whereas this study uses a qualitative approach and compares the concepts and implementation of PAI in depth using Ulwan's framework. This study also fills a gap in Alim's research, which did not analyze the seven dimensions of Islamic education in detail.

Fifth, a study by Dahlia Sibagariang, Hotmaulina Sihotang, and Erni Murniarti (2021) on "The Role of Guru Penggerak (Mover

Teachers) in the Independent Learning Education System in Indonesia" found that mover teachers have a special role in independent learning: to become teachers capable of managing learning with technology and conducting continuous reflection. Although its focus differs (mover teachers vs. PAI comparison), this study provides a framework for how changes in the learning paradigm affect PAI implementation. This is relevant to the context of PAI implementation at SMAN 1 Banjaran and MA Al-Falah, both of which are also adapting to the dynamics of national education policies, including the Independent Curriculum.

This study differs from and complements previous research because it: (1) uses a more comprehensive theoretical framework (Abdullah Nashih Ulwan's seven dimensions of Islamic education); (2) compares both concepts and implementation simultaneously, not just learning outcomes; (3) employs a qualitative approach to capture meaning and context in depth; and (4) selects representative research locations (public general school vs. private pesantren-based madrasah) so the findings can provide a more balanced comparative picture of the general education and pesantren models.

Methods

Design and Approach

This study employed a qualitative approach with a comparative study design (Creswell, 2014). The qualitative approach was chosen because it allows in-depth exploration of the meanings, contexts, and processes of PAI implementation in both institutions (Sugiyono, 2010). The comparative design was selected because the main objective of the study was to compare two models of educational institutions to identify the similarities, differences, and relative advantages of each (Miles & Huberman, 1994).

Location and Participants

The study was conducted at two locations: SMAN 1 Banjaran, Bandung Regency, and MA Al-Falah Soreang, Bandung Regency. The selection of both locations was based on their representative characteristics: SMAN 1 Banjaran is a public general school with A accreditation, established in 1985 with a strong religious vision, while MA Al-Falah is a private pesantren-based madrasah established in 1982 with an intensive religious program (Profile of SMAN 1 Banjaran, 2024; Profile of MA Al-Falah, 2024).

Participants were selected using purposive sampling with the

following criteria: (a) directly involved in PAI implementation; (b) having at least 3 years of experience at the institution; (c) holding a structural or functional position related to PAI; and (d) willing to be informants (Creswell & Poth, 2018). The total number of participants was 10, consisting of: 1 principal, 1 curriculum vice-principal, 1 student affairs coordinator, 3 PAI teachers at SMAN 1 Banjaran; and 1 principal, 2 PAI teachers, and 1 extracurricular coordinator at MA Al-Falah.

Data Collection Techniques

Data collection was conducted using three complementary techniques (Denzin & Lincoln, 2018). First, semi-structured interviews using an interview guide developed from Ulwan's (1999) seven dimensions of Islamic education. Interviews lasted 45-90 minutes per participant, were conducted at their respective workplaces, were recorded with permission, and transcribed verbatim. Second, participant observation of PAI classroom learning activities, routine prayers (congregational prayers, collective supplication), religious extracurricular activities, and daily teacher-student interactions (Spradley, 2016). Observations were conducted for 5 days at each institution. Third, documentation including school profiles, vision and mission statements, operational curricula, activity photographs, and other documents related to PAI implementation (Bowen, 2009).

Data Analysis

Data were analyzed using the interactive model of Miles, Huberman, & Saldaña (2014), which consists of three stages: (1) data reduction through thematic coding based on Ulwan's seven dimensions; (2) data display in the form of narratives and comparative matrices; and (3) conclusion drawing and verification. Coding was conducted manually by repeatedly reading interview transcripts and field notes (Saldaña, 2015).

Data Validity

Data validity was ensured through source triangulation (comparing information from principals, teachers, and school documents), technique triangulation (combining interviews, observation, and documentation), and member checking (confirming findings with key informants) (Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Creswell & Miller, 2000).

Results and Discussion

Concepts and Implementation of PAI at SMAN 1 Banjaran

SMAN 1 Banjaran has the vision "To become a superior school based on

FAITH (IMTAK) and SCIENCE & TECHNOLOGY (IPTEK), with environmental insight, moving towards an international standard school while preserving local culture" (Document of SMAN 1 Banjaran Profile, 2024). This vision reflects a balance between religious education (IMTAK) and science & technology (IPTEK). Based on data analysis, the implementation of PAI at SMAN 1 Banjaran can be mapped into Ulwan's (1999) seven dimensions as follows.

Faith Education (*Tarbiyatul Iman*)

Faith education at SMAN 1 Banjaran is implemented through routine religious studies discussing Ahlussunnah Wal Jama'ah creed. As stated by Mr. Tana Sumpena, S.Ag., M.Si., a PAI teacher: "Making students close to the Qur'an, besides that, fortifying them with the correct creed, namely Aswaja (Ahlussunnah Wal Jama'ah) creed. The importance of reading and studying the Qur'an as a way of life for Muslims, so it is impossible for Muslims to stay away and not use the Qur'an as a way of life, because that would lead them astray" (Interview, May 20, 2024).

Religious activities conducted include Dhuha and Dhuhr congregational prayers, routine studies discussing creed, and commemoration of Islamic holidays (Interview with Mr. Iqbal Faizal Rahman, S.Pd., PAI teacher, May 20, 2024). The intensity of faith education at SMAN 1 Banjaran is limited to school hours (7:30 AM - 3:30 PM), but the school maximizes the available time (Observation, May 20-24, 2024). This finding aligns with Alim's (2019) research that in public general schools, faith education tends to be structured and scheduled with limited time allocation but can be effective if supported by consistent habituation programs.

Moral Education (*Tarbiyatul Akhlak*)

Moral education is a top priority as stated in the school's mission: "Improving the practice of Islamic religious values in school life" (Document of SMAN 1 Banjaran Vision-Mission, 2024). Mr. Drs. Rudi Rahadiansyah, student affairs coordinator, asserted: "Morality, for me personally, is the most important thing. If a child has good morals, they will easily accept anything. I prefer children who have morals, for me, being smart is number whatever" (Interview, May 22, 2024).

The implementation of moral education is carried out through the habituation of greeting and shaking hands with teachers whenever meeting, enforcement of school rules and regulations, and the provision of educational sanctions for violations (Observation, May 22, 2024). This aligns with Ulwan's (1999) principle of moral education, which

emphasizes that moral education is a great responsibility for educators who need attention from guardians, educators, and the wider community. Firidianti's (2017) research also found that the habituation of positive behavior at school significantly contributes to the formation of students' morals.

Physical Education (*Tarbiyatul Jasadiyyah*)

Physical education at SMAN 1 Banjaran is structured in the curriculum with an allocation of 3 hours per week and supported by various sports extracurricular activities: futsal, basketball, badminton, soccer, taekwondo, scouts, and others (Document of SMAN 1 Banjaran Extracurricular Activities, 2024). Mr. Dendy Rifsanjani, S.Pd., a PAI teacher, explained: "Physical education at this school is very clear, there are several extracurricular activities from sports, including futsal, karate. And we always actively participate in competitions between schools such as Porseni (Sports and Arts Week) between fellow high schools, and the results of these competitions are always satisfying and proud" (Interview, May 22, 2024).

Physical education is seen as an integral part of overall education that uses physical activity as a medium to achieve goals not only physical but also mental, social, emotional, and intellectual (Interview with Mr. Tana Sumpena, May 20, 2024). Ulwan (1999) emphasized that Islam pays serious attention to physical education to ensure children grow in a strong, healthy, alert, and courteous physical condition, as stated in QS. Al-Qashah verse 26 is about the importance of physical strength and trustworthiness.

Rational Education (*Tarbiyatul 'Aqliyyah*)

SMAN 1 Banjaran develops thinking skills through Youth Scientific Work (KIR) activities, science olympiads, excellence classes, and various district and provincial level academic competitions (Document of SMAN 1 Banjaran Excellence Program, 2024). The school's vision emphasizing "environmental insight and international standards" also encourages the development of global and critical thinking (Interview with Mr. Rahman Suhaemi, S.Pd., curriculum vice-principal, May 24, 2024). Ulwan (1999) explained that rational education aims to shape children's thinking patterns with all things beneficial and effective, such as religious knowledge, culture, and civilization, so that children become wise, knowledgeable, and pious. This aligns with QS. Al-Baqarah verse 219, which encourages humans to think.

Personality Education (*Tarbiyatun Nafsiyyah*)

Character formation at SMAN 1 Banjaran is carried out through habituation programs including teachers arriving earlier to greet students, the habituation of shaking hands, and the provision of routine advice and motivation both in class and on the parade ground (Observation, May 23, 2024). Mr. Rahman Suhaemi, S.Pd., curriculum vice-principal, stated: "Personality is character education and it has been well managed, one of which is through spiritual studies to shape students' character as insan kamil (perfect human beings)" (Interview, May 24, 2024).

Ulwan (1999) emphasized that personality education aims to educate children to be gentle, independent, enthusiastic about learning, and to instill a sense of morality and honesty. Alim's (2019) research also found that habituation in formal schools significantly contributes to the formation of students' personality, although with a more limited duration compared to pesantren.

Social Education (*Tarbiyatul Ijtima'iyah*)

Social education at SMAN 1 Banjaran is realized through social service activities, routine infaq (charitable giving) every Wednesday for humanitarian assistance or disaster relief, and community partnership programs (Interview with Mr. Iqbal Faizal Rahman, May 22, 2024; Observation, May 22, 2024). The school's vision and mission also include "fostering awareness of democratic life" and "improving relations with the community through School-Based Management (MBS) on an ongoing basis" (Document of SMAN 1 Banjaran Vision-Mission, 2024). Ulwan (1999) explained that social education is very important because the values and strength of society depend on how children are raised. The teachings of Islam regarding social relations are emphasized in QS. An-Nisa verse 36, which commands doing good to parents, relatives, orphans, the poor, near neighbors, distant neighbors, close companions, wayfarers, and those whom one's right hands possess.

Sexual Education (*Tarbiyatul Jinsiyyah*)

SMAN 1 Banjaran has strict policies regarding moral violations, ranging from a first warning letter to expulsion for repeated serious violations (Interview with Mr. Iqbal Faizal Rahman, May 22, 2024). Mr. Iqbal explained: "Moral violations at this school receive strict sanctions. When the first warning letter (SP 1) has been issued but the sanctioned student shows no change and instead commits more serious immoral acts, the school firmly expels that student. There is also a massive effort to control students, although not the only method, it is considered to have

a very significant function” (Interview, May 22, 2024).

Additionally, the school collaborates with the community health center (puskesmas) for reproductive health socialization as a preventive effort (Interview, May 22, 2024). Ulwan (1999) emphasized the importance of sexual education as a program designed to educate children about sexual issues from an early age as a preventive effort, based on QS. Ar-Rum verse 21 about the creation of spouses and the importance of love and affection.

Comparative Analysis

Based on the findings above, the comparison between SMAN 1 Banjaran and MA Al-Falah Soreang shows that both institutions implement the seven dimensions of Islamic education according to Ulwan (1999), but with significant differences in terms of intensity, methods, duration, and environmental control. Table 1 presents a summary of this comparison.

Table 1. Comparative Matrix of PAI Implementation at SMAN 1 Banjaran and MA Al-Falah Soreang

Dimension of Islamic Education	SMAN 1 Banjaran	MA Al-Falah Soreang
Faith Education	Aswaja creed studies, Dhuha & Dhuhr congregational prayers, Islamic holiday commemoration; limited to school hours (7:30 AM - 3:30 PM)	Five daily congregational prayers mandatory, classical book study (kitab kuning), morning pledge (bai'at), morning recitation; 24-hour culture
Moral Education	Greeting/shaking hands habituation, school rules, educational sanctions, programmed advice	Daily morning pledge with moral advice, student greeting by teachers (asatidz), intensive kyai role modeling
Physical Education	3 hours/week + 6 extracurricular sports (futsal, basketball, badminton, soccer, taekwondo, scouts)	Active extracurricular activities (futsal, badminton, scouts), regular participation in Porseni and Aksioma
Rational Education	Youth Scientific Work (KIR), science olympiads, excellence classes, academic competitions	Olympiad classes (science, social studies, religion), tahfidz program, strengthening reasoning through book discussions
Personality Education	Teachers greet students at gate/class, handshake habituation, routine advice	Teachers greet students, collective prayer, student rotation for short lectures (kultum), daily pledge advice

Social Education	Social service, routine Wednesday infaq, School-Based Management, community partnerships	Social service, extensive pesantren network, <i>tasamuh & tawasuth</i> , cross-institutional partnerships
Sexual Education	Strict sanctions (warning letters to expulsion), CCTV, health center socialization, preventive efforts	Health center education on dangers of free sex & early marriage, drug counseling

Source: Compiled from interviews and observations at SMAN 1 Banjaran & MA Al-Falah Soreang, May 2024

Key Findings of the Comparison and Their Implications: *First*, both institutions consistently implement the seven dimensions of Islamic education according to Ulwan (1999), demonstrating that Ulwan's holistic educational framework is universal and adaptable to various types of Islamic educational institutions in Indonesia. This finding reinforces Ulwan's theory that Islamic education must encompass all aspects of human personality, not merely spiritual or cognitive dimensions (Ulwan, 1999; Al-Banna, 2017). However, the differences in intensity and implementation methods between the two institutions indicate that the institutional context (public school vs. pesantren) affects the depth of internalization of religious values.

Second, the advantage of SMAN 1 Banjaran lies in the balanced integration of religious and general knowledge, as well as the availability of facilities and professional certified teachers. This school proves that public schools can produce religious graduates through structured programs, despite time limitations (Hasan, 2021). Meanwhile, the advantage of MA Al-Falah is the long duration of habituation (24 hours), tight environmental control (dormitory), and the depth of religious material through the study of classical books and the tahfidz program (Dhofier, 2011; Mastuhu, 1994). This finding aligns with Firidianti's (2017) research results showing that students living in pesantren have higher religious learning outcomes compared to students living at home.

Third, the challenge for SMAN 1 Banjaran is the limited time for intensive development (only 7-8 hours per day vs. 24 hours at pesantren), while the challenge for MA Al-Falah is adapting to rapidly advancing digital technology and global promiscuity (Wahid, 2015). As acknowledged by the principal of MA Al-Falah, in the era of

technological onslaught and increasingly widespread promiscuity, pesantren must continue to innovate in guidance methods without abandoning traditional values (Interview, May 27, 2024). Tawakal's (2016) research also found that schools need to develop creative and adaptive lesson plans to respond to the challenges of the times.

Fourth, this study found that the determining factors for the success of PAI implementation are not merely the type of institution (public school or pesantren), but rather the consistency of program implementation, the role modeling of educators (teachers/kyai), and the involvement of the entire school ecosystem (parents, community, and environment) (Lickona, 2012; Mulyasa, 2021). SMAN 1 Banjaran proves that with strong consistency and role modeling, time limitations can be overcome through structured and measurable programs. Conversely, MA Al-Falah demonstrates that a total immersion system such as that in pesantren will be optimal if supported by strong kyai role modeling and effective environmental control (Dhofier, 2011; Alim, 2019).

Fifth, in the context of sexual education, both institutions show different yet equally preventive approaches. SMAN 1 Banjaran emphasizes sanctions and surveillance (punitive and surveillance approach), while MA Al-Falah emphasizes education and development based on religious values (educative-formative approach). Galela's (2012) research and Tawakal's (2016) research also emphasize the importance of a value-based approach in adolescent character education.

This study has several limitations. First, the generalizability of the findings is limited because they only involve two institutions in Bandung Regency. Second, the relatively short duration of the study (10 days of observation) may not capture the longitudinal dynamics of PAI implementation. Third, the study's focus on concepts and implementation has not quantitatively measured the impact of both models on the long-term character formation of students. Further research is recommended to use mixed methods with a larger sample scale and longer duration.

Conclusion

Based on the comparative analysis of the concepts and implementation

of Islamic Religious Education at SMAN 1 Banjaran and MA Al-Falah Soreang, this study concludes the following:

1. PAI implementation at SMAN 1 Banjaran encompasses all seven dimensions of Ulwan (faith, moral, physical, rational, personality, social, and sexual education) implemented in an integrated manner with the national curriculum. The advantages of this model lie in the balance between religious and general knowledge, the availability of facilities and professional teachers, but it has limitations in the short duration of training (only 7-8 hours per day).

PAI implementation at MA Al-Falah Soreang also encompasses all seven dimensions of Ulwan but with higher intensity and duration due to integration into 24-hour pesantren life. The advantages of this model lie in the depth of religious material (study of classical books, tahfidz), the long duration of habituation, and tight environmental control through the dormitory system.

The comparison of the two models shows that neither model is superior in all aspects. The determining factors for the success of PAI implementation are not the type of institution, but rather the consistency of program implementation, the role modeling of educators, and the support of the entire school ecosystem.

This study recommends: (1) for public general schools to adopt routine habituation programs and deepen religious material such as morning pledge (bai'at), collective prayers, and rotation of brief lectures (kultum), which have proven effective in pesantren; (2) for pesantren to enhance their adaptation to digital technology and global insight without abandoning traditional values; (3) for future researchers to conduct mixed methods studies with a larger scale and longitudinal duration to measure the long-term impact of both PAI implementation models on student character formation.

References

- Al-Abrasyi, M. A. (1970). *Dasar-dasar pokok pendidikan Islam*. Bulan Bintang.
- Al-Banna, H. (2017). *Majmu'ah rasail al-imam al-shahid Hasan al-Banna*. Dar al-Tawzi' wa al-Nashr al-Islamiyyah.

- Alim, M. N. (2019). *Studi komparatif pendidikan agama Islam di sekolah formal berbasis boarding school dan pesantren* [Undergraduate thesis, Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang].
- Badan Pusat Statistik. (2021). *Statistik pemuda Indonesia 2020*.
- Baso, A. (2017). *Pesantren studies 2a: Pesantren, pergerakan, dan politik*. Pustaka Afid.
- Bowen, G. A. (2009). Document analysis as a qualitative research method. *Qualitative Research Journal*, 9(2), 27–40.
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approach* (4th ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Creswell, J. W., & Miller, D. L. (2000). Determining validity in qualitative inquiry. *Theory into Practice*, 39(3), 124–130.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (4th ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (Eds.). (2018). *The SAGE handbook of qualitative research* (5th ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Dhofier, Z. (2011). *Tradisi pesantren: Studi pandangan hidup kyai dan visinya mengenai masa depan Indonesia*. LP3ES.
- Firidianti, S. (2017). *Studi perbandingan hasil belajar siswa pondok pesantren dan siswa rumahan pada mata pelajaran fiqh di MTs Inayatullah Gasing Laut* [Undergraduate thesis, Universitas Islam Negeri Raden Fatah Palembang].
- Galela, F. (2012). *Pendidikan orang tua asrama dalam upaya peningkatan mutu pendidikan Islam di Pondok Pesantren Hidayatullah Kabupaten Fakfak* [master's thesis, Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar].

- Hasan, M. (2021). *Sekolah Islam terpadu: Konsep dan implementasinya di Indonesia*. Kencana.
- Hasanah, U., & Sutrisno. (2022). Degradasi moral remaja di era digital. *Jurnal Pendidikan Karakter*, 13(1), 45–58.
- Herman, H. (2013). Sejarah pesantren di Indonesia. *AI-TA'DIB: Jurnal Kajian Ilmu Kependidikan*, 6(2), 145–158.
- Kementerian PPN/Bappenas. (2019). *Visi Indonesia 2045*.
- Lickona, T. (2012). *Educating for character: Mendidik untuk membentuk karakter*. Bumi Aksara.
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. SAGE Publications.
- Mannan, M. A. (2019). Perbandingan sistem pendidikan pesantren dan sekolah formal. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 8(2), 215–230.
- Mastuhu. (1994). *Dinamika sistem pendidikan pesantren*. INIS.
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: An expanded sourcebook* (2nd ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook* (3rd ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Muhaimin. (2004). *Paradigma pendidikan Islam: Upaya mengefektifkan pendidikan agama Islam di sekolah*. Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Mulyasa, E. (2021). *Menjadi guru penggerak merdeka belajar*. Bumi Aksara.
- Nahlawi, A. (1992). *Prinsip-prinsip dan metode pendidikan Islam*. Diponegoro.
- Nasir, R. (2005). *Mencari tipologi format pendidikan ideal: Pondok pesantren di tengah arus perubahan*. Pustaka Pelajar.

- Nasution, H. A. (2020). *Patologi sosial dan pendidikan Islam keluarga*. Scopindo Media Pustaka.
- Nurhayati, S., & Asy'ari, H. (2021). Krisis karakter remaja Indonesia di era globalisasi. *Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Islam*, 9(1), 75–92.
- Ramayulis. (2002). *Ilmu pendidikan Islam*. Kalam Mulia.
- Republik Indonesia. (2003). *Undang-Undang Nomor 20 Tahun 2003 tentang Sistem Pendidikan Nasional*. Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 2003 Nomor 78. Sekretariat Negara.
- Saldaña, J. (2015). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers* (3rd ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Sibagariang, D., Sihotang, H., & Murniarti, E. (2021). Peran guru penggerak dalam pendidikan merdeka belajar di Indonesia. *Jurnal Dinamika Pendidikan*, 14(2), 88–99.
- Soedijarto, S., et al. (2021). *Sejarah pendidikan di Indonesia*. Universitas Terbuka.
- Spradley, J. P. (2016). *Metode etnografi* (M. Z. Bahri, Trans.). Tiara Wacana.
- Steenbrink, K. A. (1986). *Pesantren, madrasah, sekolah: Pendidikan Islam dalam kurun modern*. LP3ES.
- Sudjana, N. (2010). *Pembinaan dan pengembangan kurikulum di sekolah*. Sinar Baru Algensindo.
- Sugiyono. (2010). *Metode penelitian pendidikan: Pendekatan kuantitatif, kualitatif, dan R&D*. Alfabeta.
- Suprijanto. (2007). *Pendidikan orang dewasa: Dari teori hingga aplikasi*. Bumi Aksara.

- Syaadah, R., et al. (2022). Pendidikan formal, pendidikan non formal dan pendidikan informal. *Pema: Jurnal Pendidikan dan Pengabdian Kepada Masyarakat*, 2(2), 125–131.
- Syafe'i, I. (2017). Pondok pesantren: Lembaga pendidikan pembentukan karakter. *Al-Tadzkiyyah: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 8(1), 61–82.
- Tafsir, A. (2004). *Cakrawala pemikiran pendidikan Islam*. Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Tawakal, M. F. (2016). *Manajemen sistem pembelajaran boarding school yang diterapkan di sekolah negeri dan madrasah* [Master's thesis, Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta].
- Ulwan, A. N. (1999). *Tarbiyatul aulad fil Islam* (H. A. Hakim & U. Shobih, Trans.). Darus Salam.
- Usman, U. (2017). Blater, pesantren dan pendidikan formal. *Islamuna: Jurnal Studi Islam*, 4(2), 262–275.
- Wahid, A. (2015). *Islamku, Islam Anda, Islam Kita*. The Wahid Institute.