

INTEGRATING FIQH AL-'IBADAT AND QUR'ANIC LEARNING IN PRIMARY ISLAMIC EDUCATION: A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF INDONESIA, MALAYSIA, PAKISTAN, AND NIGERIA

Moh. Syarif Hidayat^{1*}, Hisam Ahyani¹, Naeli Mutmainah², Siti Nurohmah³, Iryansyah⁴, Attabik Hasan Ma'ruf⁴, Anisa Nurul Amalia³, Nurlailatul Nikmah⁵, Ihwanul Muadib⁶, Mowafg Masuwd⁷

¹Institut Miftahul Huda Al Azhar, Banjar City, Indonesia.

²Raudhatul Athfal (RA) Nurul Huda, Banjar City, Indonesia

³Madrasah Ibtidaiyah (MI) Plus Nurul Huda, Banjar City, Indonesia

⁴Universitas PTIQ Jakarta, Indonesia.

⁵Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga, Yogyakarta, Indonesia.

⁶Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Nurul Iman, Parung Bogor, Indonesia.

⁷University of Zawia, Zawiya City, Libya.

*Corresponding Email: moh.syarif@kampusalazhar.ac.id

Received: . Accepted: . Published:

ABSTRACT

Primary Islamic education plays a crucial role in shaping children's religious understanding, moral character, and everyday worship practices. However, the teaching of *fiqh al-'ibadat* and Qur'anic learning often remains fragmented, with theoretical instruction separated from practical application across different educational contexts. This study aims to compare how these two domains are integrated in primary Islamic education in Indonesia, Malaysia, Pakistan, and Nigeria, and to identify pedagogical patterns that support holistic student development. A qualitative comparative multiple-case design was employed using document analysis, semi-structured interviews with teachers and school leaders, and classroom observations across selected schools in the four countries. Data were analyzed thematically to identify recurring similarities, differences, and contextual factors influencing instructional practice. The findings show two dominant models. Indonesia and Malaysia demonstrate more structured integration between conceptual learning, worship practice, and moral reflection through curriculum guidance and teacher preparation. In Pakistan and Nigeria, instruction places stronger emphasis on ritual performance and memorization, while conceptual and reflective dimensions depend largely on teacher initiative. Across all contexts, teachers face common challenges in simplifying abstract religious concepts for young learners. The study concludes that effective primary Islamic education requires balanced integration of knowledge, practice, and values. It implies that curriculum reform, teacher professional development, and contextual learning resources are needed to strengthen holistic Islamic education in diverse institutional settings.

Keywords: Comparative Education, Fiqh Al-ibadat, Islamic Curriculum, Primary Islamic Education, Pedagogical Integration, Qur'anic Learning,

INTRODUCTION

Primary education is widely acknowledged as a critical stage for shaping children's values, learning habits, and moral dispositions. In Muslim societies, Islamic education at the elementary level is expected not only to transmit religious knowledge but also to cultivate ethical conduct, spiritual awareness, and disciplined worship practices. As schools confront rapid globalization, technological change, and increasingly plural social environments, Islamic educational institutions are challenged to make religious learning more relevant, contextual, and meaningful

for young learners (Harahap et al., 2022; Aeni et al., 2024). Within this setting, the teaching of *fiqh al-'ibadat* (jurisprudence of worship) and Qur'anic learning remains central because it introduces children to foundational acts of worship such as prayer, fasting, purification, and charitable responsibility, while nurturing an early understanding of Islamic values.

Across many countries, primary Islamic education is delivered through diverse institutional forms, including madrasah, Islamic schools, integrated schools, and community-based religious programs. Despite institutional differences, these settings commonly pursue the integration of knowledge, character formation, and practical religious competence. Recent scholarship has emphasized that Islamic education should connect cognitive, affective, and behavioural domains rather than treat religious learning as the memorization of isolated content (Hidayat et al., 2020; Suwendi et al., 2024). Studies on contextual learning in Islamic education further show that students learn more effectively when doctrinal material is linked to everyday experiences and social realities (Parhan et al., 2024). Likewise, research on character education in madrasah demonstrates that meaningful religious instruction depends on consistent relationships between curriculum, pedagogy, and lived practice (Syarnubi et al., 2021).

However, many educational contexts continue to experience fragmentation between theoretical instruction and practical application. Students may memorize legal rulings or Qur'anic passages without adequately understanding their ethical significance or relevance to daily life. Previous studies have explored curriculum integration in Islamic schools (Basri & Abdullah, 2024), multicultural approaches to Islamic education (Afriyanto & Anandari, 2024), and the incorporation of Islamic values in primary education (Tsani et al., 2024). Yet these studies largely focus on single-country experiences or specific pedagogical issues. Limited attention has been given to how *fiqh al-'ibadat* and Qur'anic learning are taught together comparatively across different Muslim-majority contexts, particularly at the primary level where formal religious identity formation begins.

This gap is important because the way worship and Qur'anic learning are introduced to children can shape long-term religious understanding and behaviour. If instruction emphasizes ritual repetition alone, students may perform religious duties without reflective comprehension. Conversely, if learning remains overly textual, students may struggle to apply religious teachings in everyday life. Research on reflective practices among Islamic education teachers suggests that integrative pedagogy can strengthen students' moral reasoning, engagement, and practical understanding (Purwanto et al., 2023). Similarly, studies on emancipatory Qur'anic learning argue that interpretation should encourage critical reflection and constructive social awareness rather than rote reception of texts (Karman et al., 2021).

Responding to these concerns, this study compares the integration of *fiqh al-'ibadat* and Qur'anic learning in primary Islamic education in Indonesia, Malaysia, Pakistan, and Nigeria. These countries were selected because they represent different curriculum traditions, governance systems, and socio-cultural settings while sharing strong commitments to Islamic schooling. Comparative analysis across these contexts enables the identification of both common challenges and locally grounded innovations in curriculum design and classroom practice. Accordingly, this study aims to examine how worship jurisprudence and Qur'anic learning are organized and taught in selected primary Islamic education settings, to identify dominant pedagogical models, and to analyze factors that support or constrain holistic learning. By generating comparative evidence, the study seeks to contribute to ongoing debates on curriculum integration, teacher development, and transformative Islamic education in contemporary Muslim societies.

METHOD

This study employed a qualitative comparative multiple-case design to examine how *fiqh al-'ibadat* and Qur'anic learning are integrated in primary Islamic education across Indonesia,

Malaysia, Pakistan, and Nigeria. A qualitative approach was considered appropriate because it enables an in-depth understanding of curriculum practices, classroom interactions, and contextual meanings across different socio-cultural settings (Yin, 2017). The four countries were purposively selected to represent diverse Muslim educational systems, governance arrangements, and pedagogical traditions, while sharing a strong commitment to elementary religious education. The study was guided by the Context, Input, Process, Product (CIPP) framework, which was used as an analytical lens to compare (1) contextual factors shaping Islamic schooling, (2) curriculum inputs such as learning materials and teacher preparation, (3) instructional processes in classroom practice, and (4) perceived educational outcomes related to worship competence, moral learning, and student engagement (Stufflebeam & Zhang, 2017). This framework was adopted to ensure systematic comparison across national contexts while maintaining sensitivity to local educational realities.

Data were collected through methodological triangulation consisting of document analysis, semi-structured interviews, and non-participant classroom observations. Curriculum documents, textbooks, and syllabi were reviewed to identify how *fiqh al-'ibadat* and Qur'anic learning were positioned within primary Islamic education, including learning objectives, content sequencing, and integration with character education (Bowen, 2009). Semi-structured interviews were conducted with 16 participants comprising teachers, school leaders, and curriculum personnel from selected institutions in the four countries. Interviews explored teaching strategies, implementation challenges, teacher capacity, and perceptions of effective religious learning, and were recorded with participant consent. Classroom observations were undertaken in two schools in each country to examine pedagogical practices, student participation, and the relationship between conceptual instruction and practical worship learning. All data were transcribed, coded, and analyzed using thematic analysis following Braun and Clarke's procedures of familiarization, coding, theme development, review, and interpretation (Braun & Clarke, 2006). Cross-case comparison was then used to identify recurring patterns and context-specific differences. To enhance trustworthiness, findings were triangulated across data sources, anonymized during reporting, and reviewed through iterative checking among the research team (Creswell, 2007).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This section presents the comparative findings of the study on the integration of *fiqh al-'ibadat* and Qur'anic learning in primary Islamic education across Indonesia, Malaysia, Pakistan, and Nigeria. Drawing on document analysis, interviews, and classroom observations, the findings are organized around six interrelated dimensions: policy and institutional contexts, curriculum inputs and resource provision, classroom teaching practices, teacher capacity and challenges, perceived student outcomes, and comparative integration models. This structure reflects the analytical framework adopted in the study and highlights how curriculum systems, pedagogical practices, and local educational conditions shape the delivery of worship and Qur'anic learning in diverse settings.

Policy and Institutional Contexts

Document analysis, interviews, and classroom observations consistently indicated that policy environments and institutional arrangements played a significant role in shaping how *fiqh al-'ibadat* and Qur'anic learning were organized across the four countries. Review of curriculum documents and school planning materials in Indonesia and Malaysia showed that religious subjects were formally embedded within nationally recognized schooling systems, with clearer grade-level competencies, scheduled instructional time, and links between classroom learning and school religious activities. In both contexts, school documents commonly outlined worship

topics, such as purification, prayer, fasting, and selected Qur'anic themes, in a progressive sequence across grade levels.

Interview data supported these documentary findings. Teachers in Indonesia and Malaysia explained that formal curriculum guidance helped them organize learning progression and maintain consistency across classes. One Indonesian teacher noted that students were gradually introduced to ablution and prayer according to their developmental level, while more advanced topics were introduced in later grades (Teacher, Indonesia, personal communication, 2025). A Malaysian participant similarly reported that curriculum standards enabled teachers to coordinate classroom lessons with school-wide religious routines such as congregational prayer and Qur'anic recitation sessions (Teacher, Malaysia, personal communication, 2025). Classroom observations in both countries confirmed that worship learning was often integrated into daily school routines, suggesting alignment between formal policy expectations and actual practice.

In Pakistan and Nigeria, document analysis revealed a more diverse range of institutional arrangements, including public schools offering religious subjects, community-based Islamic schools, and locally managed institutions. Compared with Indonesia and Malaysia, curriculum documentation was less standardized across sites, and school-level planning appeared to vary more substantially. Interview participants from both countries explained that implementation often depended on school leadership, teacher experience, and available resources. A teacher from Pakistan stated that while prayer instruction was compulsory, the depth of explanation regarding meanings and values depended largely on the teacher and time available (Teacher, Pakistan, personal communication, 2025). Similarly, a Nigerian participant explained that schools with stronger leadership support were more able to combine ritual instruction with character education activities (Teacher, Nigeria, personal communication, 2025).

Observation and interview data further reinforced these patterns. In schools where principals actively supported religious programs, classroom learning was more closely connected to assemblies, supervised prayer, and moral routines, whereas less structured settings tended to prioritize immediate ritual performance and recitation. Participants across all four countries also emphasized strong family and community expectations that schools should ensure children could perform worship correctly, memorize key supplications, and display respectful behaviour. Observations similarly showed that prayer practice, discipline, greetings, and Qur'anic recitation were embedded in daily school culture. Overall, the triangulated evidence indicates that policy structures, school leadership, and community expectations jointly shaped the consistency, priorities, and scope of integrated Islamic learning in primary education.

Curriculum Inputs and Resource Provision

Document analysis and interview data revealed notable differences in curriculum inputs, particularly in learning materials, instructional guidance, and resource availability. In Indonesia and Malaysia, reviewed syllabi, textbooks, and teacher guides commonly specified grade-level worship competencies and Qur'anic learning outcomes. These materials often combined ritual procedures with selected verses, moral messages, and practical exercises, enabling teachers to connect conceptual understanding with worship practice. Participants in both countries explained that formal curriculum resources helped them organize lessons more systematically and maintain continuity across grade levels (Teacher, Indonesia, personal communication, 2025; Teacher, Malaysia, personal communication, 2025). Classroom observations also identified the use of supplementary worksheets, visual aids, and digital media in several schools.

In Pakistan and Nigeria, access to standardized materials appeared more uneven. Some schools used locally produced handbooks or adapted classical texts, while others relied largely on teacher-prepared notes and oral explanation. Participants reported that available resources frequently emphasized memorization, recitation, and procedural worship learning, with fewer

structured activities designed to promote reflective understanding (Teacher, Pakistan, personal communication, 2025; Teacher, Nigeria, personal communication, 2025). Time allocation was also an important factor. Schools with regular weekly periods, assemblies, or practical sessions offered more opportunities to combine theory and practice, whereas tighter schedules tended to prioritize core rituals and memorization. Overall, triangulated evidence suggests that curriculum quality, instructional materials, and available learning time significantly shaped the depth of integration between *fiqh al-'ibadat* and Qur'anic learning.

Classroom Teaching Practices

Classroom observations and interview data showed that teachers employed a variety of pedagogical strategies to teach worship and Qur'anic learning. In Indonesia and Malaysia, instruction commonly combines explanation, demonstration, guided practice, and reflective discussion. For example, lessons on ablution often began with teacher explanation of the required steps and conditions, followed by student demonstrations and a brief discussion on cleanliness, discipline, and intention. Participants in several schools also described project-based activities such as charity campaigns, prayer monitoring charts, and group presentations on Islamic values, that helped connect classroom learning with everyday practice (Teacher, Indonesia, personal communication, 2025; Teacher, Malaysia, personal communication, 2025).

In Pakistan and Nigeria, teachers more frequently described direct instruction, repetition, memorization, and supervised practice as central teaching approaches. Prayer movements, recitation, and daily supplications were often taught through imitation and repeated rehearsal. Observation data suggested that these methods helped students remember ritual sequences and perform worship practices with confidence. In some classrooms, teachers complemented practice sessions with short moral stories or brief explanations drawn from Qur'anic passages to reinforce behavioural lessons (Teacher, Pakistan, personal communication, 2025; Teacher, Nigeria, personal communication, 2025).

Across all four countries, storytelling, questioning, peer demonstration, and corrective feedback were commonly used to sustain student attention and participation. Teachers consistently noted that younger learners responded more positively when lessons involved movement, visual examples, and concrete routines rather than abstract theological explanation alone. Overall, the triangulated findings suggest that classroom teaching became most integrative when practical worship exercises were accompanied by clear explanations of meaning, purpose, and ethical relevance.

Teacher Capacity and Challenges

Interview and observation data consistently identified teacher competence as a decisive factor in the successful integration of *fiqh al-'ibadat* and Qur'anic learning. Teachers with formal Islamic education backgrounds or pedagogical training were generally perceived as more confident in translating complex legal and theological concepts into age-appropriate lessons. In Indonesia and Malaysia, several participants explained that professional development programs, curriculum workshops, and peer collaboration helped strengthen instructional consistency and lesson planning (Teacher, Indonesia, personal communication, 2025; Teacher, Malaysia, personal communication, 2025). Observations in these contexts also suggested that trained teachers were more likely to combine explanation, practice, and reflective discussion during lessons.

In Pakistan and Nigeria, participants highlighted practical teaching experience and community trust as important strengths, particularly in guiding ritual performance, recitation, and memorization. However, some respondents acknowledged challenges in explaining jurisprudential differences, symbolic meanings of worship, or contextual ethical lessons to younger learners. Limited access to updated teaching materials and formal training opportunities

was also reported in several schools (Teacher, Pakistan, personal communication, 2025; Teacher, Nigeria, personal communication, 2025).

Across all four countries, teachers described similar classroom challenges, including short attention spans among younger learners, uneven family support, language diversity, and the need to balance memorization with understanding. Many participants explained that they responded through repetition, visual aids, local examples, and simplified language. Overall, the triangulated findings indicate that teacher preparation, continuous support, and adaptive pedagogical skills were central to the quality of integrated Islamic education.

Perceived Student Outcomes

Interview and observation data across the four countries indicated that students generally developed basic competence in performing core worship practices such as ablution, prayer movements, recitation, and daily supplications. Teachers reported that repeated demonstration, guided rehearsal, and routine practice were effective in helping children remember sequences and participate with greater confidence (Teacher, Indonesia, personal communication, 2025; Teacher, Pakistan, personal communication, 2025). Classroom observations further suggested that in schools where practical learning was embedded in daily routines, students showed greater consistency in prayer habits, recitation practice, and orderly participation in religious activities.

Participants also described differences in conceptual and moral learning outcomes. Teachers in Indonesia and Malaysia more frequently reported that students were able to explain the purposes of worship practices, connect lessons to cleanliness, discipline, honesty, and social responsibility, and raise reflective questions during classroom discussion (Teacher, Malaysia, personal communication, 2025). In Pakistan and Nigeria, respondents more commonly emphasized gains in obedience, respect, ritual confidence, and memorization, while noting that deeper conceptual explanation often depended on teacher initiative and available instructional time (Teacher, Nigeria, personal communication, 2025).

Across all settings, teachers believed that students responded most positively when learning connected worship practice with everyday life. Lessons linked to charity, cooperation, punctuality, and personal hygiene were described as more memorable and meaningful. Overall, the triangulated findings suggest that perceived student outcomes were strongest when schools combined routine practice with explanation, reflection, and value-based application.

Comparative Integration Models

Cross-case analysis of documents, interviews, and classroom observations revealed two broad patterns of integrating *fiqh al-'ibadat* and Qur'anic learning in primary Islamic education. The first pattern, more evident in Indonesia and Malaysia, may be described as a Structured Integrative Model. This model was characterized by formal curriculum guidance, planned progression across grade levels, greater teacher access to instructional materials, and deliberate connections between ritual practice, Qur'anic themes, and character education. Participants in these contexts reported that students were more frequently exposed to both procedural competence and conceptual explanation, while observations showed stronger alignment between classroom instruction and school religious routines (Teacher, Indonesia, personal communication, 2025; Teacher, Malaysia, personal communication, 2025).

The second pattern, more visible in Pakistan and Nigeria, may be described as a Practice-Oriented Adaptive Model. This model placed stronger emphasis on ritual mastery, memorization, and teacher-mediated moral instruction. In these settings, conceptual integration appeared to depend more heavily on individual teacher initiative, school culture, and available resources than on detailed curriculum structures. Nevertheless, participants reported that this model remained effective in developing confidence in worship performance, discipline, and respect for religious

routines (Teacher, Pakistan, personal communication, 2025; Teacher, Nigeria, personal communication, 2025). Observations further indicated that repetition, guided rehearsal, and oral explanation were central strategies in maintaining student participation.

Despite these distinctions, the comparison also showed substantial overlap across countries. All four contexts valued worship competence, moral development, and familiarity with Qur'anic teachings, while teachers in each setting adapted instructional methods according to local realities. The differences, therefore, appeared to be matters of emphasis, institutional support, and resource availability rather than fundamentally opposing educational goals. Overall, the triangulated findings suggest that effective primary Islamic education is strengthened when teaching approaches combine procedural mastery, meaningful understanding, and the internalization of ethical and social values. Table 1 summarizes the comparative characteristics of these two instructional models

Table 1. Comparative Models of Integrating Fiqh al-'Ibadat and Qur'anic Learning in Primary Islamic Education

Feature/ Dimension	Structured Integrative Model (Indonesia & Malaysia)	Practice-Oriented Adaptive Model (Pakistan & Nigeria)
Pedagogical Focus	Balanced use of theory, practice, and value reflection	Strong emphasis on ritual practice and memorization
Integration Pattern	More explicit linking of worship rules with Qur'anic meanings	Integration depends more on teacher explanation
Teaching Methods	Demonstration, projects, discussion, storytelling	Repetition, memorization, role-play, guided practice
Reported Outcomes	Stronger conceptual engagement and ritual competence	Strong ritual confidence and routine participation
Main Challenges	Translating abstract concepts into child-friendly lessons	Limited time/resources for deeper conceptual learning
Effective Strategies	Visual aids, contextual examples, structured activities	Oral guidance, local stories, practical rehearsal

As shown in Table 1, the two models differ primarily in instructional emphasis rather than educational purpose. Both seek to develop children's worship competence, moral awareness, and familiarity with Islamic teachings, but they employ different pathways shaped by curriculum structures, teacher preparation, and institutional resources. The Structured Integrative Model demonstrates the advantages of systematic connections between knowledge and practice, whereas the Practice-Oriented Adaptive Model highlights the importance of flexibility, repetition, and teacher agency in resource-variable settings. Together, these findings indicate that successful primary Islamic education depends not on a single uniform model, but on context-sensitive approaches that integrate worship practice, conceptual learning, and character formation.

The findings demonstrate that the integration of *fiqh al-'ibadat* and Qur'anic learning in primary Islamic education is shaped not only by classroom pedagogy but also by wider policy and institutional arrangements. Viewed through the CIPP framework, the contextual dimension helps explain why countries with more structured curriculum systems, such as Indonesia and Malaysia, displayed stronger alignment between learning objectives, teaching materials, and classroom

implementation. Earlier studies have similarly shown that coherent governance and curriculum integration can strengthen consistency in Islamic educational practice across institutions (Basri & Abdullah, 2024; Suwendi et al., 2024). These results suggest that macro-level policy design remains a significant enabler of holistic religious learning at the primary level.

At the same time, the findings indicate that institutional structure alone does not guarantee meaningful learning outcomes. Some schools with formal curriculum guidance still depended heavily on teacher capacity to translate written standards into age-appropriate instruction. This supports previous arguments that curriculum documents become effective only when mediated through competent pedagogical practice (Tsani et al., 2024). In this sense, the “input” dimension of the framework should be understood not merely as textbooks or syllabi, but as the combination of resources, teacher preparedness, and instructional support that transforms policy intentions into lived educational experiences (Samsudi et al., 2024).

The comparative results also highlight the continued importance of balancing theory and practice in Islamic education. Across all four countries, worship topics such as ablution, prayer, fasting, and recitation were taught most effectively when conceptual explanation was followed by direct demonstration and repeated practice. This finding resonates with contextual learning models that emphasize linking knowledge to action and everyday life (Parhan et al., 2024). It also supports earlier concerns that fragmented instruction, in which students memorize content without practical application or practice rituals without understanding their meaning, limits the transformative potential of Islamic education (Sidik et al., 2024).

The stronger presence of structured integration in Indonesia and Malaysia suggests that planned sequencing between explanation, practice, and value reflection may be especially beneficial in primary education. At younger ages, students often require concrete routines and observable examples before they can grasp abstract theological ideas. Therefore, combining ritual instruction with visible habits such as cleanliness, punctuality, cooperation, and charity can make religious learning more developmentally accessible (Usman, 2023). This finding aligns with studies showing that value integration is more effective when embedded in school routines and applied learning experiences rather than taught as isolated moral messages (Hidayat et al., 2020; Syarnubi et al., 2021).

In Pakistan and Nigeria, the stronger emphasis on memorization, repetition, and supervised ritual practice should not be interpreted as pedagogical weakness, but rather as an adaptive response to institutional realities. In settings where class size, limited resources, or uneven teacher preparation constrain instructional options, practice-oriented methods may offer efficient pathways for transmitting essential religious competencies. Previous scholarship on religion and culture in Muslim educational settings similarly notes that local institutional conditions often shape pedagogical choices more strongly than formal curriculum ideals (Dasopang et al., 2022). Thus, practice-oriented models may reflect contextual pragmatism rather than curricular deficiency.

Nevertheless, the findings also indicate that when conceptual discussion is minimal, students' understanding of the ethical and spiritual rationale of worship may remain underdeveloped. This supports research on reflective Islamic education, which argues that learners benefit when teachers explain the purposes, values, and social meanings behind religious obligations (Purwanto et al., 2023). Qur'anic learning, in particular, can serve as an interpretive bridge between ritual acts and moral consciousness, helping children understand why prayer encourages discipline, why charity fosters empathy, and why purification relates to personal responsibility (Hasan & Mujahidin, 2023). Without such connections, worship may risk becoming procedural rather than formative.

Teacher agency emerged as one of the most decisive factors across all contexts. Regardless of national curriculum structure, participants consistently described teachers as the

actors who selected examples, simplified abstract concepts, managed classroom engagement, and connected lessons to students' daily lives. This finding reinforces studies that position teachers as central agents of Islamic educational transformation rather than passive curriculum implementers (Harahap et al., 2022; Aeni et al., 2024). It also suggests that professional development should focus not only on subject mastery, but on pedagogical translation, child psychology, classroom communication, and contextual curriculum adaptation.

Another important finding concerns the pedagogical value of experiential learning. Students were perceived to respond positively to lessons that involved demonstrations, peer practice, projects, role-play, and real-life routines. Such methods enable children to learn religion through embodied participation rather than passive reception. This is consistent with broader educational research showing that active engagement supports retention, motivation, and the internalization of value, particularly at the elementary level (Parhan et al., 2024). In Islamic education, experiential approaches may be especially relevant because many acts of worship are inherently practical, social, and habit-forming.

Taken together, the two comparative models identified in this study, the Structured Integrative Model and the Practice-Oriented Adaptive Model, should be viewed as complementary tendencies rather than opposing systems. The first illustrates the benefits of curriculum coherence, systematic progression, and explicit links between knowledge and values. The second demonstrates the resilience of teacher-led, practice-centered approaches under resource-variable conditions. A more effective future model may therefore combine the strengths of both: clear curriculum direction, strong teacher agency, practical worship routines, and sustained reflective learning. This synthesis is consistent with contemporary calls for integrative Islamic education that unites cognitive, affective, and behavioural dimensions (Suwendi et al., 2024).

The findings have practical implications for primary Islamic education across diverse contexts. Policymakers should prioritize curriculum designs that connect *fiqh al-'ibadat*, Qur'anic learning, and character formation in age-appropriate ways. Schools should provide teachers with accessible resources, collaborative planning opportunities, and training in child-centered pedagogy. Teacher education institutions can also strengthen modules on contextual religious teaching, reflective practice, and experiential learning. Ultimately, the study suggests that successful Islamic primary education is not measured solely by students' ability to perform rituals correctly, but by their capacity to understand, internalize, and practice Islamic values meaningfully in everyday life.

CONCLUSION

This study concludes that the effective integration of *fiqh al-'ibadat* and Qur'anic learning in primary Islamic education depends on the alignment of curriculum design, institutional support, and teacher pedagogical capacity. Comparative findings from Indonesia, Malaysia, Pakistan, and Nigeria reveal that while schools differ in structure, resources, and instructional emphasis, all contexts seek to cultivate children's worship competence, moral character, and familiarity with Islamic teachings. More structured systems tended to promote balanced connections between conceptual understanding, practical worship, and value reflection, whereas practice-oriented settings demonstrated the importance of teacher adaptability and routine-based learning. The study, therefore, suggests that holistic Islamic education is strengthened when students learn not only how to perform religious practices, but also why those practices matter ethically, spiritually, and socially. For policymakers and educators, this implies the need for context-sensitive curricula, teacher professional development, and child-centered pedagogies that integrate knowledge, practice, and character formation in meaningful ways.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The authors gratefully acknowledge the financial support provided by the Indonesia Endowment Fund for Education (LPDP) for the completion of this research.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Abitolkha, A. M. (2022). Sufism-Based Moral Education of Kh. Saleh Darat and Kh. Nawawi Al-Bantani and the Digitization Flow in the Society 5.0 Era. *MIQOT: Jurnal Ilmu-ilmu Keislaman*, 46(1). <https://doi.org/10.30821/miqot.v46i1.873>
- Aeni, A. N., Abdullah, M., Fitriyatunnisa, F., Wulan, N., & Zahra, S. A. (2024). Development of Google Sites-Based learning media for Islamic education learning in elementary schools. *Al-Hayat: Journal of Islamic Education*, 8(2), 742-761. <https://doi.org/10.35723/ajie.v8i2.594>
- Afriyanto, D., & Anandari, A. A. (2024). Transformation of Islamic religious education in the context of multiculturalism at SMA Negeri 9 Yogyakarta through an inclusive approach. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 21(1), 1-21. <https://doi.org/10.14421/jpai.v21i1.7142>
- Aguilaniu, A., Schwartz, C., Abran, G., Baudoux, L., & Croisier, P. J.-L. (2024). Ankle strength assessed by one repetition maximum: A new approach to detect weaknesses in chronic ankle lateral instability. *Foot and Ankle Surgery*, 30(4), 349–353. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fas.2024.02.005>
- Ahyani, H., Harahap, A. M., Mustofa, Rahim, A., Tanjung, I. U., Mutmainah, N., & Gumel, S. (2026). DSN-MUI Fatwas and Islamic Retirement Planning: A Maqāṣid al-Sharī'ah Review of Financial Security among Non-Civil Servant Lecturers in Indonesia. *Parewa Saraq: Journal of Islamic Law and Fatwa Review*, 5(1), 102–120. <https://doi.org/10.64016/parewasaraq.v5i1.78>
- Al-Attar, M. (2017). Meta-ethics: A Quest for an Epistemological Basis of Morality in Classical Islamic Thought. *Journal of Islamic Ethics*, 1(1–2), 29–50. <https://doi.org/10.1163/24685542-12340003>
- Albalawi, A. F., & Abdul-Ghafour, A.-Q. K. (2026). An investigation into human vs AI English translations of Qur'anic euphemisms. *Social Sciences & Humanities Open*, 13, 102249. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssaho.2025.102249>
- Al-Ghazali, A. H. (1989). *Ihya' Ulum al-Din*. Beirut: Dar al-Fikr.
- Al-Sharmani, M. (2018). Marriage in Islamic Interpretive Tradition: Revisiting the Legal and the Ethical. *Journal of Islamic Ethics*, 2(1–2), 76–96. <https://doi.org/10.1163/24685542-12340017>
- Aprina, D. A., Saputri, I. O. A., Nurjannah, S., & Fajri, S. (2025). Islamic Leadership in Managerial Practice: Shura, Amanah, and Adil in KRT Dr. Dasep's Thought. *Citangkolo : Contemporary Issues in Management, Governance, Knowledge, and Leadership Opportunities*, 1(1), 61–73. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.19350122>
- Arifin, A., & Nisak, N. M. (2024). Integrating Islamic Values and Sports for Children's Moral Development: *Indonesian Journal of Islamic Studies*, 12(4), Article 4. <https://doi.org/10.21070/ijis.v12i4.1750>
- Arifin, S., Huda, M., & Mufida, N. H. (2023). Developing Akhlak Karimah Values through Integrative Learning Model in Madrasah. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 9(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v0i0.24443>
- Asy-Syatibi, I. A. I. (2004). *Al munafaqat fi ushul asy Syari'ah*. Beirut: Dar Al Kotob Al-Ilmiyah.
- Ath-Thabari, A. J. M. bin J. (2007). *Tafsir Ath-Thabari*. Jakarta: Pustaka Azzam.
- Auta, M., Paul-Mgbeafulike, V. S., Ikpeama, F. U., & Ufondu, C. C. (2025). Digital Resilience as a Moderator in the Adoption of Digital Tools for Teaching Vocational Subjects in

- Nigerian Universities: A TAM Perspective. *Abdurrauf Social Science*, 2(2), 110–122. <https://doi.org/10.70742/arsos.v2i2.361>
- Ayubi, Z. (2020). De-Universalising Male Normativity: Feminist Methodologies for Studying Masculinity in Premodern Islamic Ethics Texts. *Journal of Islamic Ethics*, 4(1–2), 66–97. <https://doi.org/10.1163/24685542-12340044>
- Azizi, A., Salimi, J., & Tanhayee, A. (2025). An insight-based approach to higher education administration through mindfulness. *International Journal of Educational Management*, 39(4), 1005–1027. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJEM-11-2024-0722>
- Baedah, S. S. A., Musolin, M. H., & Nurlaelah. (2026). Dialectics of Fiqh al-Ikhtilāf: A Comparative Madhhab Analysis of Legal Pluralism in Contemporary Muslim Societies. *Mazhabibuna: Jurnal Perbandingan Mazhab*, 19–38. <https://doi.org/10.24252/mazahibuna.vi.64995>
- Basri, H., & Abdullah, A. (2024). Curriculum Integration Constructs in Integrated Islamic Elementary School. *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education*, 5(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.31538/tjje.v5i1.873>
- Bowen, G. A. (2009). Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method. *Qualitative Research Journal*, 9(2), 27–40. <https://doi.org/10.3316/QRJ0902027>
- Braun, V., and Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77–101. <https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa>
- Budiyanti, N., Komariah, K. S., Hermawan, W., Jenuri, J., & Hyangsewu, P. (2024). Impact of the Ulū Al-Ilm model on six domains of student learning outcomes in islamic religious education. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 10(1), 113-124. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v10i1.33225>
- Choirin, M., Masuwd, M. A., Yusof, M. bin, Salim, H., & Tanjung, H. B. (2025). Historical Development of Islamization in the Nusantara: Trends and Scholarly Contributions. *Journal of Al-Tamaddun*, 20(2), 301–317. <https://doi.org/10.22452/JAT.vol20no2.21>
- Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*. Thousand Oaks: SAGE.
- Dara, N. D., & Khafidz, H. A. (2025). Consumption Tax Policy Responses in Indonesia and Malaysia: An Islamic Economic Perspective on Global Uncertainty. *Al-Tijarah*, 1(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.19098046>
- Dasopang, M. D., Adam, H. B. H., & Nasution, I. F. A. (2022). Integration of religion and culture in Muslim minority communities through Islamic education. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 8(2), 221-238. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v8i2.19445>
- ElKaleh, E. (2019). Leadership curricula in UAE business and education management programmes. *International Journal of Educational Management*, 33(6), 1118–1147. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJEM-10-2016-0220>
- Es-haghi, M. S., Anitescu, C., & Rabczuk, T. (2024). Methods for enabling real-time analysis in digital twins: A literature review. *Computers & Structures*, 297, 107342. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compstruc.2024.107342>
- Gumel, S. M. (2025). Pseudolegal Manipulation of Islamic Law by Extremist Groups: Comparative Analysis of ISIS and Boko Haram. *Munakahat*, 2(1), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.18920127>
- Harahap, S. D., Jimmi, J., Pattiasina, P. J., Trinova, Z., & Damayanto, A. (2022). Trends in Technological Innovation in Education During a Time of Pandemic Disruption: Examining The Perspective of Teaching Digital Pedagogy. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 5(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v5i1.1867>

Moh. Syarif Hidayat, Hisam Ahyani, Naeli Mutmainah, Siti Nurohmah, Iryansyah, Attabik Hasan Ma'ruf, Anisa Nurul Amalia, Nurlailatul Nikmah, Ihwanul Muadib, Mowafg Masuwd

- Hasan, M. S., & Mujahidin, M. (2023). Sufism and Religious Moderation: The Internalization Process in Thoriqoh Syadziliyah Al Masudiyah Jombang. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 6(3), 491-511. <https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v6i3.4841>
- Hidayat, T., Rizal, A. S., Abdussalam, A., & Fawwaz, A. G. (2020). Designing Islamic Values Integration into Sociology Learning. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 6(1). <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v6i1.8119>
- Hopid, A., Rachmaningtyas, N. A., & Kistoro, H. C. A. (2023). Generation" Z's Perception of Religious Moderation and Tendency to Choose Religious Studies in Indonesia. *Jurnal pendidikan agama Islam*, 20(1), 20-32. <https://doi.org/10.14421/jpai.v20i1.7689>
- Ichwan, M. N., Shadiqin, S. I., & Mujtahid, M. (2025). Reshaping Islamic Knowledge, Advocating Wasatism: The Azharites and the Transformation of Urban Religious Learning in Banda Aceh, Indonesia. *Ulumuna*, 29(1), 249–278. <https://doi.org/10.20414/ujis.v29i1.1391>
- Iskandar, I., Samsuddin, S., Idharudin, A. J., Maya, R., Masuwd, M., & Azizah, B. N. (2025). The Integrated Islamic Education System in Islamic Movements: A Philosophical Analysis of Wahdah Islamiyah's Educational Model. *El-Suffah: Jurnal Studi Islam*, 2(2), 190–218. <https://doi.org/10.70742/suffah.v2i2.416>
- Jauziyah, I. Q. A. (1977). *Ilam al-Muwaqqi'in 'an Rabb al-Alamin*. Beirut: Dar al-Fikri.
- Karman, K., Anwar, R., Syarifudin, U., & Muhtar, S. N. (2021). The Design for Emancipatory Quran Interpretation Learning to Deradicalize Students' Quran Understanding. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 7(2). <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v7i2.12720>
- Kawaguchi-Suzuki, M., Hogue, M. D., Khanfar, N. M., Lahoz, M. R., Law, M. G., Parekh, J., Zairina, E., Hong, J., Robles, Y. R., & Van Thang, V. (2019). Cultural Sensitivity and Global Pharmacy Engagement in Asia: India, Indonesia, Malaysia, Philippines, and Vietnam. *American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education*, 83(4), 7215. <https://doi.org/10.5688/ajpe7215>
- Kistoro, H. C. A., Istiyono, E., Latipah, E., & Burhan, N. M. (2023). Islamic character education: Mapping and networking data using bibliometric analysis. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 20(2), 195-214. <https://doi.org/10.14421/jpai.v20i2.8027>
- Maslani, M., Hidayat, W., Qadir, A., & Muhyidin, A. (2023). Ecopedagogy in Action: An Ethnographic Exploration of Environmental Preservation Strategies in Pesantren. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 9(2), 211–222. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v9i2.29347>
- Masuwd, M., Irama, Y., Rahman, Z. A., Yusuf, M. A., & Baroud, N. (2026). From Charisma to Academic Rationality: An ethnographic study of “Academic Kiai” Leadership in Indonesian Pesantren. *MIQOT: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Keislaman*, 50(1), 106–127. <https://doi.org/10.30821/miqot.v50i1.1493>
- Minazheva, G., Mynbayeva, A., Yessenova, K., & Alchimbayeva, A. (2023). Transformation of the role of university teachers in newly independent states: Case study of Al-Farabi Kazakh National University. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 102, 102847. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2023.102847>
- Muchtar, N. E. P., Ahadiyah, W., Zulianah, E., & Khodijah, S. (2022). The Existence of Prophetic Learning in Improving Spiritual Intelligence Through Tahfidz Al-Qur'an for Students. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 5(3), 1175–1191. <https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v5i3.2743>
- Muliadi, M., Syamsidar, S., & Islam, N. (2025). Religious Moderation by Design: A Comparative Sociological Da'wah Study in Indonesian Higher Education. *Jurnal Ilmiah Peuradeun*, 13(2), 1549–1580. <https://doi.org/10.26811/peuradeun.v13i2.1778>
- Munawar, P. S., Az-Zahra, R. F., Karundeng, R., & Aisah, S. (2025). Islamic-Based Planning and Organizing in Faith-Based Higher Education: A Field Study at STIT NU Al-Farabi

- Pangandaran. *Citangkolo: Contemporary Issues in Management, Governance, Knowledge, and Leadership Opportunities*, 1(1), 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.19349747>
- Mutmainah, N., & Bhatti, M. S. (2025). Enhancing Legal Protections for Workers in Industrial Accidents: Towards Better Occupational Safety in Indonesia. *Justitia Nova*, 1(1), 1–11. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.19098461>
- Parhan, M., Syahidin, S., Somad, M. A., Abdulah, M., & Nugraha, R. H. (2024). Developing a contextual learning model in Islamic education to improve applicable knowledge and foster knowledge-based virtues. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 10(1), 75-86. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v10i1.35205>
- Purwanto, Y., Saepudin, A., & Sofaussamawati, S. (2023). The development of reflective practices for Islamic religious education teachers. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 9(1), 107-122. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v0i0.24155>
- Samsudi, S., Suprpto, E., Utanto, Y., Rohman, S., & Djafar, T. (2024). Unraveling the Merdeka Curriculum: Exploring Differentiated Instruction's Impact on Student Learning. *Jurnal Ilmiah Peuradeun*, 12(2), 517-538. <https://doi.org/10.26811/peuradeun.v12i2.1131>
- Sidik, M. F., Vachruddin, V. P., Rusydiyah, E. F., Pertiwi, A. S., & Darmawan, M. A. (2024). Conceptualization of the integrated Islamic religious education curriculum: A literature study at Imam Hatip schools Turkey and MAN Insan cendekia Indonesia. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 21(1), 111-130. <https://doi.org/10.14421/jpai.v21i1.7617>
- Soleh, I., & Gumel, S. (2025). Strategic Management Model Implementation in Raudhatul Irfan Islamic Boarding School, Ciamis: A Global Perspective. *Nabdlatul Fikir*, 1(3), 17–30. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.18434652>
- Stufflebeam, D. L., & Zhang, G. (2017). *The CIPP Evaluation Model: How to Evaluate for Improvement and Accountability*. New York: Guilford Publications.
- Sugiarti, S., & Abdurrahman, D. (2024). Integration of worship jurisprudence in elementary school religious education through an integrated and holistic approach. *Journal of Elementary Education: Strategies, Innovations, Curriculum, and Assesment*, 1(1), 1-15. <https://doi.org/10.61580/jeesica.v1i1.27>
- Sulaiman, K. F., Satriawan, I., Musa, N., & Fathi, M. (2025). A Comparison of Decentralization Policy in Indonesia and Malaysia. *Petita: Jurnal Kajian Ilmu Hukum Dan Syariah*, 10(1), 297–321. <https://doi.org/10.22373/petita.v10i1.677>
- Surur, A. T., Adinugraha, H. H., & Achmad, D. (2025). An Analysis of Sharia Economic Practices in Pekalongan from Habib Luthfi's Perspective. *El-Suffah: Jurnal Studi Islam*, 2(2), 138–170. <https://doi.org/10.70742/suffah.v2i2.430>
- Suwendi, S., Mesraini, M., Azka, F. L., & Gama, C. B. (2024). Implementation of knowledge integration in Islamic higher education. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 10(1), 41-52. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v10i1.35385>
- Syarif, Abdullah, F., & Herlambang, S. (2024). Multiculturalism among Students in Madrasah: Knowledge, Challenges, and Social Capital. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 7(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v7i2.4710>
- Syarnubi, S., Mansir, F., Purnomo, M. E., Harto, K., & Hawi, A. (2021). Implementing character education in madrasah. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 7(1), 77-94. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v7i1.8449>
- Tsani, I., Sufirmansyah, S., Makmur, M., & Inâ, A. (2024). Evaluating the Integration of Islamic Values in Primary Education: A Logic Model Approach. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 10(1), 87-100. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v10i1.34238>

Moh. Syarif Hidayat, Hisam Ahyani, Naeli Mutmainah, Siti Nurohmah, Iryansyah, Attabik Hasan Ma'ruf, Anisa Nurul Amalia, Nurlailatul Nikmah, Ihwanul Muadib, Mowafg Masuwd

- Usman, U. (2023). Social and Cultural Interpretation of the Maleman Tradition in the Sasak Community of Lombok. *Ulumuna*, 27(1), 449-466. <https://doi.org/10.20414/ujis.v27i1.774>
- Wahid, M. A., Fajar, A. S. M. F. A. S. M., & Hayeejehwee, K. (2025). The Thought Construction of KH. Hasyim Asy'ari on Teacher Professionalism in the Book Adab Al-'Alim Wa Al-Muta'alim. *Nabdlatul Fikir*, 1(3), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.18434263>
- Wijaya, E. S., Noorhayati, S. M., Gunawan, G., Darwis, F. A., & Amin, P. A. (2026). Al-Farabi's Philosophy of Islamic Education and Its Relevance to Character Formation in Modern Education. *Al-Mada: Jurnal Agama, Sosial, Dan Budaya*, 9(1), 163–177. <https://doi.org/10.31538/almada.v9i1.9515>
- Yaakob, S. F. B., Kasim, T. S. A. B. T., Razif, N. F. B. M., & Maawali, I. M. Z. A. (2025). Knowledge and Teaching Practices of Islamic Education Teachers in Learning Female Blood Fiqh of Secondary School Islamic Education Curriculum: Analysis Based on Contextual Learning Approach. *Millah: Journal of Religious Studies*. <https://doi.org/10.20885/millah.vol24.iss2.ar9>
- Yin, R. K. (2017). *Case Study Research and Applications: Design and Methods*. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications.
- Yoyo, Y., Hussin, M., Rahman, A., Zaini, A. R., & Sutipyo, R. (2023). Cultural Perceptions of Santri on Arabic Language Learning. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 9(2), 187-198. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v9i2.24103>