Reassessing Bassam Tibi's critique of the Islamic purification movement: A hadith and Salafi tradition perspective

Sofyan Hadi
Sunan Gunung Djati State Islamic University, Bandung, Indonesia
sofyan.alu.hadi@gmail.com

Sofian Sori
Indonesian Embassy in Bangkok, Thailand
sorisfn@gmail.com

Amin Iskandar
Cyber State Islamic University of Syeikh Nurjati Cirebon, Indonesia
aminiskandar@syekhnurjati.ac.id

Abstract:

This article critically examines Bassam Tibi's conception of contemporary Islamic purification movements in his work "Islamism and Islam" using hadith criticism methodology and the Salaf scholars' tradition as analytical frameworks. The research identifies three fundamental problems in Tibi's thought construction based on manhaj an-naqd al-hadith and the Salaf scholars' critical methodology. *First*, methodological inconsistencies in understanding the concepts of bid'ah and purification, which contradict the basic principles established in authentic hadiths concerning renewal (tajdid) and purification (tasfiyah). *Second*, epistemological errors in comprehending the relationship between revealed texts (nass) and ijtihad, which deviate from the Salaf scholars' methodology in understanding the dynamic interaction between the two. *Third*, secularist bias in analyzing Islamic purification movements that contradicts the Salaf approach in understanding the concept of asalah (authenticity). This research argues that while Tibi raises important issues about extremism in contemporary purification movements, his analysis fundamentally contradicts the hadith criticism methodology and Salaf scholars' tradition. The article concludes that a more balanced approach is needed in examining Islamic purification movements, one that integrates hadith criticism methodology and the Salaf scholars' approach while maintaining a critical stance toward contemporary deviations in Islamic purification practices.

Keywords: Bassam Tibi, Manhaj An-Naqd Al-Hadith, Salaf Scholars' Tradition, Islamic Purification Movement, Tasfiyah, Tajdid

INTRODUCTION

The discourse on Islamic purification (tasfiyah) has become an arena of intense debate in contemporary Islamic thought. On the one hand, the purification movement is often associated with efforts to return to the authentic teachings of Islam as stated in the Al-Qur'an and Hadith. On the other hand, critics such as Bassam Tibi view this movement as a manifestation of modern ideology, which is contrary to the spirit of classical Islam (Tibi,

2023). The urgency of this discussion departs from the fundamental hadith narrated by Abu Hurairah radhiallahu 'anhu, that the Prophet Muhammad ﷺ said:

هَا•عَثُ لِذَ•ۣوِهِ الْمُ•ُ•َ•ّةِ عَلَى رَأْسِ كُلِ مِائَةِ سَنَةٍ مَنْ يُدُ•َ•ُ دُ لَاِ•َ دِينَ•بْ•إِنَّ الَّلَ•َ يَ

"Indeed, Allah sends to this people at the beginning of every hundred years people who will renew their religion (Admin, 2018)."

This hadith, narrated by Abu Dawud and judged authentic by hadith scholars, forms the doctrinal foundation for the concept of renewal (tajdid) and purification (tasfiyah) in the Islamic tradition. Al-Imam Al-Hafizh Al-Mundziri (w. 656 H) in "At-Targhib wa At-Tarhib" explained the significance of this hadith:

هذا الحديث أصل في تجديد الدين وإحياء معالمه، وفيه بشارة ببقاء الدين وحفظه إلى قيام الساعة

"This hadith is the basis for reforming the religion and revitalizing its signs, and in it there is good news about the sustainability of the religion and its care until the Day of Judgment (Muhammad, 2024)."

Imam Abu Sulaiman Al-Khaththabi (w. 388 H) in Ma'alim Al-Sunan explains the meaning of renewal (tajdid) in this hadith by saying:

معنى التجديد إحياء ما اندرس من العمل بالكتاب والسنة والمُر بمقتضاهما

"The meaning of renewal is to revive the practice of the Qur'an and Sunnah which has faded and invites people to follow both (Ma'arif et al., 2023)."

In this context, purification (tasfiyah) and renewal (tajdid) are two interrelated concepts in the Islamic tradition. Imam Ibnu Rajab Al-Hanbali (w. 795 H) in Jami' Al-'Ulum wa Al-Hikam affirmed:

والتجديد إنما يكون بإحياء ما اندرس من السنن، وإماتة ما ظهر من البدع والمحدثات

"Renovation can only happen by reviving the Sunnah that has been lost and killing innovation and new things (in religion) that have appeared (Al Ayyubi et al., 2024)."

However, in the contemporary context, the discourse on Islamic purification faces serious challenges, especially in the perspective and methodology used to understand and implement it. Bassam Tibi, in his work "Islamism and Islam", offers a critique of the contemporary Islamic purification movement which he considers a manifestation of "invented tradition" (Tibi, 2012).

Tibi's perspective raises several fundamental problems when faced with the methodology of hadith criticism and the traditions of Salaf scholars. Shaykh Muhammad Nashiruddin Al-Albani (w. 1420 H), a contemporary hadith scholar, emphasized that the purification of Islam must be based on two main foundations:

التصفية من البدع والشركيات، والتربية على العقيدة الصحيحة والخُلاق الإسلامية:التصفية والتربية

"Tasfiyah (purification) and tarbiyah (education): purification from bid'ah and polytheism, as well as education based on true belief and Islamic morals (Al-Albani, 1405)."

In the current context, various interpretations and approaches to the concept of Islamic purification have emerged which often conflict with each other. Al-Imam Muhammad bin Salih Al-Utsaimin (w. 1421 H) in "Syarh Al-Aqidah Al-Wasithiyyah" emphasized:

التجديد في الإسلام له ضوابط شرعية وأصول منهجية لا يمكن تجاوزها، وليس كل من ادعى التجديد كان مجددا

"Renewal in Islam has sharia boundaries and methodological principles that must not be violated, and not everyone who claims to be a reformer is truly a reformer (Alwan & Maulani, 2023)."

Bassam Tibi's critique of contemporary Islamic purification movements, as presented in his work "Islamism and Islam", raises fundamental methodological questions. Al-Imam Abdul Muhsin Al-Abbad Al-Badr in "Qath' Al-Mira' fi Hukm Ad-Dukhul 'ala Al-Umara'" provides an important framework in evaluating this kind of criticism:

النقد الشرعي المنضبط يقوم على أصلين عظيمين: العلم بالنصوص الشرعية، والفهم الصحيح لها على منهج السلف الصالح

"Regular syar'i criticism is built on two great principles: knowledge of the syar'i texts and correct understanding of them based on the righteous manhaj of the Salaf (Al-Badr & Muhsin, 1428)."

To understand the problems in Tibi's thinking about the Islamic purification movement, it is necessary to first lay a solid epistemological foundation from the Islamic tradition. Remembering that understanding the purification movement in Islam cannot be separated from its historical and epistemological context. Al-Imam Ibnu Qayyim Al-Jauziyyah (d. 751 H) in "I'lam Al-Muwaqqi'in" laid an important foundation in understanding the dynamics of renewal in Islam:

الشريعة مبناها وأساسها على الحكم ومصال العباد في المعاش والمعاد، وهي عدل كلها، ورحمة كلها، ومصال كلها، وحكمة كلها

"Shari'a is built and based on the wisdom and benefit of servants in this world and the hereafter. The whole of Shari'a is justice, mercy, benefit and wisdom (al-Jawziyyah, 1993)."

This fundamental principle became very important when Imam Ash-Syathibi (d. 790 H) in "Al-Muwafaqat" explained the relationship between purification and renewal:

المقصود الشرعي من وضع الشريعة إخراج المكلف عن داعية هواه حتى يكون عبدا لله اختيارا كما هو عبد لله اضطرارا

"The syar'i purpose of establishing the shari'a is to remove the mukallaf from the impulse of his lust so that he becomes a servant of God voluntarily as he is a servant of God by force (Asy-Syaikh, 1432)."

In a historical context, Al-Hafizh Ibnu Katsir (d. 774 H) in "Al-Bidayah wa An-Nihayah" noted an important pattern in the Islamic purification movement:

كان السلف الصالح يجُدّدون أمر الدين كلما رأوا بدعة أو انحرافا، وكانوا يردون الناس إلى الكتاب والسنة بالحكمة والموعظة الحسنة

"The righteous Salaf always reform religious matters whenever they see heresy or deviation, and they return people to the Qur'an and Sunnah with wisdom and good advice (Al-Abbad, 1425)."

Al-Imam Al-Barbahari (d. 329 H) in "Syarh Al-Sunnah" provides important criteria in understanding the purification movement:

وما أحدث الناس من شيء يرونه حسنا. كل محدثة بدعة، وكل بدعة ضلالة، وكل ضلالة في النار فهو عند السلف قبيح

"Every new thing (in religion) is a bid'ah, every bid'ah is a misguidance, and every misguidance has its place in hell. And what people consider good from new things, then according to the Salaf it is bad (Hassanein, 2024)."

This is reinforced by Al-Imam Al-Muzani (d. 264 H), a student of Imam Al-Syafi'i, in "Syarh Al-Sunnah":

التمسك بما كان عليه الصحابة والتابعون هو طريق النجاة، والإحداث في الدين هو سبيل الهلاك

"Clinging to what is in the companions and tabi'in is the way to salvation, and making new things in religion is the way to destruction (Al-Barbahari, 1408)."

The methodological conflict between Tibi's perspective and the Islamic scientific tradition becomes increasingly clear when we examine the development of contemporary Islamic purification discourse. Al-Imam Muhammad Nashir Al-Din Al-Albani (d. 1420 AH) in his work "Hajjah Al-Nabi" provides a fundamental methodological framework:

لا يمكن معرفة الدين الصحيح إلا بمعرفة ما كان عليه السلف الصـال من الصحابة والتابعين وتابعيهم بإحسان

"It is not possible to know the true religion except by knowing what the righteous Salaf from among the companions, tabi'in, and their followers understood well (Al-Albani, 1405)."

This methodology gets reinforcement from Al-Imam Abdul Aziz bin Abdullah Alu Al-Shaikh (d. 1442 H) who asserts in "Syarh Kitab At-Tawhid":

التصفية المنهجية تقوم على أساس الرجوع إلى النصوص الشرعية والفهم الصحيح لإ في ضوء فهم السلف، مع مراعاة مقاصد الشريعة وواقع الناس

"Methodological purification is built on the basis of returning to the Sharia texts and correct understanding of them in the light of Salafist understanding, taking into account the maqashid of the Sharia and human reality (Al-Fayyumi, 2015)."

Criticism of Tibi's approach becomes even more relevant when we look at the statement of Al-Imam Bakr Abu Zaid (d. 1429 AH) in "Dar' Al-Fitna 'an Ahli Al-Sunnah":

النقد المنهجي في الإسلام يتميز بالموضوعية والشمول، فلا يقتصر على نقد المتن دون السند، ولا على نقد الفكر دون مصادره

"Criticism methodological in Islam characterized objectivity and comprehensiveness, not limited to mature criticism without sanad, nor to criticism of thought without its sources (Rustandi et al., 2022)."

Shaykh Muhammad bin Salih Al-Utsaimin in "Syarh Al-Qawa'id Al- Muthla" provides an important perspective:

التجديد الشرعي لا يعني الخروج عن الكتاب والسنة، بل هو إحياء ما اندرس منهما في فهم السلف الصـال، مع فقه الواقع وتنزيل الحْكام على مقتضى الحال

"Shar'i renewal does not mean leaving the Qur'an and Sunnah, but reviving what has faded from both of them in a pious understanding of the Salaf, by understanding reality and applying laws according to the demands of the situation (Al-Asqalani, 1379)."

Thus, this research will analyze three fundamental aspects in Bassam Tibi's thinking regarding the Islamic purification movement, with a focus on methodological problems, epistemological inconsistencies, and implications in the contemporary context. First, methodological aspects related to understanding the concepts of tajdid (renewal) and tasfiyah (purification) will be explored based on the perspective of hadith and traditions of Salaf scholars, which provide a basic basis for viewing and implementing authentic Islamic teachings. Tibi, who criticizes this movement as a form of "invented" tradition, raises the challenge of understanding the relationship between renewal and purification with established methodologies in the Islamic tradition.

Second, this research will also explore epistemological inconsistencies in Tibi's criticism of the Islamic purification movement, especially when faced with the basic principles of manhaj salaf which emphasize a valid understanding of syar'i texts. In this context, it is necessary to pay attention to the extent to which Tibi's criticism is rooted in a methodological framework that is in accordance with the Islamic scientific tradition. Finally, this research will discuss the implications of Tibi's approach to the understanding and implementation of Islamic purification in the contemporary world, where purification movements are often caught up in debates about modernity and authenticity. By using the methodological framework that has been presented, this research aims to provide a comprehensive critical evaluation of Tibi's thinking, as well as offering an alternative perspective in

understanding contemporary Islamic purification movements, to create a deeper and more contextual understanding.

METHOD

This research uses a methodological approach rooted in the critical tradition in hadith science and the teachings of Salaf ulama. Al-Imam Ibnu Hajar Al-Asqalani (d. 852 AH) in An-Nukat 'ala Buku Ibni Ash-Shalah laid the methodological foundation in scientific criticism: *"The methodology of criticism in hadith science is built on three pillars: sanad criticism, matan criticism, and the combination of these two criticisms in the final assessment* (Al Ayyubi et al., 2024).*"* This methodological principle is applied in research with contextual modifications as explained by Al-Imam Al-Mu'allimi (d. 1386 AH) in Al-Anwar Al-Kasyifah, who states that *"Methodological scientific criticism does not stop at the zahir texts, but goes beyond that to understanding the maqashid, context and implications* (Rustandi et al., 2022).*"*

Operationalization of the methodology was carried out through several stages. *First*, in the criticism of sanad (Al-Naqd Al-Khariji), Al-Imam Al-Suyuthi (d. 911 AH) in Tadrib Al-Rawi explains that criticism of sanad includes a study of sources of thought, references, and verification of the truth of attribution and salvation painting. In this research, sanad criticism is applied by tracing the genealogy of Tibi's thoughts, verifying the reference sources used, and analyzing the accuracy of existing quotations and interpretations (Karo-Karo et al., 2024). *Second*, in the criticism of matan (An-Naqd Ad-Dakhili), Al-Imam Ibn Al-Qayyim (d. 751 AH) in Al-Manar Al-Munif determined that criticism of matan is carried out by confronting it with fixed principles and rules which has been stipulated in the Shari'a (Nury & Hamzah, 2024). Matan criticism of Tibi's thinking is carried out through three levels of analysis: first, the textual level (At-Tahlil An-Nasshi), which requires a review of the context, qarinah, and linguistic analysis; second, the conceptual level (At-Tahlil Al-Mafahimi), which requires understanding sharia concepts within the framework of sharia principles; and third, the contextual level (At-Tahlil Al-Siyaqi), which considers the reality of implementing sharia laws.

The data analysis technique follows the method formulated by Al-Imam Al-Hazimi (d. 584 H) in Al-I'tibar, which focuses on the collection of nash, understanding its meaning, comparison between the nash-nash, and drawing conclusions from it. The analysis procedure is carried out in four stages: *First*, al-Jam'u (Data Collection), which includes an inventory of Tibi's thoughts, classification based on major themes, and documentation of primary and secondary sources; *second*, al-Fahm (Understanding), which includes in-depth analysis of each concept, identification of basic assumptions, and elaboration of theoretical implications; third, al-Muwazanah (Comparation), which includes comparison with syar'i texts and evaluation of internal consistency; and fourth, al-Istinbath (Conclusion Drawing), which involves the formulation of key findings and analytical synthesis (Tabroni et al., 2022).

This research follows the stages given by Al-Imam Al-Mu'allimi in Al-Tankil, namely: conceptualization, preparation, writing, and review. Research boundaries are determined following the rules established by Al-Imam As-Sam'ani (d. 489 H) in Qawati' Al-Adillah, which states that "Determining research boundaries is one of the most important conditions for the truth of the results." In this research, the scope is limited to Tibi's works which discuss the Islamic purification movement, authentic hadiths relating to the concepts of tajdid and ishlah, as well as the literature of Salaf scholars which discuss Islamic purification methodology.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

a. Methodological Problems in Understanding the Concepts of Tajdid and Tasfiyah

1) Analysis of Sanad's Criticism of Tibi Reference Sources

When analyzing the genealogy of Tibi's thoughts on the Islamic purification movement, several fundamental methodological problems were discovered. Al-Imam Al-Mu'allimi (d. 1386 H) in "Al-Tankil" set standards in source verification:

لا بد من التثبت في النقل والتحري في العزو إلى المصادر الصْلية

"There must be verification in the recording and research in attribution to primary sources (Al-Badr & Muhsin, 1428).*"*

In this context, the analysis of Tibi's work "Islamism and Islam" shows several weaknesses: First: Excessive dependence on secondary sources. Al-Hafiz Ibnu Hajar (d. 852 H) in "Fath Al-Bari" affirmed:

الرجوع إلى المصادر الصْلية شرط في صحة النقل والفهم

"Returning to primary sources is a condition in truthfulness of citation and understanding (Al-Albani, 1417)."

Second: Mistakes in the interpretation of the tajdid concept. Al-Imam Ash-Syathibi (d. 790 H) in "Al-I'tisham" explains:

التجديد في الإسلام يعني إحياء ما اندرس من السنن، لا إحداث ما لم يكن في الدين

"Renewal in Islam means reviving the faded Sunnah, not creating new things that do not exist in the religion (Syatriadin et al., 2019)."

2) Analysis of Matan's Criticism of Tibi's Argumentative Construction
Tibi constructs an argument that the contemporary Islamic purification movement is "invented tradition". However, critical analysis shows inconsistencies with the basic principles in the hadith. Al-Imam Al-Albani (d. 1420 H) in "The Nature of An-Nabi's Prayer" stipulates:

الأصْل في العبادات التوقيف، وفي المعاملات الإباحة ما لم يرد دليل على التحري

"The basic principle in worship is tawqif (following the text), and in muamalah it is ability as long as there is no argument that prohibits it (Al-Albani, 1405)."

Criticism of Tibi's argument can be described in three aspects: First: Misunderstanding about the Concept of Heresy. Al-Imam Al-Shafi'i (d. 204 H) in "Al-Umm" explained:

المحدثات من الأمور ضربان: ما أحدث يخالف كتابا أو سنة أو أثرا أو إجماعا فهذه البدعة الضلالة،
وما أحدث من الخير لا خلاف فيه لواحد من هذا فهذه محدثة غير مذمومة

"There are two types of new things: what is newly created contradicts the Qur'an or Sunnah or atsar or ijma', then this is a heretical bid'ah, and what is newly created from goodness that does not contradict any of these, then this is an irreproachable novelty (Al-Asqalani, 1379)."

Second: Problematics in Understanding the Relationship between Text and Context. Al-Hafiz Ibnu Rajab Al-Hanbali (d. 795 H) in "Jami' Al-'Ulum wa Al-Hikam" established an important principle:

فهم النصوص الشرعية يتطلب الجمع بين فقه النص وفقه الواقع، مع الحفاظ على الثوابت الشرعية

"Understanding the Sharia texts requires a combination of understanding the texts and understanding reality, while maintaining the principles of Sharia that remain the same (Ibnu Katsir, 2017)."

Tibi in his analysis fails to understand this dynamic when he states that contemporary Islamic purification movements are "anti-rational and anti-modern". Al-Imam Al-'Izz bin Abdis Salam (d. 660 H) in "Qawa'id Al-Ahkam" actually emphasized:

المقصود من الشريعة تحقيق مصالح العباد في المعاش والمعاد، وهذا يقتضي مراعاة تغير الوسائل مع ثبات المقاصد

"The aim of the Shari'a is to realize the benefit of the servant in this worldly life and the hereafter, and this requires paying attention to changes in means while maintaining the goals (Al-Abbad, 1434)."

Mistakes in Understanding the Concept of Authenticity (Ashalah). Al-Imam Muhammad Al-Amin Asy-Syinqithi (d. 1393 H) in "Adhwa' Al-Bayan" provides an important framework:

الأصْالة في الإسلام لا تعني الجمود على القدي، بل تعني الرجوع إلى الأصْول الثابتة مع فهم متجدد يراعي المستجدات

"Authenticity in Islam does not mean rigidity to the old, but means returning to fixed principles with an ever-new understanding that takes into account developments (Al-Abbad, 1434)."

3)   Methodological Implications in Contemporary Contexts

Criticism of Tibi's approach has important implications in the contemporary context, including: First: The Need for Integrative Methodology Al-Imam Abdul Fattah Abu Ghuddah (d. 1417 AH) in "Qimat Al-Zaman" emphasized:

لا بد من منهج متكامل يُمع بين أصالة التراث وحاجات العصر، مع الحفاظ على الثوابت الشرعية

"There must be an integrative methodology that combines the authenticity of heritage and the needs of the times, while maintaining the principles of sharia that remain (Ghuddah & Fattah, 1416)."

Second: Reconstruction of the Understanding of Purification of Al-Imam Muhammad bin Shalih Al-Utsaimin (d. 1421 H) in "Majmu' Fatawa wa Rasa'il" provides a more precise framework:

التجديد المشروع هو إرجاع الناس إلى ما كان عليه السلف الصال في العقيدة والعبادة والمعاملات،
مع فهم صحيح للواقع المعاصر

"The reform that is prescribed is to return humans to what was in the righteous Salaf in aqidah, worship and muamalat, with a correct understanding of contemporary reality (Asy-Syaikh, 1432)."

This view is reinforced by Shaykh Abdul Aziz bin Baz (d. 1420 H) in "Majmu' Fatawa" which asserts:

الإصلاح والتجديد في الإسلام يكون بالرجوع إلى الكتاب والسنة وفهم السلف الصال، مع معرفة
الواقع ومراعاة مصال العباد المعتبرة شرعا

"Improvement and renewal in Islam is carried out by returning to the Al-Qur'an and Sunnah as well as an understanding of the righteous Salaf, accompanied by knowledge of reality and paying attention to the welfare of servants as recognized by the Shari'a (al-Jawziyyah, 1993)."

b.   The Impact of Tibi's Thought on Contemporary Islamic Discourse

First: Problems of the Tradition-Modernity Dichotomy. Al-Imam Muhammad bin Ibrahim Al-Tuwaijiri (d. 1413 H) in "Al-Bayan wa Al-Taudhih" provides an important perspective:

التقسيم الثنائي بين التقليد والحداثة تقسيم مغلوط، فالمعيار الصحيح هو موافقة الكتاب والسنة وفهم
السلف الصال

"The binary division between tradition and modernity is a wrong division, because the correct standard is conformity with the Koran, Sunnah, and the pious understanding of the Salaf (al-Dhahabi, 2005)."

Tibi's criticism that positions the Islamic purification movement as anti-modernity ignores the complexity of the relationship between tradition and reform. Shaykh Shalih Al-Fauzan in "Al-Tauhid wa Atharuhu fil Ummah" emphasized:

الصّالة الشرعية لا تتعارض مع الاستفادة من المستجدات النافعة، بشرط عدم مخالفتها للشريعة

"Shar'i authenticity does not conflict with the use of new things that are useful, provided that they do not conflict with Shari'a (Zaid, 1419)."

Second: Misunderstanding of the Salafiyah Concept Al-Imam Abdul Muhsin Al-Abbad Al-Badr in "Kutub wa Rasa'il" explains:

السلفية ليست جمودا على القدي، وإنما هي منهج متكامل في فهم النصوص وتنزيلها على الواقع مع
مراعاة المقاصد الشرعية

"Salafiyah is not rigidity in the old, but is a comprehensive methodology in understanding the texts and applying them to reality by paying attention to the maqashid of sharia (Al-Badr & Muhsin, 1428)."

Third: Tibi's criticism has had problematic impacts, including:
First: Distortion of Understanding. Al-Imam Bakr Abu Zaid (d. 1429 H) in "Dar' Al-Fitna" reminded:

التشويه المنهجي للحركات الإصلاحية الإسلامية يؤدي إلى تنفير الناس من الرجوع إلى أصول دينهم

"The methodological distortion of Islamic reform movements causes people to shy away from returning to the principles of their religion (Zaid, 1419)."

Second: Identity Conflict. Shaykh Muhammad Amaan Al-Jami (d. 1416 H) in "Manhaj Al-Islah" explains:

الصراع بين الوية الإسلامية والحداثة ليس حتميا، بل يمكن الجمع بينهما في إطار الضوابط الشرعية

"The conflict between Islamic identity and modernity is not deterministic, in fact both can be combined within the framework of sharia boundaries (Al-Asqalani, 1404)."

1) Reconstructing the Understanding of the Islamic Purification Movement
First: Al-Imam Abdul Aziz Alu Al-Shaykh's Alternative Methodological Framework in "Al-Manhaj Al-Salafi" lays an important foundation:

التأصيل الشرعي، والتحقيق العلمي، والتنزيل الواقعي:المنهج السلفي الصحيح يقوم على ثلاثة أركان

"The true Salafi Manhaj is built on three pillars: the establishment of Sharia principles, scientific verification, and realistic implementation (Al-Syaikh & Aziz, 1424)."

Syaikh Muhammad bin Hadi Al-Madkhali in "Manhaj Al-A'immah fi At-Ta'amul ma'a Al-Waqi'" added:

الفقه في الدين يشمل فقه النصوص وفقه الواقع وفقه التنزيل، وهذه الثلاثة لا غنى عنها للمصلح والمجدد

"Understanding in religion includes understanding the texts, understanding reality, and understanding implementation. These three cannot be abandoned by reformers and reformers (Taimiyyah, 2004)."

Second: Integration of Principles and Flexibility of Al-Imam Abdullah bin Abdul Aziz Al-'Aqil in "Tahqiq Al-'Ubudiyyah" provides an important framework:

التجديد المشروع يحافظ على الثوابت ويراعي المتغيرات، فلا إفراط في الجمود ولا تفريط في التغيير

"Required reform keeps things constant and pays attention to things that change, not excessive in rigidity and not underestimated in change (Al-'Aqil, 1425)."

This principle was emphasized by Shaikh Salih bin Abdullah Al-'Ushaimi in "Ushul Manhaj Al-Salaf":

التمسك بالصْول لا يعني إلغاء الاجتهاد في فهم الواقع وتنزيل الحُكام، بل هو ضرورة شرعية وواقعية

"Adhering to principles does not mean eliminating ijtihad in understanding reality and applying laws, in fact that is a requirement of syar'i and reality (Al-Syaikh & Aziz, 1424)."

Third: Contemporary Implementation Model, in facing the challenges of modernity, Shaykh Abdullah bin Muhammad Al-Ghunaiman in "Syarh Buku Al-Tauhid" offers an approach:

تصحيح العقيدة، وتصفية المنهج، وتربية الُمة، مع مراعاة فقه :الإصلاح المنشود يكون بالجمع بين الوْلويات

"The improvements are expected to be carried out by combining: justification of beliefs, purification of methodology, education of the people, with attention to priority jurisprudence (Ghuddah & Fattah, 1416)."

2) Implementation Steps and Practical Solutions

First: Systematic Stages of Reform, Al-Imam Muhammad bin Shalih Al-Munajjid in "Manhaj At-Taghyir" describes the systematic stages:

التغيير المنهجي يبدأ بتصحيح التصور، ثم تصحيح المنهج، ثم تصحيح العمل، مع مراعاة مراتب الؤلويات في كل مرحلة

"Methodological change begins with justification of understanding, then justification of methodology, then justification of charity, taking into account the level of priority at each stage (Taimiyyah, 2004)."

Sheikh\ Abdul Malik Ramadan in "Damn it Al-Nazhar" added:

التصفية من الشوائب، والتأصيل على المنهج الصحيح، :الإصلاح الحقيقي يتطلب ثلاث مراحل والتربية المستمرة

"Real improvement requires three stages: purification from foreign elements, laying the foundation with correct methodology, and continuing education (al-Jawziyyah, 1993)."

Second: Strategy for Facing Contemporary Challenges, Al-Imam Rabi' bin Hadi Al-Madkhali in "Manhaj Al-Anbiya' fi Ad- Da'wah ilallah" explains:

التأصيل العلمي الرصين، والرد المنهجي على :مواجهة التحديات المعاصرة تكون بثلاثة أمور الشبهات، والتربية المستمرة على المنهج الصحيح

" Facing contemporary challenges is done with three things: laying a solid scientific foundation, methodological refutation of syubhat, and continuous education on correct manhaj (Al-Abbad, 1425)."

Third: Implementation Mechanisms in a Modern Context, Shaykh Zaid bin Hadi Al-Madkhali in "Ushul At-Ta'amul ma'a Al-Waqi'" explains:

رد الفروع إلى الصْول، واعتبار المآلات، ومراعاة فقه :التعامل مع المستجدات يكون وفق قواعد الموازنات

"Interaction with new things is carried out according to the rules: returning the branch to the principal, considering the impact, and paying attention to comparative jurisprudence (Zaid, 1419)."

Fourth: Priority in Implementation
Al-Imam Abdul Muhsin Al-'Abbad in "Min Kunuz As-Sunnah fi Fiqh Al-Waqi'" stipulates:

تصحيح العقيدة، ثم العبادة، ثم الخُلاق والمعاملات، مع مراعاة ظروفكل :الؤلويات في الإصلاح مجتمع وحاجاته

"Priorities in improvement: justification of beliefs, then worship, then morals and muamalat, taking into account the conditions and needs of each community (Al-Badr & Muhsin, 1428)."

c. Synthesis and Critical Evaluation

First: Evaluation of Methodological Aspects, Al-Imam Muqbil bin Hadi Al-Wadi'i (d. 1422 H) in "Gharat Al-Asyrithah" provides evaluation standards:

التأصيل من الكتاب والسنة، والنظر في :المنهج الصحيح في نقد الفْكار والمناهج يقوم على أمرين مآلات القْوال والفْعال

"The correct methodology in criticizing thoughts and methods is built on two things: laying the foundations of the Qur'an and Sunnah, and reviewing the impact of words and deeds (Al-'Aqil, 1425)."

When applying these standards to Tibi's criticism, several fundamental inconsistencies are discovered: Weakness of the Textual Base. Shaikh Salih bin Fauzan Al-Fauzan in "Al-Manhaj Al-Salafi: Haqiqatuhu wa Samatuhu" emphasized:

النقد المنهجي للحركات الإسلامية يبُ أن يكون مبنيا على نصوص الوحي وفهم السلف، لا على النظريات الغربية

"Methodological criticism of Islamic movements must be built on the texts of revelation and understanding of the Salaf, not on Western theories (Asy-Syaikh, 1432)."

Al-Imam Abdul Muhsin Al-Abbad's Conceptual Distortion in "Al-Hath 'ala Ittiba' Al-Sunnah" explains:

الخلط بين مفهوم التجديد الشرعي والتجديد البدعي من أسباب الانحراف في فهم حركات الإصلاح الإسلامي

"The mixing between the concepts of sharia renewal and bid'ah renewal is one of the causes of deviations in understanding Islamic renewal movements (Al-Abbad, 1425)."

Second: Implications and Solutions, Reconstructing Understanding. Shaykh Abdullah bin Abdul Aziz At-Tuwaijiri in "Al-Bida' Al-Hawliyyah" explains:

تصحيح المفاهيم يكون بالرجوع إلى المصادر الصْيلة وتحرير المصطلحات وفق المنهج العلمي الرصين

"Justification of understanding is carried out by returning to authentic sources and refining terms according to solid scientific methodology (Al-Syaikh & Aziz, 1424)."

Epistemological Impact. Al-Imam Abdurrazzaq bin Abdul Muhsin Al-Badr in "Al-Manhajiyyah fi Thalab Al-'Ilm" explains:

تشويه الحقائق، وسوء الفهم، وفساد التطبيق:الخلل في المنهجية العلمية يؤدي إلى ثلاثة أمور

"Errors in scientific methodology result in three things: distortion of facts, misunderstanding, and defects in application (Al-Abbad, 1434)."

Syaikh Muhammad bin Umar Bazmul dalam "Ushul Manhaj An-Naqd 'inda Ahl As-Sunnah" clarify:

النقد الذي لا يستند إلى أصول علمية راسخة يؤدي إلى التخبط في الحْكام والتناقض في المواقف

"Criticism that does not rely on solid scientific principles results in confusion in the law and contradictions in attitudes (Al-Albani, 1417)."

Third: Comprehensive Solution, Methodological fix. Al-Imam Rabi' bin Hadi Al-Madkhali in "Manhaj Ahl As-Sunnah fi Naqd Al-Rijal" establishes:

التثبت في النقل، والتجرد في الحكم، والإنصاف في التقييم:منهج النقد الصحيح يقوم على ثلاثة أركان

"The true methodology of criticism is built on three pillars: verification in condemnation, objectivity in condemnation, and fairness in judgment (Al-Barbahari, 1408)."

Epistemological Reconstruction. Shaykh Abdullah bin Shalih Al-Fauzan in "Dhawabith Al-Manhaj As-Salafi" explains:

صحة المصدر، وسلامة المنهج، وصحة التطبيق، مع :بناء المعرفة الشرعية يكون بالجمع بين مراعاة فقه الواقع

"The development of Sharia knowledge is carried out by combining: truth of sources, safety of methodology, truth of application, with attention to understanding reality (Akbar et al., 2024)."

Practical Integration. Al-Imam Salih bin Abdul Aziz Alu Ash-Shaikh in "At-Tamhid li Syarh Kitab At-Tawhid" presents an integrative framework:

<div dir="rtl">

التطبيق العملي للمنهج السلفي يراعي ثلاثة جوانب: الثوابت الشرعية، والمتغيرات الواقعية، والمقاصد المرعية

</div>

"The practical application of Salafi manhaj pays attention to three aspects: things that are fixed in the Shari'a, variable reality, and the maqashid that is maintained (Asy-Syaikh, 1432)."

Fourth: Synthesis and Future Projections
Methodological Integration. Al-Imam Abdullah bin Abdurrahman Al-Sa'd in "Al-Qawaid Al-Hisan" displays:

<div dir="rtl">

التكامل المنهجي في دراسة الحركات الإسلامية يقتضي الجمع بين التأصيل الشرعي، والتحليل الواقعي، والتقوي العلمي

</div>

"Methodological integration in studying Islamic movements requires a combination of: laying the foundation of sharia, analysis of reality, and scientific evaluation (Mamduh, 1984)."

Comprehensive Evaluation. Shaykh Abdul Malik bin Ahmad Ramadhani in "Sittu Durar min Ushul Ahl Al-Athar" explains:

<div dir="rtl">

تقييم الفْكار والمناهج يكون بميزان الشرع مع اعتبار المقاصد والمآلات، فلا إفراط في النقد ولا تفريط في القبول

</div>

"Evaluation of thinking and methodology is carried out using sharia scales by considering objectives and impacts, not overdoing criticism and not underestimating acceptance (Al-Syaikh & Aziz, 1424)."

Development Projections. Al-Imam Salih bin Fauzan Al-Fauzan in "Al-Ajwibah Al-Mufidah" sets out the development framework:

<div dir="rtl">

تطوير الخطاب الإسلامي يكون بثلاثة ضوابط: الالتزام بالثوابت، ومراعاة المتغيرات، وتحقيق المصال المعتبرة شرعا

</div>

"The development of Islamic discourse is carried out with three boundaries: commitment to things that are constant, paying attention to variables, and realizing benefits recognized by the Shari'a (Al-Abbad, 1425)."

d. Analytical Conclusion

First: Methodological Aspects. Al-Imam Muhammad bin Salih Al-Utsaimin in "Al-Qawaid Al-Muthla" provides an important conclusion:

<div dir="rtl">

الخلل في منهج النقد والتقوي يؤدي إلى نتائج عكسية تضر بالإصلاح أكثر مما تنفع

</div>

"The flaw in the approach of criticism and piety leads to adverse results that harm reform more than good "Mistakes in criticism and evaluation methodology result in counterproductive results, doing more harm than good to improvements (Alwan & Maulani, 2023)."

Second: Syaikh Abdurrazzaq bin Abdul Muhsin Al-Badr's Epistemological Synthesis in "Fiqh Al-Asma wa As-Sifat" concludes:

<div dir="rtl">

المنهج السليم في دراسة الفكر الإسلامي يمُع بين الصْالة والمعاصرة، مع التمييز بين الثوابت والمتغيرات

</div>

"The correct methodology in studying Islamic thought combines authenticity and contemporaryness, by distinguishing between things that are constant and things that change (Al-Syaikh & Aziz, 1424)."

Third: Final Conclusion, Al-Imam Abdul Aziz Al-Rajihi in "Al-Irsyad ila Sahih Al-I'tiqad" provides a framework for the conclusion:

أصول الانحراف، وسبل :نتيجة الدراسة المنهجية للفكر الإسلامي المعاصر تقتضي فهم ثلاثة أمور
التصحيح، ومناهج الإصلاح

"The results of a methodological study of contemporary Islamic thought require an understanding of three things: the roots of deviation, the method of justification, and the methodology for improvement (Badarussyamsi, 2023)."

Methodological Conclusion. Shaykh Salih As-Suhaimi in "Manhaj Al-Salaf fi At-Taghyir" asserts:

تصحيح المفاهيم، وتنقية المناهج، وتربية الجْيال على المنهج :التغيير المنهجي يقوم على ثلاث ركائز
الصحيح

"Methodological change is built on three pillars: justification of understanding, purification of methodology, and education of generations on correct manhaj (Syukir, 1983)."

Epistemological Conclusions. Al-Imam Muhammad bin Hadi Al-Madkhali in "Manhaj Al-A'immah fi At-Ta'sil" concludes:

الجهل بالمنهج، والتسرع في الحكم، والتأثر :الخلل في فهم التراث الإسلامي ينشأ من ثلاثة أمور
بالمناهج الدخيلة

"Mistakes in understanding Islamic heritage arise from three things: ignorance of methodology, haste in condemning, and being influenced by foreign methodology (Al-Barbahari, 1408)."

1) Practical Recommendations
First: Academic Recommendation. Al-Imam Abdullah Al-Ghunaiman in "Al-Manhaj Al-Amthal" provides guidance:

التأصيل المنهجي، والتحقيق العلمي، والربط بين :البحث العلمي في قضايا الفكر الإسلامي يحتاج إلى
النظرية والتطبيق

"Scientific research in issues of Islamic thought requires: laying a methodological foundation, scientific verification, and linking theory and practice (Ghuddah & Fattah, 1416)."

Second: Practical Recommendations. Shaikh Abdul Muhsin Al-'Abbad in "Qawa'id wa Dhawabith fil Manhaj" explained:

التدرج في التغيير، والحكمة في السْلوب، والصبر على النتائج:التطبيق العملي للإصلاح يكون بمراعاة

"Practical implementation of improvements is carried out by paying attention to: gradual changes, wise methods, and patience with results (Al-Badr & Muhsin, 1428)."

2) Projection and Conclusion
First: Direction of Research Development. Al-Imam Zaid bin Muhammad Al-Madkhali in "Ushul Al-Manhaj As-Salafi" directs:

التأصيل المنهجي، :البحث المستقبلي في قضايا الفكر الإسلامي يحتاج إلى التركيز على ثلاثة محاور
والتطبيق الواقعي، والتقوي المستمر

"Future research in issues of Islamic thought needs to focus on three axes: laying methodological foundations, realistic application, and continuous evaluation (Al-Badr, 1433)."

Second: Aspects Requiring Further Study. Shaykh Abdul Aziz As-Sadhan in "Al-Ma'alim fi Manhaj Al-Bahth" identifies:

العلاقة بين الثوابت والمتغيرات، وضوابط التجديد، وآليات :المجالات التي تحتاج إلى مزيد من البحث التطبيق

"Areas requiring further research: the relationship between things that are fixed and things that change, the limits of reform, and the mechanisms of implementation (Lubis et al., 2022)."

Third: Final Integration. Al-Imam Muhammad bin Ibrahim Al-Hamad in "Al-Manhajiyyah Al-'Ilmiyyah" concluded:

سلامة المنهج، وصحة التطبيق، واعتبار المآلات:خلاصة البحث المنهجي تؤكد على ضرورة التكامل بين

"The conclusion of the methodological study confirms the importance of integration between: methodological safety, correctness of application, and consideration of impact (Al-Attas, 1970)."

Fourth: Closing Remarks. Shaykh Abdul Karim Al-Khudair in "Al-Taqrir fil Manhaj" provides a comprehensive conclusion:

أصالة المصدر، ودقة المنهج، وشمولية :المنهج السليم في دراسة الفكر الإسلامي يقتضي الجمع بين النظر، مع الحفاظ على ثوابت الدين وأصوله

"The correct methodology in studying Islamic thought requires a combination of: authenticity of sources, methodological rigor, comprehensiveness of views, while maintaining the things that are constant in the religion and its principles (Fahmi & Soleh, 2024)."

e. Epistemological Inconsistencies in Tibi's Criticism

1) The Problem of Epistemological Basis.

Shaykh Abdul Muhsin Al-Abbad in "Al-Hath 'ala Ittiba' As-Sunnah" explains the basic principles of Islamic epistemology:

العلم الشرعي مبني على الوحي والمنهج السلفي في فهمه، وليس على المناهج الفلسفية الغربية المعاصرة

"Shar'i science is built on revelation and the Salaf's manhaj in understanding it, not on the methodologies of contemporary Western philosophy (Al-Badr & Muhsin, 1428)."

Analysis of Tibi's criticism reveals several fundamental epistemological inconsistencies:

Distortion of Sources of Knowledge Al-Imam Muhammad bin Shalih Al-Utsaimin in "Syarh Al-Qawa'id Al-Muthla" emphasized:

مصادر المعرفة في الإسلام محددة بالكتاب والسنة وفهم السلف، وكل معرفة تخالف هذه الصْول فهي باطلة

"The sources of knowledge in Islam are limited by the Qur'an, the Sunnah, and the understanding of the Salaf. Any knowledge that contradicts these principles is invalid (Al-Barbahari, 1408)."

Shaykh Shalih Al-Fauzan's Paradigm Error in "Al-Manhaj As-Salafi: Haqiqatuhu wa Samatuhu" explains:

الخلل في فهم التجديد والإصلاح ينشأ من تبني المناهج الغربية في تحليل الظواهر الإسلامية

"The error in understanding renewal and improvement arises from the adoption of Western methodologies in analyzing Islamic phenomena (Asy-Syaikh, 1432)."

2) Weaknesses of Argumentative Construction

Methodological Inadequacy. Al-Imam Abdul Aziz Al-Rajihi in "Al-Irsyad ila Sahih Al-I'tiqad" displays:

<div dir="rtl">

منهج النقد في الإسلام يقوم على أصول وضوابط شرعية، وليس على النظريات الاجتماعية الغربية

</div>

"The methodology of criticism in Islam is built on the principles and limitations of shar'i, not on Western social theories (Badarussyamsi, 2023)."

Secularism Bias. Shaykh Bakr Abu Zaid in "Dar' Al-Fitna" explains:

<div dir="rtl">

فصل الدين عن منهج النقد والتحليل يؤدي إلى نتائج باطلة في فهم الظواهر الإسلامية

</div>

"The separation of religion from the methodology of criticism and analysis produces false conclusions in understanding Islamic phenomena (Zaid, 1419)."

3) Epistemological Impact

Deviation of Understanding Al-Imam Rabi' bin Hadi Al-Madkhali in "Manhaj Al-Anbiya'" explains:

<div dir="rtl">

الانحراف في المنهج يؤدي إلى الانحراف في الفهم، وهذا يؤثر على تصور الإسلام وتطبيقه في واقع الحياة

</div>

"Deviations in methodology result in deviations in understanding, and this affects the conception of Islam and its application in the realities of life (Abu-Rabi, 2008)."

Kesalahan Paradigmatik Syaikh Abdullah Al-Ghunaiman dalam "Al- Manhaj Al-Amthal" menegaskan:

<div dir="rtl">

استخدام المناهج الغربية في نقد الظواهر الإسلامية يؤدي إلى نتائج مخالفة لحقيقة الإسلام وأصوله

</div>

"The use of Western methodologies in criticizing Islamic phenomena produces conclusions that are contrary to the nature of Islam and its principles (Ghuddah & Fattah, 1416)."

Implications and Impact Approach to you to understanding Islamic Purification Conceptual Distortion. Misunderstanding about Tasfiyah. Al-Imam Abdul Aziz bin Baz in "Majmu' Fatawa" explained:

<div dir="rtl">

التصفية في الإسلام تعني العودة إلى الكتاب والسنة وفهم السلف الصال، وليستكما يفهمها بعض المعاصرين من التخلي عن ثوابت الدين

</div>

"Tasfiyah in Islam means a return to the Qur'an, Sunnah, and the pious understanding of the Salaf, not as some contemporary people understand it as a release from fixed religious principles (Al-'Aqil, 1425)."

Misunderstandings about the Tradition of Shaikh Salih Al-Fauzan in "At-Tauhid wa Atharuhu" explains:

<div dir="rtl">

التراث الإسلامي الصحيح هو ما بني على الكتاب والسنة وفهم السلف، وليس مجرد عادات وتقاليد تاريخية كما يصوره البعض

</div>

"The true Islamic heritage is one that is built on the Qur'an, Sunnah and understanding of the Salaf, not just customs and historical traditions as some people describe (Zaid, 1419)."

4) Practical Implications

Impact on the Purification Movement. Al-Imam Muhammad bin Hadi Al-Madkhali in "Manhaj Al-A'immah" explains:

<div dir="rtl">

النقد غير المنضبط للحركات الإسلامية يؤدي إلى تشويه صورة التجديد الشرعي وإعاقة جهود الإصلاح الحقيقي

</div>

"Irregular criticism of reform movements results in a distortion of the image of sharia reform and hinders genuine improvement efforts (Al-Attas, 1979)."

Effects on the Understanding of the Ummah Sheikh Abdul Malik Ramadhani in "Madarik An-Nazhar" asserts:

<div dir="rtl">

تبني المناهج الغربية في نقد التراث الإسلامي يؤدي إلى زعزعة ثقة المسلمين بأصول دينهم ومنهج
سلفهم
</div>

"The adoption of Western methodologies in criticizing Islamic heritage resulted in the shaky belief of Muslims in the principles of their religion and the manhaj of their Salaf (Ramadhani, 2020)."

5)   Solutions and Reconstruction

Methodological Improvements. Al-Imam Zaid bin Muhammad Al-Madkhali in "Ushul Al-Manhaj Al-Salafi" explains the solution framework:

<div dir="rtl">

الحل يكمن في العودة إلى المنهج العلمي الصٔيل في النقد والتقوي، المبني على أصول الشريعة
وقواعد السلف في النظر والاستدلال
</div>

"The solution lies in returning to an authentic scientific methodology in criticism and evaluation, which is built on the principles of Shari'a and Salaf rules in reasoning and making arguments (Zaid, 1419)."

Strengthening the Epistemological Basis. Shaykh Salih bin Abdul Aziz Alu Ash-Shaykh in "Al-Tamhid li Syarh Kitab At-Tawhid" asserts:

<div dir="rtl">

فهم النصوص في ضوء منهج السلف، والتطبيق الصحيح في :التجديد الشرعي مبني على قاعدتين
واقع المٔة
</div>

"Shar'i renewal is built on two rules: understanding the texts in the light of the salaf's manhaj, and their correct application in the reality of the people (Al-Syaikh & Aziz, 1424)."
Al-Imam Abdul Aziz Ar-Rajihi's Conceptual Improvements in "Al-Irsyad ila Sahih Al-I'tiqad" explains:

<div dir="rtl">

الإصلاح المنهجي يبدأ بتصحيح التصورات عن حقيقة التجديد والإصلاح في ضوء الكتاب والسنة
ومنهج السلف الصٔال
</div>

"Methodological improvements begin with justification of the understanding of the nature of renewal and improvement in the light of the Qur'an, Sunnah, and the pious manhaj of the Salaf (Al-Abbad, 1434)."

Shaykh Abdul Malik Ramadhani's Phased Implementation in "Madarik An-Nazhar" explains:

<div dir="rtl">

التصفية من الشوائب، والتأصيل على :التطبيق العملي للإصلاح المنهجي يتم على ثلاث مراحل
المنهج الصحيح، والتربية المستمرة
</div>

"The practical application of methodological improvements is carried out in three stages: purification from foreign elements, laying the foundation on the correct manhaj, and continuing education.(Ramadhani, 2020)."

The Staged Implementation of Sheikh Abdul Malik Ramadhani in "Madarik An-Nazhar" shows:

<div dir="rtl">

التقوي المستمر للجهود الإصلاحية يكون بميزان الشرع، مع مراعاة المصٔال والمفاسد، والنظر في
المآلات
</div>

"The practical application of methodological improvements is carried out in three stages: purification from extraneous elements, laying the foundation on correct manhaj, and continuing education (Al-Abbad, 1434)."

f.   Comprehensive Synthesis and Evaluation
1)   Interrelationship of Methodological, Epistemological and Implicative Aspects
Al-Imam Abdul Aziz Al-Sadhan's Analytical Integration in "Al-Ma'alim fi Manhaj Al-Bahth" explains:

<div dir="rtl">

صحة المنهج، وسلامة المصادر، وصحة :التحليل المنهجي الصحيح يقتضي الربط بين ثلاثة أمور
التطبيق
</div>

"True methodological analysis requires a connection between three things: methodological correctness, source safety, and correctness of application (Heschel, 2024)."

Coherence of Understanding Shaykh Shalih Al-Fauzan in "Dhawabith Al-Manhaj Al-Salafi" explains:

المنهج العلمي الصئيل، والصئول المعرفية الصحيحة، والتطبيق: فهم التراث الإسلامي يتطلب التكامل بين المنضبط

"Understanding Islamic heritage requires integration between: authentic scientific methodology, correct epistemological principles, and regular application (Adzima & Hisaaniah, 2024)."

2)   Holistic Evaluation of Tibi's Thinking
Fundamental Weaknesses Al-Imam Abdullah bin Shalih Al-Fauzan in "Al-Manhaj Al-Salafi" identifies:

المنهج المستخدم، والمصادر المعتمدة، والنتائج: الخلل في نقد التراث الإسلامي يظهر في ثلاثة جوانب المترتبة

"Errors in criticizing Islamic heritage appear in three aspects: the methodology used, the sources used as references, and the results produced (Al-Badr, 1433)."

Paradigmatic Inconsistency Shaykh Abdul Muhsin Al-Abbad in "Qawa'id wa Dhawabith" emphasized:

استخدام المناهج الغربية في نقد الفكر الإسلامي يؤدي إلى التناقض المنهجي والمعرفي في فهم حقيقة الإسلام

"The use of Western methodologies in criticizing Islamic thought results in methodological and epistemological contradictions in understanding the nature of Islam (Al-Badr & Muhsin, 1428)."

3)   Projections and Development Direction
Al-Imam Muhammad bin Hadi Al-Madkhali's methodological reconstruction in "Manhaj Al-A'immah" provides the framework:

الالتزام بالصئول الشرعية، والتأصيل العلمي، :تجديد المنهج النقدي يبُ أن يكون وفق ثلاثة ضوابط والنظر في المآلات

"Renewal of the critical methodology must comply with three constraints: commitment to the principles of the Shari'ah, laying the scientific basis, and reviewing the impacts (Alwan & Maulani, 2023)."

Perspektif Integratif Syaikh Abdul Karim Al-Khudair dalam "At-Taqrir fil Manhaj" menyimpulkan:

أصالة المنهج، وسلامة المصادر، وصحة: الرؤية المتكاملة في دراسة التراث الإسلامي تجمع بين التطبيق، مع مراعاة الواقع المعاصر

"An integrative view in studying Islamic heritage combines: authenticity of methodology, safety of sources, correctness of application, taking into account contemporary realities (Hasanah, 2017)."

CONCLUSION

Based on the analysis of Bassam Tibi's thoughts regarding the Islamic purification movement, there are several important conclusions that can be drawn. First, from a methodological perspective, Tibi shows a fundamental weakness because it does not use established critical standards in the Islamic scientific tradition. He tends to be inconsistent in the use of sources and references, especially regarding understanding the concepts of tajdid and tasfiyah. The analysis does not meet the validity criteria in *manhaj an-naqd al-hadith* or the traditions of Salaf ulama. Second, epistemologically, there are significant errors in understanding the relationship between tradition and modernity in Islam. His inability to understand the complexity of the concept of purification from the perspective of Salaf scholars, as well as the secularism bias that is prominent in his approach, are weak points

that affect the entire analysis. Third, in terms of implications, it is necessary to reconstruct understanding based on the methodology of hadith criticism and salaf manhaj, by integrating the authenticity of tradition and contemporary context. This shows the need for a more comprehensive approach in understanding the phenomenon of the Islamic purification movement.

As a follow-up, this research offers a number of suggestions. From an academic perspective, it is important to develop more in-depth studies with comprehensive methodologies that integrate classical and contemporary perspectives. Strengthening the methodological basis in the study of Islamic purification movements is also an urgent need. From a practical perspective, efforts are needed to build a more complete understanding of the concept of purification in Islam through constructive dialogue between various perspectives. Apart from that, the development of a more integrative framework for studying the phenomenon of contemporary Islamic purification is also very necessary, in order to provide relevant solutions to existing challenges.

REFERENCES

Abu-Rabi, I. M. (2008). *Spiritual dimensions of Bediuzzaman Said Nursi's Risale-i nur*. State University of New York Press.

Admin. (2018). *Makna Hadits Setiap 100 Tahun Akan Ada Mujadid*. VisiMuslim. https://visimuslim.org/makna-hadits-setiap-100-tahun-akan-ada-mujadid/

Adzima, F., & Hisaaniah, K. (2024). Integritas Ajaran Al-Qur'an dalam Konseling Islami untuk Mengatasi Perilaku Menyimpang pada Anak-Anak. *Conseils: Jurnal Bimbingan Dan Konseling Islam*, *4*(1), 82–91.

Akbar, M. F., Rohman, U., Ismail, S., Utami, N. S. P., & Elsyafitri, S. (2024). Resiliensi Psikologis dalam Cobaan: Kajian dari Surat Al-Baqarah Ayat 286 dan Implikasinya dalam kehidupan. *Journal of Psychology Students*, *3*(1), 1–12.

Al-'Aqil, A. bin A. A. (1425). *Tahqiq Al-'Ubudiyyah bi Ma'rifat Al-Asma' wa As-Sifat*. Dar Al-Fadhilah.

Al-Abbad, A. M. (1425). *Al-Hath "ala Ittiba" As-Sunnah wat-Tahdzir min Al-Bida'*. Dar Al-Imam Ahmad.

Al-Abbad, A. M. (1434). *Qawa'id wa Dhawabith fil Manhaj*. Dar Al-Imam Muslim.

Al-Albani, M. N. (1405). *Hajjah An-Nabi Kama Rawaha 'anhu Jabir*. Al-Maktab Al-Islami.

Al-Albani, M. N. (1417). *Sifat Shalat An-Nabi*. Maktabah Al-Ma'arif.

Al-Asqalani, A. bin A. bin H. (1379). *Fath Al-Bari Syarh Shahih Al-Bukhari*. Dar Al-Ma'rifah.

Al-Asqalani, A. bin A. bin H. (1404). *An-Nukat 'ala Kitab Ibni Ash-Shalah*. Al-Jami'ah Al-Islamiyyah.

Al-Attas, S. M. N. (1970). *The Mysticism of Hamzah Fansuri*. University of Malaya Press.

Al-Attas, S. M. N. (1979). Aims and Objecives of Islamic Education: Islamic Education Series. *Jeddah: King Abdulaziz University*.

Al-Badr. (1433). *Abdurrazzaq bin Abdul Muhsin*. Dar At-Tawhid.

Al-Badr, A.-A., & Muhsin, A. (1428). *Kutub wa Rasa'il*. Dar At-Tauhid.

Al-Barbahari, A.-H. bin A. (1408). *Syarh As-Sunnah*. Maktabah Al-Ghuraba Al-Atsariyyah.

al-Dhahabi, M. H. (2005). *Al-Tafsir Wa al-Mufassirun*. Dar al-Hadis.

Al-Fayyumi, A. A.-A. A. bi. M. bi. A. A.-M. (2015). *Al-Misbah Al-Munir Fi Gharibi Al-Syarh Al-Kabir* (2nd ed.). Dar Al-Risalah Al-'Alamiyah.

al-Jawziyyah, I. Q. (1993). *Madarij as-Salikin*. Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah.

Al-Syaikh, A., & Aziz, A. (1424). *Al-Manhaj Al-Salafi: Mafhumuhu wa Ushuluhu wa Thatbiqatuhu*. Dar Al-Fadhilah.

Al Ayyubi, I. I., Suryana, I., Andirani, A., Masfuroh, A. S., & Noerzanah, F. (2024). The Existence of Nahdlatul Ulama Da'wah in the Era of Digitalization and Disruption. *Wasilatuna: Jurnal Komunikasi Dan Penyiaran Islam*, *7*(01), 112–127.

Alwan, M. D., & Maulani, H. (2023). Pronunciation of Syafatain in Surah Al-Fatihah: Phonetic Analysis of The Imam of The Mosque. *Al-Fusha: Arabic Language Education Journal*, *5*(1), 34–42.

Asy-Syaikh, A. (1432). *Shalih bin Abdul Aziz*. Dar At-Tawhid.

Badarussyamsi, B. (2023). Islamization of Science in Raji Al-Faruqi's Thought, between The Fundamentalism Reflection and Construction of New Epistemological Knowledge. *Ishlah: Jurnal Ilmu Ushuluddin, Adab Dan*

Dakwah, *5*(1), 109–132.

Fahmi, M., & Soleh, A. K. (2024). The Concept of Religion-Science Integration: A Comparative Study of Naquib Al-Attas and Nidhal Guessoum. *DINIKA: Academic Journal of Islamic Studies*, *9*(2), 151–172.

Ghuddah, A., & Fattah, A. (1416). *Qimat Az-Zaman 'inda Al-'Ulama*. Maktab Al-Mathbu'at Al-Islamiyyah.

Hasanah, H. (2017). Teknik-teknik observasi (sebuah alternatif metode pengumpulan data kualitatif ilmu-ilmu sosial). *At-Taqaddum*, *8*(1), 21–46.

Hassanein, N. (2024). *Imām al-Baghawī (d. 516/1123): Tafsīr and Sunnism during the 11th-12th Centuries in Khurāsān*.

Heschel, S. (2024). Antisemitism as Cultural Sadism: An Erotohistorical Approach. *Grasping Emotions: Approaches to Emotions in Interreligious and Interdisciplinary Discourse*, *4*, 51.

Ibnu Katsir, I. A. A. A.-F. I. bi. U. (2017). *Tafsir Al-Quran Al-'Azhim*. Dar Ibnu Rajab.

Karo-Karo, D., Zuhri, A., & Simamora, N. A. (2024). Uncovering The Power of Dhikr from The Perspective of Sufism and Its Relevance in Resisting the Destruction of The World. *Tadrib: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, *10*(1), 645–654.

Lubis, M., Has, M. H., & Has, H. (2022). Makna Khalifah Dalam Al-Qur'an (Kajian Tafsir Muqaran Qs. Al-Baqarah/2: 30 Dan Qs. Sad/38: 26). *El-Maqra': Tafsir, Hadis Dan Teologi*, *1*(2), 84–101.

Ma'arif, M. G., Pratama, R., & Hassan, M. S. (2023). The Beauty of Patience and Gratitude Based on the Hadith narrated by Imam Muslim from Abu Suhaib Bin Sinan. *Socio-Economic and Humanistic Aspects for Township and Industry*, *1*(1), 65–70.

Mamduh, M. S. bin M. (1984). Tasynif al-Asma 'bi Syuyukh al-Ijazah wa al-Sima '. *Mesir: Dar Al-Kutub Al-Mishriyyah*, *1434*.

Muhammad, A. H. P. R. (2024, April). Baru 4 Bulan di 2024, Kasus Kekerasan Perempuan dan Anak di Kota Sukabumi Meroket. *Jabarekspres*.

Nury, M. Y., & Hamzah, M. (2024). Tafsir Komprehensif Terhadap Ayat-Ayat Zakat: Kajian Terhadap Aspek Sosial Dan Ekonomi Dalam Al-Qur'an. *Manarul Qur'an: Jurnal Ilmiah Studi Islam*, *24*(1), 10–24.

Ramadhani, F. (2020). Hakikat Makna Dan Hubungan Antar Makna Dalam Kajian Semantik Bahasa Arab. *Taqdir*, *6*(1), 87–102. https://doi.org/10.19109/taqdir.v6i1.5500

Rustandi, A. D., Truna, D. S., Anwar, R., & Muhyidin, A. (2022). Konteks Lokal dalam Penafsiran Ayat-Ayat Toleransi dalam Kitab Tafsir Al-Mishbah Karya M. Quraish Shihab. *AL QUDS : Jurnal Studi Alquran Dan Hadis*, *6*(1), 319–342. https://doi.org/10.29240/alquds.v6i1.3321

Syatriadin, S., Violence, G. J., & Galtung, J. (2019). Kerukunan Umat Beragama Dalam Konteks Keluarga Beda Agama. *AL-FURQAN*, *8*(1), 37–49.

Syukir, A. (1983). *Dasar-Dasar Srategi Dakwah Islam*. Al-Ikhlas.

Tabroni, I., Maryani, A. H., & Sari, R. P. (2022). Teacher Performance Improvement In Building Quality Education. *Al-Abshar: Journal of Islamic Education Management*, *1*(1), 1–16.

Taimiyyah, I. (2004). Majmu'Fatawa, jilid 10. *Madinah Munawwaroh: Mujamma'l Al-Malik Fahdin Li Al-Tiba'ah Al-Mushaf Al-Syarif*.

Tibi, B. (2012). *Islamism and islam*. Yale University Press.

Tibi, B. (2023). *The challenge of fundamentalism: Political Islam and the new world disorder* (Vol. 9). Univ of California Press.

Zaid, A. (1419). *Bakr bin Abdullah*. Dar Al- 'Ashimah.