**Unravelling the Intricacies: An In-depth Analysis of the Complexity within South African Local Government**

**Isaac Nkoana1, Mmachoene Modiba2, Mohale Ernest Selelo3**

123University of Limpopo, Development Planning and Management, South Africa

\*Corresponding author E-mail: [mohale.selelo@ul.ac.za](mailto:mohale.selelo@ul.ac.za)

**Abstract**

The aim of this paper is to investigate the how complexity affects local government in South Africa. Local government is the closest sphere to the local people in South Africa. This sphere of government is charged with the responsibility of providing goods and services to the public. However, local governments in South Africa are glued to complexity that produce ineffectiveness and inefficiency in terms of providing goods and services to the local communities. This paper relies on an assertion by Prof. Nghamula Nkuna, who refers complexity within local government as a situation where people or stakeholders do not confine themselves to a single site, nor do they always engage others in the same manner. He further states that the manner in which the ward public officials of a local municipality chair the ward committee meeting is different from the way he or she reports to the local traditional leader, and interactions vary as obligations and roles shift depending on the situation. For example, most councillors elected to local government are also employed as teachers, and they are also serving in other community structures. The findings indicate that the complexity within local government create multiple challenges, such as ineffective decision-making, slow implementation of policies, policy fragmentation and inconsistency, and strained relationships and collaboration. The paper is purely qualitative, which adopts literature-based methodology. It concludes that local government, where most public officials hold one position, do well in terms of delivering services because there is no conflict of interest. This paper recommends that local government should enforce a single-site duty towards public officials so that they engage others in the same manner to circumvent challenges created by the complexity within local government.

**Keywords:** Challenges, Complexity, Local government, Single-site, Stakeholders



**INTRODUCTION**

Local governments are seen as important sphere of any country in worldwide societies, particularly in emerging countries (Sperling & Arler, 2020; Tan & Taeihagh, 2020). This is because local governments are closest to the community members and solve the problems of those citizens (Criado & Villodre, 2021). In South Africa, local governments were charged after 1994 with responsibility to provide sustainable services to the whole people (Reddy, 2016). This points to the fact that local governments contribute to the reduction of absolute poverty caused by apartheid government in the country of South Africa (Liu, Feng, Wang & Qiu, 2020). Recently, South Africa is confronted with poor inadequate service delivery (Mamokhere, 2022). Poor service delivery within local government is caused by various complexities that affects its capacity to provides services to the people (Mamokhere, 2022). Even local people who have short-sightedness vision criticize the local governments for their inability to provides services. This leads to the service delivery protests, which cause mass damage of public infrastructure and private property (Mamokhere, 2020).

This paper relies on the definition by Prof. Nghamula Nkuna, who refers complexity within local government as a situation where people or stakeholders do not confine themselves to a single site, nor do they always engage others in the same manner (Nkuna, 2013: 88). He further states that the manner in which the ward public officials of a local municipality chair the ward committee meeting is different from the way he or she reports to the local traditional leader, and interactions vary as obligations and roles shift depending on the situation (Nkuna, 2013). The complexity highlighted has caused the local governments in South Africa to be dysfunctional (Mbandlwa, Dorasamy, & Fagbadebo, 2020). This is due to the fact that complexity makes local government glued to multiple challenges, such as ineffective decision-making, resource allocation issues, slow implementation of policies, policy fragmentation and inconsistency, and strained relationships and collaboration.

Local governments in South Africa are supposed to provide most, if not all citizens, with enough basic services (Khambule, 2020; Lemanski, 2020). However, complexity continue to hinder local governments strength and ability to ensure mass provision of services (Mamokhere, 2020; Nkuna, 2013). This paper firstly outlines the methodology used to gather information and analyse the data acquired. Secondly, it discusses the theoretical framework underpinning the article. Thirdly, it conceptualises the local government in South Africa. Fourth, it further elucidates the outcomes of complexity within local government in South Africa and the benefits of single-site duty towards public official within local government. lastly, it reveals challenges caused by officials or stakeholder who confine to multiple duties in the local government and provides strategies to improve local government.

**LITERATURE REVIEW**

**Theoretical Framework: *“O Ka Se Sebeletse Marena A Mabedi”***

“O ka se sebeletse marena a mabedi” is an African proverb that translates to “one person cannot ride two horses at the same time” (Azharbekova, Mazhitayeva, Omasheva, Toleubaeva, Talaspaeva & Zhetpisbay, 2020). This expression is used to express the idea that one person should not try to pursue two conflicting or incompatible goals or interests at the same time. This proverb was given to birth by the great intelligent ancestors of Africa after thoroughly examining issues around the African people, who do not confine themselves to a single site, nor do they always engage others in the same manner. It suggests that splitting public official efforts between two divergent paths can lead to inefficiency, confusion, and potentially unfavourable outcomes. This is what is happening in South Africa, where public officials are divided into several efforts, such as most councillors elected to local government who are also employed as teachers (Nkuna, 2013). Thus, “o ka se sebeletse marena a mabedi” proverb assumes that focusing on a single objective or course of action leads to better results (Azharbekova et al., 2020). The local government adapting to one single site duty can result in good service delivery provision, effective decision-making, resource allocation issues, and quick implementation of policies (Gao & Yu, 2020).

The paper argues that all public officials should adapt to “o ka sebeletse marena a mabedi” principle to ensure effective utilisation of the resources in local government (Mirahayuni & Garnida, 2017). This is because government officials would be prioritising and focusing on attaining public objectives (Goh & Arenas, 2020). This proverb, according to Mirahayuni and Garnida (2017), promotes proper decision making in South African local government. Mirahayuni and Garnida (2017) in his study discovered that decision making in the hands of the public officials who confine themselves to the single duty does not have delays as it is not influenced by other views (Le Gouais, Bates, Callway, Kwon, Montel, Peake-Jones, White, Hasan, Koksal, Barnfield & Bondy, 2023). Furthermore, “O ka sebeletse marena a mabedi” allows public officials to have more time to focus on their one duty, so evaluation and monitoring are at the centre of this principle. The issues of corruption, lack of reviews, and unmet deadlines exist because public officials do not confine themselves to a single site, nor do they always engage others in the same manner (Nkuna, 2013).

**South African Local Government**

Local government is referred to as a sphere of government located within the communities as compared to the other two spheres of government such as the provincial and national spheres (Sperling & Arler, 2020; Tan & Taeihagh, 2020). Local government is divided into metropolitan, district, and local municipalities (Freemark, Steil, & Thelen, 2020). The sphere was created as a decentralized strategy that was used to bring citizens closer to the people. It is regarded as an engine for local development, and it is at the centre of service delivery (Dick-Sagoe, 2020). Local government entails an intricate interaction among various parties, such as elected officials, administrators, traditional leaders, civil society, and citizens. Municipalities oversee vital services like water, sanitation, waste management, and spatial planning. Yet, effective governance is frequently impeded by overlapping roles, power struggles, and resource constraints. The conflict between political leadership and efficient administration continues to be a key obstacle, affecting the delivery of services and the well-being of the community

• **Local Government Prior 1994**

Prior to 1994, in South Africa, there was no single uniform definition of local government because each province had its own configuration of local government (Reddy, 2016). According to Evans (2023), local governments in the past discriminated against other racial groups, particularly black people. It reserved well-resourced and good commercial centres with a strong revenue base for white people (Lemon, 2021). Furthermore, black people lived in poor communities without meaningful formal economies and proper services (Kaswa, 2021). This result in a situation where black people are confronted with poverty and have limited access to basic service such as water and proper infrastructure (Modumo, 2015). Despite the fact that local government in this era supported only the minority, it provided high quality service delivery that last for years (Sebola, 2023).

**• Local Government in the Democratic Dispensation**

After 1994, local government emerged from being an institution with racist and illegitimate leadership to an institution with democratically elected leadership (Mlambo, Mubecua, & Mlambo, 2023). The signing of the new Constitution in 1996 shaped the local government as the main provider of services to local communities (Mamokhere & Kgobe, 2023). Mbandlwa et al. (2020) and Koma (2010) concur that local government is a public organization that is authorized to manage and govern the affairs of a certain area of jurisdiction. Numerous municipalities fall under the jurisdiction of a single province. Furthermore, the sphere that is closer to the people was introduced in South Africa after they had finalized the local government transformation in 2000, as provided for in terms of Chapter 7 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa of 1996 (Reddy, 2016). The Constitution made local government a critical development agent because they wanted to eradicate the absolute poverty that persisted among the poor black communities (Munzhedzi, 2021).

By 1994, black communities were provided with basic services through programs such as Reconstruction Development Programme (RDP) (Ndinga-Kanga, Van der Merwe, & Hartford, 2020). Major basic services provided under programme was housing, sanitation, infrastructure, and water were provided to citizens (Lemanski, 2020). Since 1994, the local government has made greater progress in providing service delivery and improving development in marginalized communities (Parnell, 2015). However, service provision has improved more in urban areas, while there are still backlogs in some of the rural areas, which are fixed at a slower pace (Selelo, Mokoele, & Mnisi, 2023).

The Constitution provided a mandate to the local government to create an integrated development plan (IDP), which is a five-year plan (Masilo & Gershwin, 2020; Reddy, 2010). The plan is used as a strategy to speed up provision of services to the people. This is because IDP allow public participation which assists in determining the needs of local people in the planning stage. However, author such as Mlambo et al. (2023), Kgobe (2020) and Reddy (2016) underscore that IDP, despite being constitutionally obligated, is still polluted by bad behaviour such as mismanagement and corruption conducted by public officials. As a result, local government has been labelled as something that perpetuate slow service delivery in deep rural areas in South Africa (Makale, 2015). In some places, local government is known for providing services with poor quality (Sebola, 2023).

**Complexity and Local Government in South Africa**

There are many different and diverse aspects to local government in South Africa. They address a wide range of issues, such as inefficiencies in administration, political complexities, socioeconomic inequalities, and challenges with infrastructure. The complicated administrative procedures result from the complex bureaucracy, causing frequent delays in making decisions and implementing policies (Trondal & Haslerud, 2024). The political intricacies arise from the power dynamics among various political parties and factions in the local government (Manamela, Mulaudzi, Selelo & Hussein, 2020). Complex socio-economic factors are linked to the significant inequalities in wealth and resource availability across various communities, influencing the provision and efficiency of local government services (Scoones & Stirling, 2020). The difficulties with maintaining and improving physical infrastructure, like roads, water supply, and public buildings are known as infrastructural complexities (Manamela, et al., 2020). The interconnection of these complexities poses a difficult challenge for local governance in South Africa. Grasping these complexities is essential in creating successful plans for governing locally and promoting sustainable development in the communities.

**The Benefits of Implementing a Single-site Responsibility Approach for the officialdom in Local Government**

Single site duty in local government fosters a sense of responsibility and accountability (Carrard, Neumeyer, Pati, Siddique, Choden, Abraham, Gosling, Roaf, Alvarez-Sala Torreano, & Bruhn, 2020). This means public officials would be responsible for meeting deadlines as the community members would hold them accountable (Killian & Hyle, 2020). Single-site duty allows officials to be more closely connected to the community they serve. As a result, public officials are likely to be more responsive to local needs and concerns thus not meeting objectives and goals of the project will be a thing of the past (Makalela, 2021). Furthermore, single duty assists public officials to clearly understand what is needed of them without a confusion (Carrard et al., 2020).

Public officials confine to a single site duty are better positioned to produce quality work (Choi & Choi, 2021). Masipa (2021) states that single site duty gives public officials enough time to engage with local community which means public officials would be informed about quality of product by the local people and deliver it. It is argued that public officials who focus on single site duty better understand local issues (Choi & Choi, 2021). This first-hand knowledge enables public officials to make informed decisions that are tailored to the specific needs of the community. As a result, local government provides local people with good quality service delivery and restore public trust (Manyaka & Sebola, 2015; Reddy, 2016).

Simplicity associated with single site duty always leads to effective outcomes in local government (Covello, McCallum & Pavlova, 2012). This is because single site duty promotes transparency in the local government. Transparency allows public officials to be more accessible thus public officials will use the resource effective because local people would be watching their behaviours and how they use the resource (Molina Rodríguez-Navas, Medranda Morales & Muñoz Lalinde, 2021). Furthermore, single site is associated with quick response to emergencies which promote effective utilisation of resources (Crompton, Burke, Jordan & Wilson, 2021). This is due to the fact that in the event of emergencies or crises, having public officials stationed locally facilitates quicker response times. This is crucial for managing and mitigating the impact of unforeseen events on the community (Covello et al., 2012).

**Predicaments Encountered by Officialdoms who are Tasked with Multiple Responsibilities within Local Government**

Ineffective decision-making is at the centre of public officials or stakeholders who confine themselves to multiple duties in the local government (Ammons & Roenigk, 2021). According to Masuku and Jili (2019), additional responsibilities outside of their mandate would result in inefficient decision-making because public officials must spend a lot of time consulting with the federal and provincial governments. Furthermore, high-ranking local government employees are frequently needed from project inception to its completion; yet their other commitments might cause them to put off making decisions, which in turn can cause the project to take longer. (Masiya, Davids & Mangai, 2019). Furthermore, occupied public officials by various duties leads to the slow implementation of policies in South Africa local government (Khambule, 2021). Public officials who confine to multiple duties are prone to corruption (Kgobe, 2020; Reddy, 2016). Corruption causes financial misallocation and delays in decision-making, which are linked to policies being implemented slowly (Reinsberg, Stubbs, Kentikelenis & King, 2020). Furthermore, public officials who are employed to multiple duties are linked to inadequate oversight and assessment. The sluggish execution of policy may be caused by inadequate oversight and evaluation procedures. It becomes difficult to locate and remove bottlenecks in the implementation process when there is inadequate oversight (Drolc & Keiser, 2021).

It is vividly clear that public officials who work in a different place leads to policy fragmentation and inconsistency (Gebremeskel, Udenigwe, Etowa & Yaya, 2023). The reason public officials who work in a different place causes policy fragmentation and inconsistency is because different workplaces often have distinct missions, goals, and priorities based on their specific functions (Sopykhanova, Maytanov, Kiseleva & Zhamiyeva, 2023). Furthermore, public officials sometimes might confuse one sector with another one thus leading to discrepancies in policies (Gebremeskel et al., 2023). Again, different workplaces may operate under different regulatory frameworks, compliance requirements, and standards (Suleiman, 2023). This could lead to improper policy implementation in South African local government. On top of that, strained relationship and collaboration caused by public officials working different jobs includes lack of trust (Laufs & Waseem, 2020). Differences in workplace backgrounds can contribute to a lack of trust between individuals who may be unfamiliar with each other work environments (Goetz, Wald & Freisinger, 2021). This is because distrust hinder open communication and cooperation. Furthermore, working in different leads to unclear roles and responsibilities (Lyon, Peeples & Rosen, 2021). Necessarily because of lack of clarity regarding roles and responsibilities in collaborative efforts can lead to confusion and conflict. Individuals may feel frustrated if expectations are not clearly defined or if there is ambiguity about who is accountable for specific task (Overman & Schillemans, 2022). Undoubtedly, individual who work in different place may compete for recognition, credit, or opportunities within collaborative projects (O’Dwyer, Filieri & O’Malley, 2023). If not managed well, this competition can lead to strained relationships and hinder collective achievements.

Local municipalities are having problems with service delivery (Nemec & Špaček, 2020). According to Mangweta & Mashamaite (2023), community members in South Africa are without proper services, particularly in rural areas thus strikes becomes solution to the mass. These protests result in the destruction of the public and private properties and infrastructures in South Africa. Mokoele (2023) in his paper reveals that despite South Africa being in democracy for almost two decades, services such as water and proper infrastructure are limited or sometimes nothing at all. Research shows that local governments does not have enough funds as a result struggle to provides services to people (Angel & Mudrazija, 2021). Furthermore, Local government have a lot of responsibilities with less power and limited resources to carry out the duties (Robson, 2022). Because of this, citizens sometimes receive services after longer time than expected. Additionally, municipalities experience a range of problems associated with their administrative staff (Manyaka & Sebola, 2015). Most of these municipalities have reported skill shortages because some of the most skilled and experienced managers left the office, leaving those who knew less about the obligations that they had (Oishi, Aoki, Harada, Tanaka, Tanaka, Tanaka, Fukuda, Kamikawa, Tsuji, Komura, & Kokudo, 2021; Manyaka & Sebola, 2015). In other incidence, most of the local government officials got employment due to nepotism, and they know nothing about how to execute duties, thus, services do not reach the local communities (Kgobe, 2020). People employed through nepotism are likely involve themselves in misconduct such as corruption and fraud (Mamokhere & Kgobe, 2023; Mlambo et al., 2023). Furthermore, the South African municipalities train their employees according to the Skill Development Act through SETA, however, Malakoane, Heunis, Chikobvu, Kigozi, and Kruger (2020) opine that the training provided is stated to be inadequate and inappropriate. For this reason, service provision ends up being a challenge for many municipalities.

Dzingai (2016) stipulates that South Africa local government have insufficient review of development plans such as integrated development plan (IDP) and SPLUMA which to promote sustainable provision of services to the local communities. This was revealed in the study of Makalela (2021) who discovers that due to lack of reviewing of IDP, most municipalities still use an IDP created in the previous despite the fact that need of the changes over time. Furthermore, public officials responsible for development of IDP are criticised for changing only the date on the cover page of the development plan while the document contain the repeated information (Masipa, 2021). Makalela (2021) and Masipa (2021) state that perpetuation of absence review of development plans exists because the municipalities do not actively allow the public to participate in the IDP process. Thus, local people find it difficult to hold the public official accountable.

**Strategies to Improve Local Government**

South African local government has numerous problems that impede its ability to provide high-quality services and goods (Hart, Booyens & Sinyolo, 2020). As a result, effective techniques are required to address the issues raised in this article. To address the issues related to slow policy implementation. local government should set explicit dates for policy implementation and hold responsible parties accountable for meeting them and create mechanisms to track progress and address delays. These policies tested on a limited scale before full adoption to discover potential difficulties and refine approaches. Furthermore, problems such as corruption, service backlogs and slow policy implementation in local government remain due to internal processes (Vogl, Seidelin, Ganesh & Bright, 2020). As a result, it is critical to outsource external auditors who can ensure that local government money is handled correctly. Furthermore, auditing should be done on a monthly basis rather than at the conclusion of the fiscal year in order to hold public authorities accountable (Matlala & Uwizeyimana, 2020). According to Kgobe, Selepe, and Xolani (2023), not only should finances be audited, but also officials' work to ensure that they are carrying out their obligations in accordance with the law. This suggests that the act of auditing is very beneficial since auditors are not biased when auditing, and it is critical that the person in charge of external auditing has no relationship with anyone within the institution. Furthermore, regular audits make public officials more accountable and responsible for their actions since they know they are being observed.

It is critical that public officials receive complete training and development before performing their tasks (Atmaja, Fachrurazi, Abdullah, Fauziah, Zaroni & Yusuf, 2022). To accomplish their jobs properly, public officials must improve their skills, knowledge, and competencies (Sugiarti, Finatariani & Rahman, 2021). Furthermore, training and development could be accomplished through a variety of activities, including workshops, on-the-job training, and educational programs (Beqiri & Mazreku, 2020). However, throughout training, it is critical to identify training needs and assess the influence they have on the government. Training and development help staff in local government better grasp their responsibilities. As a result, fewer mistakes will be made, leading to more effective service planning. Furthermore, the South African local government allows community members to become passive participants, where they are only told what will be provided to them, which contradicts the constitution (Bester, 2020). Mamokhere and Kgobe (2023) indicate that according to the constitution of South Africa, the public should be actively involved in the development process. To make the public actively involved, the local government should find better mechanisms to make people aware that development is for them. This could allow community members to contribute effectively and efficiently to the development process. As a result, the decision-making process may be as successful as planned, hence addressing service delivery issues.

The local government should establish proper communication channels that are open and transparent between them and the citizens (Arshad & Khurram, 2020). The most effective communication channel is regular community meetings where citizens convey their issues and solutions are found (Cantor, Rus & Tasente, 2021). Additionally, public officials will be well aware of the real challenges faced by community members (Berry, Trochmann & Millesen, 2024). However, there are other communication channels that could be utilized, including community surveys, public access television, social media platforms, and community events (Mitcham, Taylor & Harris, 2021). It is important that the communication channels that are used are two-way to avoid dominance by one party. There will be effective decision-making between the parties, and it will be more effective if the local government uses more than one communication channel. Moreover, local governments ought to collaborate and partner with other organizations, government agencies, and the business sector to harness resources and expertise to improve service delivery which assist to reduce strike (Mokoele, 2022). In South Africa, the private sector has been reported to be doing well in supplying people with services and goods that were meant to be provided by the local government (Munzhedzi, 2021). As a result, it is critical that local governments devise strategies for enhancing their relationship with the private sector in order to improve service delivery. Furthermore, the Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) at the community level are better able to reach the poor through donations, and for that, the local government should try to provide with grants to reduce absolute poverty (Chepkemoi & Kisimbii, 2021). This suggests that local governments must maintain effective ties with the NGOs, corporate sector, provincial and national governments in order to avoid strained relationships and to make effective decisions.

**RESEARCH METHODS**

This paper employed a qualitative approach since it makes extensive use of secondary data as a means of obtaining pertinent and necessary information to meet its goals and address its central question. Secondary data is information gathered by a party other than the original user. It implies the data has already been analysed and is available (Thusi & Mashamaite, 2023). The secondary data used includes journal article and books. It analysed existing literature on complexity within local government and its implication on the provision of services. It has used a thematic analysis. Thematic analysis is a technique used to analyze qualitative information. Typically, it is utilized on a group of texts like interviews or transcripts (Byrne, 2022). The researcher carefully analyses the data to discover recurring themes-subjects, concepts, and patterns of significance that are frequently present. Therefore, themes developed under literature review were carefully elucidated, analysed and interpreted in order to give meaning and clarity thereof.

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

One key finding is the detrimental impact of public officials or stakeholders who confine themselves to multiple duties in local government. Necessarily because it results in inefficiency, corruption, and inadequate oversight, leading to slow policy implementation and service delivery. The paper highlights the challenges faced by officials who are stretched thin across various responsibilities, such as conflicting priorities, lack of time for thorough decision-making, and increased risk of corruption due to divided attention. Moreover, the paper underscores the importance of adopting a single-site duty approach within local government. Embracing this principle promotes responsibility, accountability, and transparency among public officials. It allows officials to focus their efforts on specific objectives, leading to better outcomes in service delivery and decision-making processes. Additionally, the paper emphasizes the benefits of single-site duty in fostering closer connections between public officials and the communities they serve, resulting in more responsive governance. However, despite the potential benefits of single-site duty, the paper acknowledges the challenges in its implementation. Many public officials in South Africa hold multiple positions, making it difficult to enforce a single-duty approach.

Addressing this issue requires comprehensive reforms in recruitment practices and organizational structures within local government. Furthermore, the paper suggests strategies to improve local government effectiveness. These include setting explicit deadlines for policy implementation, outsourcing external auditors to ensure financial accountability, investing in comprehensive training and development programs for public officials, and enhancing communication channels with citizens. Collaboration with other organizations, including NGOs and the private sector, is also highlighted as crucial for resource mobilization and improved service delivery. As a result, the findings underscore the urgent need for reforms within South Africa's local government to address the complexity hindering effective governance and service delivery. Adopting a single-site duty approach towards public officials, coupled with comprehensive reforms and strategic partnerships, can contribute to overcoming these challenges and improving the lives of citizens across the country.

**CONCLUSION**

The paper concludes that complexity identified create problems such as ineffective decision-making, slow implementation of policies, policy fragmentation and inconsistency, and strained relationships and collaboration. This is why South Africa's local government is regarded as ineffective and incapable of providing adequate public services. Thus, the paper contends that embracing single-site duty towards public officials leads to better outcome. Local government should facilitate single-site duty towards public officials necessarily because it promotes institution’s transparency, accountability, and accessibility. However, there is still a long way for local government in South Africa to achieve single duty towards public officials because of most local officials hold numerous positions. The paper suggests that local governments adjust recruitment practices in order to limit giving public officials who holds position an additional position. The paper goes on to recommends that local governments thoroughly comprehend how the stated complexity limits their ability to provide services. The paper recommends that local government should enforce a single-site duty towards public officials so that they engage others in the same manner to circumvent challenges created by the complexity within local government.

**BIBLIOGRAPHY**

Arshad, S. and Khurram, S. (2020). Can government’s presence on social media stimulate citizens’ online political participation? Investigating the influence of transparency, trust, and responsiveness. *Government Information Quarterly*, 37(3), 1-18.

Atmaja, D.S., Fachrurazi, F., Abdullah, A., Fauziah, F., Zaroni, A.N. and Yusuf, M. (2022). Actualization of performance management models for the development of human resources quality, economic potential, and financial governance policy in Indonesia Ministry of Education. *Multicultural Education,* 9(1), 1-17.

Azharbekova, E.N., Mazhitayeva, S., Omasheva, Z.M., Toleubaeva, K., Talaspaeva, Z. and Zhetpisbay, S. (2020). Paroemias as explication of human qualities in the English language. *Rupkatha Journal on Interdisciplinary Studies in Humanities,* 12(6).

Beqiri, T. and Mazreku, I. (2020). Lifelong learning, training and development employee’s perspective. *Journal of Educational and Social Research*, 10(2), 94.

Berry, S., Trochmann, M.B. and Millesen, J.L. (2024). Putting the humanity back into public human resources management: A narrative inquiry analysis of public service in the time of COVID-19. *Review of Public Personnel Administration*, 44(1), 8-31.

Bester, J. (2020). The voice of the voiceless: Exploring factors that motivate public participation at local government level in South Africa through a case study of Khayelitsha Township in Cape Town. *African Journal of Democracy and Governance*, 7(3-4), 193-220.

Byrne, D. (2022). A worked example of Braun and Clarke’s approach to reflexive thematic analysis. *Quality & Quantity*, 56(3), 1391-1412.

Cantor, D.F., Rus, M. and Tasente, T. (2021). Media communication strategies in the central public administration. *Technium Soc. Sci. J*., 19, 191.

Chepkemoi, Y.E. and Kisimbii, J.M. (2021). Determinants of the sustainability of donor-funded poverty reduction programs in non-governmental organizations in Mombasa County, Kenya. *International Academic Journal of Information Sciences and Project Management*, 3(7), 18-42.

Choi, M. and Choi, Y. (2021). Employee perceptions of hotel CSR activities during the COVID-19 pandemic. International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management, 33(10), 3355-3378.

Dzingai, T. (2016). Integrated Development Plans and its sectoral plans in the optimisation of participatory and integrated spatial planning as transformation tool: a case study of Tlokwe Local Municipality (Doctoral dissertation). North West University.

Gao, X. and Yu, J. (2020). Public governance mechanism in the prevention and control of the COVID-19: information, decision-making and execution. Journal of Chinese Governance, 5(2), 178-197.

Gebremeskel, A.T., Udenigwe, O., Etowa, J. and Yaya, S. (2023). Unpacking the challenges of fragmentation in community-based maternal newborn and child health and health system in rural Ethiopia: a qualitative study. *Plos One*, 18(9), p.e0291696.

Goetz, N., Wald, A. and Freisinger, E. (2021). A person-environment-fit-model for temporary organizations-Antecedents for temporary working settings*. International Journal of Project Management,* 39(1), 1-9.

Goh, J.M. and Arenas, A.E. 2020. IT value creation in public sector: how IT-enabled capabilities mitigate tradeoffs in public organisations. European Journal of Information Systems, 29(1), 25-43.

Hart, T.G., Booyens, I. and Sinyolo, S. (2020). Innovation for development in South Africa: Experiences with basic service technologies in distressed municipalities. *In Forum for Development Studies,* 47(1), 23-47).

Kgobe, F.K.L. (2020). Africanised public administration sold out public service delivery: a case of South Africa. International Conference on Public Administration and Development Alternative (IPADA).

Kgobe, S.F., Selepe, M. and Xolani, T. (2023). The role of Auditor-General in strengthening compliance levels in local government administration: the quest for dedicated public officials. International *Journal of Social Science Research and Review*, 6(7), 380-392.

Khambule, I. (2020). The effects of COVID-19 on the South African informal economy: Limits and pitfalls of government’s response. *Loyola Journal of Social Sciences*, 34(1), 95-109.

Koma, S.B. 2010. The state of local government in South Africa: issues, trends and options. Journal of Public Administration, 45(1.1).

Laufs, J. and Waseem, Z. (2020). Policing in pandemics: A systematic review and best practices for police response to COVID-19. *International Journal of Disaster Risk Reduction*, 51, 1-17.

Le Gouais, A., Bates, G., Callway, R., Kwon, H.R., Montel, L., Peake-Jones, S., White, J., Hasan, M.N., Koksal, C., Barnfield, A. and Bondy, K. (2023). Understanding how to create healthier places: A qualitative study exploring the complex system of urban development decision-making*. Health & Place*, 81, 1-12.

Lemanski, C. (2020). Infrastructural citizenship: The everyday citizenships of adapting and/or destroying public infrastructure in Cape Town, South Africa. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers,* 45(3), 589-605.

Lyon, A.S., Peeples, W.B. and Rosen, M.K. (2021). A framework for understanding the functions of biomolecular condensates across scales. *Nature Reviews Molecular Cell Biology*, 22(3), 215-235.

Makalela, K.I. (2021). Water service provision in Lepelle-Nkumpi Local Municipality in South Africa. *Journal of Public Administration*, 56(3), 524-538.

Mamokhere, J. and Kgobe, F.K.L. (2023). One district, one approach, one budget, one plan: understanding district development model as an initiative for improving service delivery and socio-economic development in South Africa. *IAHRW International Journal of Social Sciences Review*, 11(3), 362-370.

Mamokhere, J. (2020). An assessment of reasons behind service delivery protests: A case of Greater Tzaneen Municipality. *Journal of Public Affairs*, 20(2), 1-7.

Mamokhere, J. (2022). Understanding the complex interplay of governance, systematic, and structural factors affecting service delivery in South African Municipalities. *Commonwealth Youth & Development,* 20(2). 1-28.

Manamela, M.G., Mulaudzi, K.M., Selelo, M.E. and Hussein, M. (2020). Corrosiveness of corruption and the quest for good governance in South Africa and Malawi. *Journal of Public Administration and Development Alternatives (JPADA),* 5(1), 110-121.

Masipa, M.H. (2021). An analysis of the Integrated Development Planning (IDP) process in Blouberg Local Municipality (Doctoral dissertation). University of Pretoria).

Masiya, T., Davids, Y.D. and Mangai, M.S. (2019). Assessing service delivery: Public perception of municipal service delivery in South Africa. *Theoretical and Empirical Researches in Urban Management,* 14(2), 20-40.

Masuku, M.M. and Jili, N.N. (2019). Public service delivery in South Africa: The political influence at local government level. *Journal of Public Affairs*, 19(4), 1-7.

Matlala, L.S. and Uwizeyimana, D.E. (2020). Factors influencing the implementation of the auditor general’s recommendations in South African municipalities. *African Evaluation Journal*, 8(1), 1-11.

Mirahayuni, N.K. and Garnida, S.C. (2017). ‘Sapi perah’or ‘kuda beban’: Cultural Values in Indonesian Proverbs Associated with Horse, Cow, Buffalo and Donkey. *KnE Social Sciences*, 175-186.

Mitcham, D., Taylor, M. and Harris, C. (2021). Utilizing social media for information dispersal during local disasters: The communication hub framework for local emergency management. International *Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 18(20), 1-16.

Mokoele, N.J. (2022). Fragmented governance in South African cities: The dilemmas of planning and management. *African Renaissance* (1744-2532), 19(2), 13-30.

Munzhedzi, P.H. (2021). An evaluation of the application of the new public management principles in the South African municipalities. Journal of Public Affairs, 21(1), 1-8.

Ndevu, Z. and Muller, K. (2017). A conceptual framework for improving service delivery at local government in South Africa. *African Journal of Public Affairs*, 9(7), 13-24.

O’Dwyer, M., Filieri, R. and O’Malley, L. (2023). Establishing successful university–industry collaborations: barriers and enablers deconstructed. *The Journal of Technology Transfer*, 48(3), 900-931.

Oishi, K., Aoki, T., Harada, T., Tanaka, C., Tanaka, S., Tanaka, H., Fukuda, K., Kamikawa, Y., Tsuji, N., Komura, K. and Kokudo, S. (2021). Association of neighborhood food environment and physical activity environment with obesity: A large-scale cross-sectional study of fifth-to ninth-grade children in Japan. *INQUIRY: The Journal of Health Care Organization, Provision, and Financing*, 58, 1-9.

Overman, S. and Schillemans, T. (2022). Toward a public administration theory of felt accountability. *Public Administration Review*, 82(1), 12-22.

Parnell, S. (2002). Democratising local government: The South African experiment. Juta and Company Ltd.

Reddy, P.S. (2016). The politics of service delivery in South Africa: The local government sphere in context. *TD: The Journal for Transdisciplinary Research in Southern Africa*, 12(1), 1-8.

Scoones, I. and Stirling, A. (2020). The politics of uncertainty: Challenges of transformation (p. 196). Taylor & Francis.

Sopykhanova, A., Maytanov, A., Kiseleva, A. and Zhamiyeva, R. (2023). Problems of legal regulation and state policy measures related to nature management in the framework of achieving the SDGs: Examples from Russia and Kazakhstan. *Sustainability*, 15(2), 1-22.

Sugiarti, E., Finatariani, E. and Rahman, Y.T. (2021). Earning cultural values as a strategic step to improve employee performance*. Scientific Journal of Reflection: Economic, Accounting, Management and Business,* 4(1), 221-230.

Suleiman, A.M. (2023). Exploring work environment management boundaries using work domain analysis. *Safety Science*, 157, 1-9.

Vogl, T.M., Seidelin, C., Ganesh, B. and Bright, J. (2020). Smart technology and the emergence of algorithmic bureaucracy: Artificial intelligence in UK local authorities. Public Administration Review, 80(6), 946-961. *Resource Development Quarterly*,7, 55-73.