

## PARADOXES IN *WUTHERING HEIGHTS* (1847) BY EMILY BRONTË: THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN HEREDITY, ENVIRONMENTS, NATURE, AND CULTURE IN THE FORMATION OF A CHARACTER'S IDENTITY

Aisyah Putri Tsani,<sup>1\*</sup> Abd. Hannan EF.,<sup>2</sup> Dian Nurrachman,<sup>3</sup> Agus Salim Mansyur,<sup>4</sup> Yuyun Nurul'aen<sup>5</sup>

<sup>1\*</sup>English Literature, UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia

<sup>2</sup>English Literature, UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia

<sup>3</sup>English Literature, UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia

<sup>4</sup>English Literature, UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia

<sup>5</sup>English Literature, UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia

\*Corresponding author: aisyah.putritsani@gmail.com

### ABSTRACT

This research re-examines or re-analyses the paradox in the novel *Wuthering Heights*, but focuses on the paradox contained in the identity of the characters based on the narrator's narration. The paradox is created by the contradiction of the place where the characters live, namely nature and culture, then heredity and environment. This research discusses how these contradictions can create and become a factor in the formation of paradox in the character's identity. This research also discusses what paradoxes are found in the character's identity which is an important element in the story of *Wuthering Heights*. The theory used in this research is Deconstruction proposed by Jacques Derrida as the main foundation in analyzing the object. The research design used in this research is literary criticism. The approach used is an objective approach, where the focus of analysis is entirely on the object of study. The primary data source of this research is the novel *Wuthering Heights* (1847) by Emily Brontë and secondary data obtained from other sources such as relevant journals, books, and media articles. This research shows that the opposition of nature and culture, then heredity and environment, has no dominant side. However, these oppositions influence each other and create complexity, thus creating various paradoxes in the character's identity.

**Keywords:** *Paradox, Character Identity, Wuthering Heights (1847)*

### Article History

Received: 17 July 2025

Revised : 26 August 2025

Accepted: 16 October 2025

Published :15 December 2025

How to cite (in APA style): Tsani, A. P, Abd. Hannan, E. F., Nurrachman, D., Mansyur, A. S., & Nurul'aen, Y. (2025). Paradoxes in *\*Wuthering Heights\** (1847) by Emily Brontë: The relationship between heredity, environments, nature, and culture in the formation of a character's identity. *CALL*, 7(2), 190-240

## INTRODUCTION

Literary work is a piece of writing can be based on the reality of life, either personal experience or environment experience (Nensilanti, 2023). Literary works often reflect the complexity of human nature, which is infinite

and difficult to understand. Complexity can be interpreted in Indonesian as "complex," meaning complexity (Koesoemadinata, 2012). Humans have an ever-changing nature that is never fixed and can be contradictory between one trait and another. Contradictions in human nature, also known as personality complexity, are one trait contradicting another. This complexity can be seen in certain conditions when humans are in a place or how they interact with different people.

In literary works, the complexity of human nature is usually depicted in the characterization of characters. The characters in a literary work cannot be defined simply as good and evil, as they are not stable from the beginning to the ending. There will be contradictions in their nature in certain moments of speech or behavior due to the influence of interactions between characters or their environment or culture. In the Oxford Advanced Dictionary, contradiction is described as "a lack of agreement between facts, opinions, actions, etc" (Hornby A. S., 2015). These contradictions are called paradoxes, which are statements or groups of statements that seem contradictory or incompatible with common sense but may be true or indicate a profound truth. Paradox in the division of language style is included in the contradiction language style (Kurniati, 2017). Paradoxes are an important element that reflects the complexity and ambiguity of meaning in a text. They are not only an aesthetic tool in a text but also serve to understand a text and create complexity of meaning. In literature, paradoxes often appear in the form of characters that exhibit contradictory traits or themes that explore the opposition between one concept and another that is opposite (Latief et al, 2025).

To analyse paradox in a literary work, Jacques Derrida's theory of deconstruction can be used. Jacques Derrida's Deconstruction Theory is a theory that opposes the stability of meaning. This theory states that the meaning contained in the text is plural and never stable. The meanings will overlap and have no centre, in other words, many. In this theory, what Derrida is looking for is not the meaning of the text itself, but its paradox. The paradox contained in a text is what will give birth to a plurality of meanings. Derrida shows how literary texts interfere into another and transgress disciplinary boundaries and offer multiple meanings (Shyamala, 2019, p. 52).

One example of paradox in literature is Emily Brontë's classic novel, *Wuthering Heights* (1847). *Wuthering Heights* is one of the most important and phenomenal literary works in the history of English Literature, combining romantic and dark elements. The plot is full of suffering, revenge, and various kinds of human nature, especially the dark nature and complexity of humans. The novel is difficult and complex in terms of narrative delivery, storyline, setting, and characterization of the characters. Emily Brontë successfully destroys the perception of human nature by portraying the characters as complex and difficult to understand. There is no one character who can be said to be good or bad, and the characters in *Wuthering Heights* successfully show that humans are indeed complex creatures with paradoxical traits in themselves.

*Wuthering Heights*, a novel by Emily Brontë, is a work that defies the stability of meaning in texts. The paradox in the novel can be analyzed using Derrida's deconstruction approach, which reveals that the text contains

internal oppositions and contradictions that produce a meaning that is not fixed. Within the framework of Derrida's deconstruction theory, *Wuthering Heights* can be seen as a freeplay that defies the stability of meaning. Deconstruction reveals how meaning is formed through *différance*, the process of delay and the constant play of signs, making meaning always in process and not fully present. The binary opposition between heredity, environment, nature, and culture in *Wuthering Heights* is challenged by deconstruction, showing that these oppositions are interdependent and create meaning through constant opposition. The identity of the characters in *Wuthering Heights* is never fixed or stable, but always in a state of flux or change. The opposition between heredity, environment, nature, and culture can be seen as an example of *différance*, where a character's identity is never fully stable or defined by one aspect alone. As Derrida in Nurrachman (2023, p. 233) says in his essay, "Structure, Sign, and Play in the Discourse of the Human Sciences" (1970), "The center is not center." Through deconstruction analysis, *Wuthering Heights* can be understood as a work that uses paradox as a theme and as a narrative structure and strategy. Paradox in the novel is not only a part of the story but also a way for the text to deconstruct itself, opening up space for infinite exploration of meaning.

## LITERATURE REVIEW

In *Wuthering Heights*, the paradox is formed by the existence of characters who are constantly at the intersection between heredity and environment then nature and culture. A paradox is a statement or group of statements that seem contradictory or incompatible with common sense, but may be true or indicate a profound truth. Paradox is an important element that reflects the complexity and ambiguity of meaning in a text. Paradox is a form of contradiction that looks contradictory but is full of meaning, making it necessary to dig deeper, not just from the words in the narrative, so that internal contradictions will be found in the narrative.

This is in line with Jacques Derrida's theory of deconstruction, which emphasizes the instability of meaning in texts. According to Derrida, texts always contain gaps of contradiction that destabilise the structure of meaning. To understand these paradoxes, Jacques Derrida's deconstruction theory has a relevant analytical framework. The paradox in this novel can be analysed using Derrida's deconstruction approach which shows that the text contains internal oppositions and contradictions that produce a meaning that is not fixed. Within the framework of Derrida's deconstruction theory, *Wuthering Heights* can be seen as a freeplay that defies the stability of meaning. Deconstruction reveals how meaning is formed through *différance*-the process of delay and the constant play of signs, so that meaning itself is always in process and not fully present. Deconstruction challenges the binary opposition, which in this novel is heredity and environment then nature and culture. Derrida shows that binary oppositions such as heredity and environment then nature and culture are never truly separate, but rather interdependent and create meaning through constant opposition. As he says in his essay, *Structure, Sign, and Play in the Discourse of the Human Sciences* (1970), "The center is not center." (Nurrachman, 2023, p. 233). The quote states

that there is no center of meaning in the text, which if it is related to the topic of this research then the identity of the characters in *Wuthering Heights* is never fixed or stable, but always in a state of flux or change.

The author conducted a literature review to obtain previous study related to this research. These previous studies come from scientific journals and theses that can contribute to this research, and this research has a connection, namely:

1. An article entitled "*I am Heathcliff!*" *Paradoxical Love in Brontë's Wuthering Heights* written by Nina Levin (2012) from Department of Literature and History of Ideas, Stockholm University. This article discusses the paradoxes found in the novel *Wuthering Heights* concerning to the love line. This article uses Theodor Wolpres' theory of theme, which has two considerations to define theme. Then Gerard Genette's theory of the aspects of narrative which has three aspects, namely story, narrative, and narrating.
2. An article entitled *Paradoxes Concerning the Love in Wuthering Heights* by Bao Xiaoli (2015) from Cross-Cultural Communication, Inner Mongolia University. This article discusses the paradox contained in the narrative delivery by the narrator, Nelly and Lockwood, where the narrator may be telling something that is not true because they do not really know what the main character is feeling. With the length of time and the indirectness of the situation, the story may not be entirely true. Then there is the paradox This article uses Gerard Genette's narrative theory about three levels of narration, namely extradiegetic, intradiegetic, and metadiegetic.
3. An article entitled *Coverture, Domestic Violence, and Mrs. Heathcliff's Narrative in Wuthering Heights* by Judith E. Pike (2009) from *Nineteenth-Century Literature*, University of California Press. This article discusses the important yet often overlooked role of Isabella Linton, later known as Isabella Heathcliff, in Emily Brontë's novel *Wuthering Heights*. Author Judith E. Pike argues that Isabella's character undergoes a profound transformation from a naïve girl to a victim of domestic violence, reflecting the grim reality of secret laws and marital abuse during the nineteenth century.

The research gap between the previous studies above and this research is the paradoxes contained in character identities formed as a result of conflict between nature, culture, heredity, and environment in the novel *Wuthering Heights* (1847). While the previous studies above discuss paradox in the love line and character development. This research is different because it does not only discuss paradoxes in love lines or narratives, or the development of character identities, but this research will discuss the paradoxes contained in character identities formed as a result of conflict between nature, culture, heredity, and environment. This research will use Jacques Derrida's deconstruction theory to uncover these paradoxes.

## METHOD

The research design used in this study is literary criticism. According to Wellek and Warren Literary criticism is a consideration of the quality of works accompanied by detailed and in-depth analyses, theoretical studies, and interpretations of a work (Nurrachman, 2023, p. 6). Literary criticism is considered or referred to as an effort to improve literary works and to uphold the social institutions of literary works. In this study, the researcher chose to use an objective approach because this approach allows the literary work to be treated as a whole and independent entity, regardless of external influences such as the author's background, social context, or historical conditions when the work was created. This approach focuses entirely on the intrinsic elements of the literary work, such as theme, plot, characters, setting, language style, and symbolism that build meaning internally.

The main data source of this research is a novel entitled *Wuthering Heights* (1847) republished in 2024, in the form of narrative text and dialogue from the novel. Then the second data comes from other sources such as journals, books, and the internet that contain or discuss paradox, identity, and deconstruction.

## FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

### ***The Character Identity Paradox in Wuthering Heights (1847) Formed by The Conflict between the Different Living Conditions in Wuthering Heights as a Symbolism of Nature and Thrushcross Grange as a Symbolism of Culture***

In Emily Brontë's *Wuthering Heights* (1847), the striking difference between *Wuthering Heights* and *Thrushcross Grange* serves not only as a narrative device but also has a deep symbolic meaning. *Wuthering Heights* as a symbolism of nature represents the wilderness with all the freedom, disorder, and emotional power that rules its inhabitants. In contrast, *Thrushcross Grange* as a symbolism of culture reflects culture, luxury, and social order that shapes the character of its inhabitants to be more refined and controlled in accordance with the customs and norms prevailing at that time. This conflict between nature and culture is not only reflected in the setting of the story, but also in the development of the main characters who experience a dilemma between following their natural desires or submitting to social norms as a result of the influence of where they grew up, namely in *Wuthering Heights* and *Thrushcross Grange*. This conflict is important in the novel because it forms the paradox of identity in them, where the desire for freedom and attachment to social rules clash.

#### Quotation 1: *Wuthering Heights* (Nature)

"*Wuthering Heights* is the name of Mr. Heathcliff's dwelling. 'Wuthering' being a significant provincial adjective, descriptive of the atmospheric tumult to which its station is exposed in stormy weather. Pure, bracing ventilation they must have up there at all times, indeed: one may guess the power of the north wind blowing over the edge, by the excessive slant of a few stunted firs at the end of the house; and by a range of gaunt thorns all stretching their limbs one way, as if craving

alms of the sun. Happily, the architect had foresight to build it strong: the narrow windows are deeply set in the wall, and the corners defended with large jutting stones.” (Brontë, 2024, p. 5).

Quotation 2: Thrushcross Grange (Culture)

“Cathy and I escaped from the washhouse to have a ramble at liberty, and getting a glimpse of the Grange lights, we thought we would just go and see whether the Lintons passed their Sunday evenings standing shivering in corners, while their father and mother sat eating and drinking, and singing and laughing, and burning their eyes out before the fire.” (Brontë, 2024, p. 42).

The first quote is Nelly Dean's dialogue with Mr. Lockwood. She explains how the building of Wuthering Heights looks like. It is mentioned that Wuthering Heights is still 'regional', the atmosphere is always strong winds that make trees and branches tilt in one direction. It is also mentioned that the sun rarely makes itself known to Wuthering Heights as if Wuthering Heights is throwing up its hands begging for the sun to show its mercy and shine on Wuthering Heights. Because of the environment and weather, the buildings of Wuthering Heights consist of many protruding stones and small windows. This adds to its gloominess where the walls are made up of unpainted stone and the small windows create a dark and gloomy atmosphere. These factors make Wuthering Heights a home away from warm civilization and culture. From the manifestation of the building and the natural atmosphere surrounding Wuthering Heights, it can be seen that Wuthering Heights is symbolic of nature. Wuthering Heights is described as a harsh house where strong winds often blow from an irregular weather. It depicts a wild and harsh nature, and the absence of order. The structure of the building, which only consists of stones and small windows, makes it a picture of the power of nature away from culture. With such a natural atmosphere and building structure, the inhabitants are far from warmth and order, making the inhabitants also become wild without any cultural rules.

The second quote explained about Thrushcross Grange. In Wuthering Heights, the Thrushcross Grange building is symbolic of a culture that is full of order, and warmth. The order and warmth are depicted in several aspects. They are reflected in the structure and atmosphere of the building, as well as in the behaviour of its inhabitants. The second above quote is Heathcliff questioning Nelly Dean about Thrushcross Grange. Heathcliff and Cathy escaped from their punishment because they wanted to go for a walk. It was then that they saw a glimpse of the light of life at Thrushcross Grange. That glimpse of life made Heathcliff question the difference between what he experienced in Wuthering Heights and what he thought was happening at Thrushcross Grange. Would the children at Thrushcross Grange have to experience standing in a corner every Sunday like him while their mums and dads sat, ate and drank, laughed and sang and sat in front of the fire to keep themselves warm.

With Heathcliff's fleeting vision through point of view of Nelly, there is a significant difference between Wuthering Heights and Thrushcross Grange.

Wuthering Heights with all its gloom and dark atmosphere, makes Heathcliff who only glimpses the light of life in Thrushcross Grange able to question the difference in life between himself and those who live in Thrushcross Grange. Heathcliff immediately imagines a life that is the opposite of his own. It can be seen that Wuthering Heights and Thrushcross Grange are binary opposition. As the symbolic of Nature and culture. In accordance with the definition of binary opposition itself, where binary opposition is opposing differences. According to Udiat (2024) Binary opposition refers to pairs where two terms are in opposite states, where humans have an understanding that is formed through the concepts of pairs of contrasting opposites.

Quotations 1: Wuthering Heights (Nature)

“He entered, vociferating oaths dreadful to hear; and caught me in the act of stowing his son away in the kitchen cupboard. Hareton was impressed with a wholesome terror of encountering either his wild beast’s fondness or his madman’s rage; for in one he ran a chance of being squeezed and kissed to death, and in the other of being flung into the fire, or dashed against the wall; and the poor thing remained perfectly quiet wherever I chose to put him.” (Brontë, 2024, p. 65).

“By heaven and hell, you’ve sworn between you to murder that child! I know how it is, now, that he is always out of my way. But, with the help of Satan, I shall make you swallow the carving knife, Nelly!!” (Brontë, 2024, p. 65).

Quotation 2: Thrushcross Grange (culture)

“I suppose: she was a young lady, and they made a distinction between her treatment and mine. Then the woman servant brought a basin of warm water, and washed her feet; and Mr. Linton mixed a tumbler of negus, and Isabella emptied a plateful of cakes into her lap, and Edgar stood gaping at a distance. Afterwards, they dried and combed her beautiful hair, and gave her a pair of enormous slippers, and wheeled her to the fire; and I left her, as merry as she could be, dividing her food between the little dog and Skulker, whose nose she pinched as he ate; and kindling a spark of spirit in the vacant blue eyes of the Lintons—a dim reflection from her own enchanting face.” (Brontë, 2024, p. 45).

The quotes of Wuthering Heights, both shows Hindley's bad behaviour to the residents of Wuthering Heights, especially to his son, Hareton Earnshaw. In the first quotation Hindley returns home with harsh words that frighten Hareton. Hindley's changing behaviour makes Hareton feel afraid of his own father. In the second quote, Hindley threatens to kill the inhabitants of Wuthering Heights, whoever it is. Because of this, Nelly always kept Hareton away from his father, afraid that Hindley would actually do what he said. The living environment of Wuthering Heights, especially Hindley's rude and capricious behaviour, has a great influence on the identity formation of its

residents. The influence seen in the quote is on Hareton. Hareton, who was originally a smart child, over time grew into a child who was afraid of his father and gawked more. Hareton becomes a stupid child because he is less able to grasp information. This makes a paradox in Hareton's character.

The next quote about Thrushcross Grange above is Heathcliff seeing the Linton family's treatment of Catherine when they found Catherine injured by their dog. They treated Catherine very well like a lady of honour. They washed Catherine's injured leg with warm water, made her a potion of spices, gave her cakes, gave her slippers, warmed her body, and even combed her hair.

There is a difference in how the parents treat the children of Wuthering Heights and Thrushcross Grange. In Thrushcross Grange, there is no punishment for not eating or standing in the corner. There is loving care, as it can be seen on the quotation about how they treated Catherine. It shows that Thrushcross Grange is a home that symbolises culture. There is no violence in it, of course, this forms a different personality from the children who live in Wuthering Heights. In Wuthering Heights, children treated badly. The example can be seen on two quotations above about how Hindley treat Hareton. Hindley likes to scare the residents of Wuthering Heights, especially Hareton with his behaviour. He always speaks harshly while shouting and he likes to threaten using his firearm. This shows that Thrushcross Grange and Wuthering Heights are binary from how those residents of two houses treated the children. Because binary refers to two terms that are paired in opposite (Udiat, 2024).

### ***The Character Identity Paradox Formed from the Conflict of Heredity and Environment in the Novel Wuthering Heights (1847)***

In *Wuthering Heights* (1847) by Emily Brontë, almost the entire narrative is told from the perspective of the narrator, Nelly Dean, to a landlord named Mr Lockwood. Therefore, the story in *Wuthering Heights* can be considered subjective as it is told from Nelly's perspective. Nelly who witnessed and lived in both places, Wuthering Heights and Thrushcross Grange, in her stories about the lives of the characters, she indirectly also mentions the complexity of the formation of the identity of the main characters and the next generation of them. In *Wuthering Heights*, the contradiction between Wuthering Heights as a symbolism of nature and Thrushcross Grange as a symbolism of culture, creates residents who live in the midst of these two contradictions experience identity paradox. The identity paradox occurs because they are excluded between their hereditary or environmental sides. Emily Brontë in this novel through the narration that she delivered through the narrator depicts the characterization of her characters not only shaped by their lineage, but also by the situation and social conditions in which they live.

### **Insecurity vs Confidence**

Insecurity versus confidence are identities that is form from a result of the conflict of heredity and environment of the characters. These identities



contradict each other, creating a paradox in the character's identity, which is based on the views and narratives of the narrator, Nelly Dean. This paradox in one of the main characters, Heathcliff. The conflict of environment where he grew up, made him have these identities. He became insecure also confident. These paradoxes are formed and conveyed through the perceptive and subjective narration of the narrator, Nelly Dean.

Quotation 1: Insecurity

"You needn't have touched me!" he answered, following her eye and snatching away his hand. "I shall be as dirty as I please: and I like to be dirty, and I will be dirty." (Brontë, 2024, p. 47).

Quotation 2: Confidence

"He hung about me for a while, and having screwed up his courage, exclaimed abruptly — "Nelly, make me decent, I'm going to be good." (Brontë, 2024, p. 49).

The first quote above is shown Heathcliff insecurities. The quote is a dialogue from Heathcliff himself through Nelly Dean's narration. It was when Heathcliff saw Catherine again after a few months of Catherine staying at Thrushcross Grange. According to Nelly Dean's narration, Catherine became a different person. She becomes a well-mannered girl. Her dress and hair were neatly arranged with pretty fingers. Heathcliff who is used to the environment of Wuthering Heights, when he finally comes into contact with a side of Thrushcross Grange he initially feels insecure about himself. He felt there was a difference in his friend. It shown in the quotation above. The contrasting difference was a result of the culture and environment that Catherine got from Thrushcross Grange which contrasted with Wuthering Heights. Thus, in Nelly Dean's narration, Heathcliff said that he wants to stay dirty and he likes to be dirty as much as he can while being angry.

But after a night of contemplation and a walk around the marsh and the church, Nelly said if Heathcliff changed his mind. He who was initially insecure about himself, suddenly asked Nelly Dean to make him look proper and presentable, shows that he started confident with himself. Based on Heathcliff's dialogue through Nelly narrations above, this shows the paradox in Heathcliff's identity. Insecurities with Confidence contradict each other that's why it's paradox, because paradox according to Smith and Lewis (2011) in Cunha (2019) paradoxes are elements that contradict each other. The change in Heathcliff was influenced by him being used to the wild Wuthering Heights, but suddenly seeing Catherine who came from Thrushcross Grange. He finally felt that he had to be worthy of Catherine so he asked Nelly to dress him up. He initially did not care about his appearance, but changed to want to look neat and good because he saw Catherine. This is influenced by two different environments, Wuthering Heights and Thrushcross Grange. This shows in Nelly Dean's narration if Heathcliff's identity is not fixed and is always changing as a result the environment he stayed, the rough and wild Wuthering Heights also the culture of Thrushcross Grange. As Derrida argues in Nurrachman (2023, p. 233) "There is no centre of a centre." Which means

that there is no definite meaning in a text. In this case, there is no definite identity in Heathcliff as a result of the influence of these aspects. In the narration of Nelly Dean, his identity changing. According to Heathcliff's dialogue in Nelly Dean's narrative above, his identity changes quickly from someone who feels insecure to someone who feels confident.

### **Wilderness vs Civilize**

Wilderness versus Civilize are identities that is form from a result of the conflict between heredity and environment's side of the character. This paradox found in one of the main characters, Catherine. These identities contradict each other, creating a paradox in Catherine's identity, which is based on the views and narratives of the narrator, Nelly Dean. She is the second child and only daughter of the Earnshaw couple. She grew up with the love given by her parents. With such a growing up environment in Wuthering Heights, Catherine's hereditary side is a free-spirited and wild girl. But as a teenager, she was influenced by Thrushcross Grange which was full of culture, civilisation and rules. This makes Catherine's side of the environment an Civilize woman. This makes Catherine's identity full of paradoxes. The conflict between heredity and environment's side of her, made her has these identities. These paradoxes are formed and conveyed through the perceptive and subjective narration of the narrator, Nelly Dean.

#### **Quotation 1: Wilderness**

"At fifteen she was the queen of the countryside; she had no peer; and she did turn out a haughty, headstrong creature! I own I did not like her, after infancy was past; and I vexed her frequently by trying to bring down her arrogance: she never took an aversion to me, though. She had a wondrous constancy to old attachments: even Heathcliff kept his hold on her affections unalterably;" (Brontë, 2024, p. 58).

#### **Quotation 2: Civilize**

"Catherine had kept up her acquaintance with the Lintons since her five- weeks' residence among them; and as she had no temptation to show her rough side in their company, and had the sense to be ashamed of being rude where she experienced such invariable courtesy, she imposed unwittingly on the old lady and gentleman by her ingenious cordiality; gained the admiration of Isabella, and the heart and soul of her brother: acquisitions that flattered her from the first —for she was full of ambition —and led her to adopt a double character without exactly intending to deceive anyone. In the place where she heard Heathcliff termed a "vulgar young ruffian," and "worse than a brute," she took care not to act like him; but at home she had small inclination to practise politeness that would only be laughed at, and restrain an unruly nature when it would bring her neither credit nor praise." (Brontë, 2024, p. 59).

The first quotation above is Nelly Dean's narration about Catherine's various kinds of wildness as a girl. In this quotation, Nelly Dean mentions that

Catherine is a country girl who grew up without peers, thus becoming a proud and stubborn person. Even so, she does not resent Nelly for trying to change her attitude. Catherine is still known as the prettiest girl in the village-the 'village belle'-and because of her status and beauty, her arrogance and stubbornness become more prominent as part of her wild nature.

The last quotation above are Nelly Dean's statements of Catherine became an civilize woman in front of The Lintons. The quote takes place after Catherine's five-week stay at Thrushcross Grange. Catherine became friendly with the The Lintons. Nelly Dean mentioned that Catherine, when she was at Thrushcross Grange, she would show her manners, innocence, and genuine hospitality to captivate Edgar Linton. She did this because she did not want to show her rude behaviour like in her home, Wuthering Heights. She also felt ashamed of being rude after seeing the politeness of the Linton family. When outside, she will not behave like Heathcliff for fear of being laughed at, but when in her own home her politeness is lost and she behaves carelessly which keeps her away from praise. This causes Catherine to have a split personality.

These quotes are Nelly Dean's narration of Catherine's changing identity. In the first quote Nelly describes Catherine's wildness as a girl where she is arrogant and stubborn. In the last two quotes, Nelly describes Catherine's behaviour as an civilize woman in front of The Lintons. Because of her five-week stay, Catherine was influenced by two conflicting environments, the wild and free nature of Wuthering Heights and the culture of Thrushcross Grange. This causes Catherine to alternately bring out her hereditary and environmental sides which causes her to have a split personality. When she is at home, she brings out her hereditary side. She is wild, careless, and there is no politeness in her. But when she is outside, especially at Thrushcross Grange, she shows the attitude like honorable woman she got as a result of Thrushcross Grange culture. She is innocent, friendly, and full of manners. This shows that in Nelly Dean's narration, Catherine's identities are paradox, where her behaviour inside the house and outside the house are opposite, wild and honorable. According to Smith and Lewis (2011) in Cunha (2019) paradoxes are elements that contradict each other, yet link together and persist over time. The paradox of identity in Catherine shows that Catherine's identity is never fixed. As said by Derrida, that a meaning is never fixed in accordance with the concept of free play. Where in free play there is no fixity or centre of meaning, because there will always be an absence that makes meaning temporary and constantly changing. This is what makes Derrida argue that language can never provide perfection of meaning and certainty of meaning, or perhaps none at all. That language is only understood as a sign of free play (Nurrachman, 2023, p. 231). In this context, Catherine's identity is never fixed. Her identity is temporary and always changing depending on where she is and who she is interacting with.

### **Brightness vs Darkness**

Brightness versus darkness are identities that is form from a result of the conflict between heredity and environment's side of the character. This paradox found in the next generation characters, Cathy, daughter of Catherine and Edgar Linton. Cathy born and grew up in Thrushcross Grange with full of

love and civilized, but when she teenager she needs to face wild and rude Wuthering Heights so she needs to adapt to the environment. These identities contradict each other, creating a paradox in Catherine's and Cathy identity, which is based on the views and narratives of the narrator, Nelly Dean. The conflict between heredity and environment's side of her, made her has these identities. These paradoxes are formed and conveyed through the perceptive and subjective narration of the narrator, Nelly Dean.

Quotation 1: Brightness

"My little mistress behaved like an angel in coming to wait on me, and cheer my solitude; the confinement brought me exceedingly low. It is wearisome, to a stirring active body: but few have slighter reasons for complaint than I had. The moment Catherine left Mr. Linton's room she appeared at my bedside. Her day was divided between us; no amusement usurped a minute: she neglected her meals, her studies, and her play; and she was the fondest nurse that ever watched. She must have had a warm heart, when she loved her father so, to give so much to me." (Brontë, 2024, p. 210).

Quotation 2: Darkness

"and she had precious little rest: one could guess by her white face and heavy eyes. She sometimes came into the kitchen all wildered like, and looked as if she would fain beg assistance;" (Brontë, 2024, p. 253).  
"You scandalous old hypocrite!" she replied. "Are you not afraid of being carried away bodily, whenever you mention the devil's name? I warn you to refrain from provoking me, or I'll ask your abduction as a special favour! Stop!" (Brontë, 2024, p. 14).

The first quotations above are Nelly Dean's narration that mention Cathy's bright side. In this quotation, Nelly Dean describes Cathy as someone who brings warmth and happiness to Thrushcross Grange. When Nelly is sick, Cathy takes care of her sincerely, even neglecting her meals, studies, and playtime to take care of Nelly and her father, Edgar. She is willing to sacrifice her fun to take care of the people she loves. All of this shows Cathy's sunny side-the warm and loving nature that is hereditary in the Linton family and the result of a loving environment.

The last two quotations above are Nelly Dean's narration that mention Cathy's dark side. The third quote is after Heathcliff finally managed to get Cathy married to Linton. Cathy is practically held captive in Wuthering Heights. She had been there for several weeks with Heathcliff's physical and verbal abuse and her husband's annoying behaviour and burden. Through Nelly Dean's narration, according to Zillah, a servant at Wuthering Heights, Cathy hardly had a break. Her face became pale with dull eyes. Sometimes she would come into the kitchen with a crumpled face and begging for help. The last quote above is Cathy's dialogue in Nelly Dean's narration. Cathy swearing at Joseph because he insulted her deceased mother. Cathy swears by calling Joseph a hypocritical old fart. She also said harsh words such as kidnapped by the devil and said she would kill Joseph if he continued his insults. The above

quote shows the existence of another identity in Cathy. She became a girl who was rude and swore easily.

The quotes above from Nelly Dean's narrative show the paradox in Cathy's identity. The first two quotes mention Cathy as a beautiful, gentle, loving and kind girl who brings light, showing the bright side of Cathy's identity. But in the last two quotes, Cathy becomes pale with a hopeless face and she becomes a rude girl who likes to swear, showing the dark side of Cathy. In these four quotations, Cathy's bright and dark sides of her identity contradict each other, creating a paradox in her identity. Bright side versus dark side of her are contradict each other, that is why her identity in Nelly Dean's narration is paradox because paradox is elements that contradict each other Cunha (2019). This shows that Cathy's identity is in flux. As Derrida states, "there is no centre of a centre" (Nurrachman, 2023, p. 233). Which means that there is no definite meaning in a text. In this case, there is no fixed identity for Cathy, but her identity changes, which creates a paradox. The paradox of Cathy's identity is due to her living in two different environments, the gentle and loving Thrushcross Grange and the wild and rough Wuthering Heights. Cathy's warm and gentle side is her hereditary side while living in Thrushcross Grange, and is contradicted by her rough side while living in Wuthering Heights, so this contradiction creates a paradox in her identity. This shows that there is no permanence to Cathy's identity. Her identity is always in flux.

## CONCLUSIONS

Based on the results of the analysis and discussion of the research in this thesis, conclusions can be drawn. In the storyline of *Wuthering Heights* (1847), paradox is not just a language style. Paradox acts as an instability of meaning. Paradoxes that appear in the analysis ultimately make the text of *Wuthering Heights* as a novel, unstable in meaning. The paradoxes that contribute to *Wuthering heights* are complex and they cannot represent a particular meaning. There are twelve paradox in this research. The paradoxes are patience versus physically harshness, emotional stability versus emotional instability, insecurity versus confidence, love versus revenge, love versus obsession, revenge versus willingness, wilderness versus honor, love versus wealth, brightness versus darkness, smart versus stupid, love versus loyalty, and innocence versus manipulatives.

The paradox in the novel *Wuthering Heights* formed by the contradictions that contained in the text. These contradictions are in the form of the place of life and environment of the characters, which is *Wuthering Heights* as a symbolism of nature and Thrushcross Grange which is a symbolism of culture. Both places make the characters bring out their hereditary and environmental sides alternately and sometimes erratically, which creates paradoxes in their identities as described in the previous chapter where there are twelve paradoxes in the characters' identities. Paradox becomes an important element that fills the foundation of the story because it is found in the character's identity. The paradox contained in the characters' identities is one of the factors that create conflicts in this novel. This is because the uncertainty that exists in their identity makes their

attitudes, words, and decision-making contradict each other and creating conflict. For example, in one of the paradoxes described in the previous chapter, namely love versus wealth, Catherine chooses to marry Edgar because of wealth, but she knows it is wrong because she loves Heathcliff, but she also realises that if she marries Heathcliff then she will be poor. The example of one paradox is the forerunner of the conflicts that arise in the continuation of the story. Likewise, the other eleven paradoxes are interrelated and contradictory, creating conflicts in the narrator's plot.

It can also be concluded that the paradox that is not singular, unstable, and complicated is because of the application of deconstruction used in this research. Through deconstruction, the reading of a text is no longer limited to one side only. However, things that were previously hidden in the structure of a text can be revealed through deconstruction. The binary opposition contained in *Wuthering Heights*, namely nature and culture, then heredity and environment, through deconstruction can be dismantled that the binary opposition has no side that is more dominant than the other. Deconstruction reveals that the binary opposition contained in *Wuthering Heights* is interrelated and influences each other, even creating paradoxes in the formation of the complexity of the character's identity contained in the narrator's narrative structure. As mentioned (Constantin, 2023) he mentioned that Derrida sees a text not only from one side, but open from various sides, without the origin of the text itself and how it ends up. So, through deconstruction, various sides in a text can be seen, for example the paradox in *Wuthering Heights*. Thus, This research can be used as a reference for researchers, especially English literature students, to analyse *Wuthering Heights* from a different perspective.

## REFERENCES

- Brontë, E. (2024). *Wuthering Heights*. United States: Standard Ebook.
- Constantin, N. (2023). Dekonstruksi, Makna dan Bahasa dalam Perspektif Jacques Derrida. *Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi Dan Media Sosial (JKOMDIS)*, Vol. 3 No. 3, 795-801. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.47233/jkomdis.v3i3.1315>
- Cunha, M. P. (2019). Paradox Theory and the Paradox of Success. *Strategic Organization*, Vol. 17 (1), 95-106.
- Feny Hariany et al, L. L. (2023). Analisis Pembentukan Identitas Diri Tokoh Utama dalam Novel Sesuk Karya Tere Liye Berhubungan dengan Faktor Perasaan dan Implikasi Pada Pembelajaran Sastra di SMA. *Bhinneka: Jurnal Bintang Pendidikan dan Bahasa*, Vol. 1, No. 4 , 313-321. doi: <https://doi.org/10.59024/bhinneka.v1i4.635>
- Hornby, A. S. (2015). *Oxford Advanced Dictionary*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Koesoemadinata, M. I. (2012). Kompleksitas Tokoh Pandita Drona dalam Artefak Wayang. *Jurnal Seni dan Budaya Pangung*, 339.
- Kurniati, A. (2017). Paradoks dan Implikasinya Dalam Humor Bertema Korupsi. *Suar Bétang*, Vol.12, No. 1, 39-47.
- Latief et al, A. (2025). The Role Of Paradox In Mary Shelley's *Frankenstein* Peran Paradoks Dalam *Frankenstein* Oleh Mary Shelley. *ARGOPURO Jurnal*

- Multidisiplin Ilmu Bahasa*, 6, 1-9.  
doi:<https://doi.org/10.6734/argopuro.v6i4.9802>
- Levin, N. (2012). "I am Heathcliff!" Paradoxical Love in Brontë's *Wuthering Heights*. *James Spens*. Retrieved from <https://www.divaportal.org/smash/record.jsf?pid=diva2%3A538526&dswid=970>
- MV, S. W. (2011). *Toward a theory of paradox: A dynamic equilibrium model of organizing*. Academy of Management Review.
- Nensilianti, H. P. (2023). Refleksi Sosial Dalam Novel Manusia & Badainya (Perjalanan Menuju Pulih) Karya Syahid Muhammad (Kajian Sosiologi Sastra Alan Swingewood). *LinguaFranca: Jurnal Bahasa, Sastra, dan Pengajarannya*, Vol.7No.2, 156-163.
- Nurgiyantoro, B. (2018). *Teori Pengkajian Fiksi*. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.
- Nurrachman, D. (2023). *Critical Theory: Teori - Teori Kritik Sastra dan Budaya Kontemporer*. Yogyakarta: Putra Surya Santosa.
- Nurrachman, D. (2023). *Pengantar Teori Kritik Sastra dari Yunani Kuno hingga Inggris Masa Victoria*. Bandung: Pustaka Aura Semesta.
- Pike, J. E. (2009). "My name was Isabella Linton": Coverture, Domestic Violence, and Mrs. Heathcliff's Narrative in *Wuthering Heights*. *Nineteenth-Century Literature*, 64, 347-383. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1525/ncl.2009.64.3.347>
- Shyamala, D. C. (2019). *Literary Criticism And Theory - Part II*. Malappuram: UNIVERSITY OF CALICUT.
- Storey, J. (2012). *Cultural Theory and Popular Culture An Introduction*. New York: Routledge.
- Udiat. (2024). Binary Opposition In "Hills Like White Elephants". : A short Story By Ernest Hemingway. :The Structural Analysis. *JELITA: Journal of English Language Teaching and Literature*, Volume 5, Number 2, 489-500.
- Xiaoli, B. (2015). Paradoxes Concerning the Love in *Wuthering Heights*. *Cross-Cultural Communication*, 11, 88-93. doi:10.3968/7076