
Education and Training for Local Government Officials: Program Evaluation and Its Impact on Bureaucratic Performance

Faria Ruhana¹, Rian Fauzi², Hariyanto³

¹Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri (IPDN), Sumedang, Indonesia, Email: fariaruhana@ipdn.ac.id

²Universitas Setia Budhi Rangkasbitung, Lebak, Indonesia

³Sekolah Tinggi Agama Buddha Negeri Raden Wijaya Wonogiri, Indonesia

Received: June 11, 2023; In Revised: July 29, 2023; Accepted: August 29, 2023

Abstract

In the context of regional government, education and training programs for government officials have an important role in improving bureaucratic performance and public services. These programs have experienced significant development in line with changes in community needs and the local government environment. This research then aims to look at education and training programs that can be implemented by local government officials, spread their effectiveness, and analyze their impact on bureaucratic performance at the regional level. This research uses a descriptive qualitative approach and relies on secondary data obtained from various relevant research and previous studies. The results of this research found that education and training programs for local government officials have a positive impact on the performance of bureaucracy and public services at the local level. Through the evolution of these programs, local government officials have access to more comprehensive training materials and innovative teaching methods. This positive impact is felt by the community through better quality public services and improved relations between local governments and their communities. However, challenges such as financial constraints and resistance from some local government officials must be overcome. Education and training programs must remain relevant to national policies, follow the dynamics of external factors, and ensure close cooperation to achieve optimal results.

Keywords: Education and Training, Local Government, Program Evaluation, Performance.

Introduction

Regional government is an important element in a country's government system. It is a place where public policies and community service programs are implemented directly. The position of local government officials as the main executors of this policy makes them a key element in determining the success or failure of implementing this policy. Therefore, it is important to ensure that local government officials have sufficient qualifications, skills, and knowledge to carry out their duties well (Chaves-Avila & Gallego-Bono, 2020). To improve the quality of performance of local government officials, education and training is one of the approaches that is often used. Special education and training programs are designed to prepare local government officials to face increasingly complex tasks in the modern bureaucratic world. However, it is important to note that the resources allocated to these education and training programs represent a significant investment by local governments, and therefore, evaluation of these programs is mandatory (Fagan et al., 2019).

Evaluation of education and training programs for local government officials is an important step in understanding their impact on bureaucratic performance. This evaluation can provide insight into whether these programs have succeeded in improving the qualifications and performance of local government officials or not. In other words, the evaluation of these education and training programs helps answer critical questions regarding the effectiveness of these programs (Zhang et al., 2022). In addition, education and training programs for local government officials can also be a significant indicator in understanding how local governments are committed to developing human resources within their bureaucracy. This is

closely related to issues such as accountability, transparency, and good governance in decision-making (Bryant & Thomson, 2021).

Globalization trends, information technology and rapidly changing economic dynamics have created new challenges for local governments. Local government officials are not only expected to carry out traditional government duties but must also be able to adapt to changes in an increasingly complex environment. Relevant and quality education and training programs are key instruments in preparing them to face these changes. Skills such as risk management, innovation, communication, and leadership have become crucial in this context. Therefore, an in-depth understanding of the extent to which education and training programs can help local government officials overcome these challenges is also important (Manoharan et al., 2021).

In addition, looking at a global perspective, cooperation between regional governments from various countries is also increasingly common. The exchange of experience, best practices, and knowledge between local governments can contribute positively to the development of bureaucracy at the local level. Education and training programs can also play an important role in preparing local government officials to participate in this international collaboration, ensuring that they know necessary to carry out their roles in an increasingly connected global context. Therefore, this research will also try to explore international aspects of the education and training of local government officials and their impact on their abilities in a global context (Tao et al., 2022).

This research then aims to look at education and training programs that can be implemented by regional government officials, evaluate their effectiveness, and analyze their impact on bureaucratic performance at the regional level.

Literature Review

Education & Training

Ihsan Fuad suggests that education entails the human endeavor to identify and enhance physical and spiritual capacities by adhering to the societal and cultural values that evolve during the course of life and within an educational process. Suwatno, on the other hand, holds the view that education involves activities geared towards sustaining and enhancing employee competence to enhance organizational effectiveness. This is achieved through career development, as well as education and training. From the opinions above, it can be concluded that education is an action taken to change a person's behavior through teaching so that it goes according to the expected goals (Akan, 2023).

In Sakula's perspective, training constitutes a brief educational procedure that employs structured and methodical methods. Non-managerial employees partake in this process to acquire technical knowledge and skills for specific, limited objectives. According to Menpan Decree No. 01/Kep/M. Pan/2001, training is an experiential learning process, prioritizing practical application over theoretical aspects. It is conducted by an individual or a group using an adult-oriented training approach, with the goal of enhancing one or more specific skill sets. Summarily, training involves an individual attaining a particular skill or ability (Adriani & Hikmah, 2022).

According to PP No. 101 of 2000 concerning education and training, Article 1 paragraph (1) explains that "Education and training is the process of organizing teaching and learning to improve abilities". Malayu S.P Hasibuan's viewpoint posits that education and training constitute a process aimed at enhancing the theoretical, conceptual, and ethical competencies of labor employees. Those who undergo education and training tend to

demonstrate greater proficiency in their work compared to those who do not receive such educational opportunities. From these perspectives, it can be inferred that education and training encompass a sequence of activities designed to foster knowledge, skills, and the refinement of an individual's attitudes and behavior (Karakose et al., 2021).

According to Dessler, education and training is the process of teaching employees the skills they need to do their jobs. Meanwhile, according to Mumus, Education and Training (Diklat) is one way of measuring the competency of government officials. The term training is the process of organizing teaching and learning to improve competency for prospective civil servants and civil servants (Yunida & Sarifah, 2023). In essence, education and training have the same goal, intending to develop the workforce to be able to obtain three things, such as if someone is trained, then during education, that person is told or given familiar knowledge about how to do a job well, so training is held to fill the gap between the knowledge, skills, attitudes and thoughts that a person has following the demands of their work or duties (Omran et al., 2020).

Local Government Officials

W.S. Sayre suggests that government can be best described as the organized entity of the state that demonstrates and wields its authority. In addition, according to David Apter, government serves as the most fundamental unit responsible for upholding the system encompassing it, holding a practical monopoly over coercive power. Moreover, regions can be understood as governmental domains: they refer to designated sections of the Earth's surface, the operational settings of government, specific areas designated for distinct purposes, geographic areas in proximity to or within urban environments, areas affected by shared events, and even the surface of a body (Dutta & Fischer, 2021).

Regional government involves the management of government affairs by the Regional Government and the Regional People's Representative Council, adhering to the principles of autonomy and supportive responsibilities while upholding the principles of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia. The maritime and fisheries service represents a functional component of regional autonomy, established through decentralization. This process entails the transfer of central government responsibilities to regional governments, in accordance with the autonomy principles outlined in Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government (Hariyanto, 2022).

Regional Autonomy entails the entitlement, jurisdiction, and responsibility of autonomous regions to oversee and govern their own governmental affairs and the welfare of local communities within the framework of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia. This Regional Government uses the following principles:

1. The Autonomy Principle serves as the fundamental concept guiding the implementation of Regional Government in accordance with Regional Autonomy. This is defined in Article 1, number (7) of Law Number 9 of 2015, which amends Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government.
2. Decentralization is the transfer of governmental responsibilities from the Central Government to autonomous regions, following the Autonomy Principle.
3. Deconcentration involves entrusting specific government responsibilities that fall under the jurisdiction of the Central Government to governors as representatives of the Central Government, vertical agencies in specific regions, and/or governors, regents, and mayors who are responsible for general government affairs.

4. Assistance tasks are mandates from the Central Government to autonomous regions, instructing them to execute certain governmental functions that are typically under the purview of the Central Government. Similarly, provincial Regional Governments may assign such tasks to regency/city Regions to handle specific government matters typically within the jurisdiction of provincial Regions.
5. Autonomous Regions, also known as regions, are recognized legal entities with defined territorial boundaries. They possess the authority to independently govern and oversee governmental matters and the welfare of local communities, guided by their own initiatives and the community's aspirations, all within the framework of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia (Permatasari et al., 2023).

Program Evaluation

Evaluation is part of the research. Evaluation is the process of collecting data to determine to what extent, in what terms, and how program objectives can be achieved. Evaluation is a tool for analyzing and assessing phenomena and applications of science. As an independent branch of science, evaluation science is supported by several theories. Evaluation is usually aimed at assessing the extent to which policies are effective in being accountable to the authorities (Hennink & Kaiser, 2022). Evaluation can see the extent to which goals have been achieved and to see the extent of the gap between expectations and reality. According to Anderson in Winarno, "In general, evaluation can be said to be an activity involving the estimation or assessment of policies which includes the substance, implementation, and impact of the implementation of the policy" (Saunders et al., 2019).

According to Suharsimi Arikunto, "Evaluation is an activity to collect information about how something works, which is then used to determine the right alternative in making decisions." Suchman views, "evaluation as a process of determining the results achieved by several planned activities to support the achievement of goals". Stufflebeam said that "evaluation is a process description, seeking and providing information that is useful for decision-makers in determining decision alternatives" (Yaïci et al., 2021).

From the definition of evaluation above, it can be concluded that evaluation is the process of measuring, assessing, and analyzing programs or policies to determine the results of the goals that have been set, as a guide for taking steps in the future. Program evaluation is a deliberate sequence of actions performed to assess the degree of achievement of a program. It's a purposeful endeavor aimed at determining the extent of success in the planned activities. As per Tyler, program evaluation serves as a means to ascertain the attainment of educational objectives. Additionally, in accordance with Cronbach and Stufflebeam, program evaluation represents an initiative to furnish decision-makers with valuable information (Fernandez et al., 2019).

Based on the aforementioned viewpoints, program evaluation can be summarized as a sequence of data gathering activities or the acquisition of scientific information, the outcomes of which can serve as a basis for decision-makers when formulating future program policies. Consequently, within the realm of successful program evaluation, two fundamental concepts come into play: effectiveness and efficiency. Effectiveness relates to the evaluation of outcomes in relation to inputs, whereas efficiency pertains to the extent to which inputs are optimally utilized to generate outputs through a specific process (Ding et al., 2020).

Program evaluation is anything that is done with the hope that it will bring results or benefits. Program evaluation can be carried out on some or all elements of program implementation. This is intended to see the extent to which the program has succeeded in

achieving the implementation objectives of the program that were previously determined. Without evaluation, the ongoing programs cannot see the level of achievement of their objectives. The implementation (implementation) of the program in achieving its objectives is determined by many interrelated factors. This shows that the entire program process is a system, therefore in carrying out evaluations there is a need for a systems approach and thinking systemically (Morley et al., 2021).

Performance in Bureaucracy

As per Wibowo, performance stems from its fundamental definition, which characterizes it as the outcome or achievement resulting from work. It revolves around the execution of tasks and the resulting accomplishments. On the other hand, Mahsun defines performance as an appraisal of the degree of accomplishment in the execution of activities, programs, or policies aimed at realizing an organization's goals, objectives, mission, and vision, as outlined in the organization's strategic planning. The term "performance" is frequently employed to gauge the success level of individuals or groups. Evaluating performance becomes possible when individuals or groups have established predefined success criteria, typically represented by specific goals or targets to be reached (Purwanto, 2022).

Sulistiyani describes performance as the amalgamation of abilities, exertion, and opportunities, as reflected in the outcomes of an individual's work. According to Mangkunegara, performance encompasses both the quality and quantity of work achievements or results attained by human resources in the execution of their work duties over a specified timeframe while carrying their designated responsibilities. Tika, on the other hand, defines performance as the consequences of an individual's or group's work functions or activities within an organization. These outcomes are influenced by a variety of factors and are directed toward accomplishing organizational objectives within a defined timeframe (Atmoko, 2022).

Pasolong distinguishes between two aspects of performance: employee performance and organizational performance. Employee performance represents the outcomes of individual work within an organization, while organizational performance encompasses the results achieved by the organization as a whole. These two aspects, employee performance and organizational performance, are interconnected, as the accomplishments of the organization are intrinsically linked to the performance of its employees. Separating the work results achieved by the organization from the performance of its employees is not feasible (Putra et al., 2020). As per Robbins, performance is characterized as the outcome of appraising the work executed by individuals in comparison to collectively established criteria. Moreover, according to Prawirosentono, performance signifies the achievements of an individual or group within an organization, executed within the scope of their respective authority and responsibilities, to legally accomplish the goals of the organization. This must be done without infringing upon the law and while adhering to ethical and moral standards (Alzoubi et al., 2022).

Basri defines performance as the outcome or degree of success achieved by an individual or a group over a specific timeframe when performing tasks, in comparison to various benchmarks such as standard work results, targets, objectives, or predetermined criteria that have been collectively established. Drawing from expert perspectives, one can infer that performance pertains to the work accomplishments of an employee or a group operating within an organization as they carry out tasks over a defined period. These achievements are evaluated according to specific research criteria or standards to contribute to the realization of the organization's goals (Hendri, 2019).

Method

The research method used in this research is a descriptive qualitative approach. This approach was chosen because this research aims to provide an in-depth picture of the impact of education and training programs on bureaucratic performance in local government. With a descriptive qualitative approach, research will focus on collecting descriptive data, qualitative analysis, and an in-depth understanding of the phenomenon being researched. The data used in this research comes from various research results and previous studies which are still relevant to the research topic. This approach allows the use of secondary data obtained from related literature to support research findings. The research data that has been collected will be analyzed carefully and thoroughly. Secondary data taken from previous research results will be used to support the findings of this research. The results of this analysis will be used to support research conclusions regarding the impact of education and training programs on bureaucratic performance in local government. Thus, the research methods used in this study provide a comprehensive framework for collecting, analyzing, and interpreting data that supports the findings of this study.

Result and Discussion

Program Evaluation Methodology

Program evaluation methodology is a key step in evaluating the effectiveness of education and training programs for local government officials. Program evaluation methodology first involves selecting an appropriate evaluation approach. In this research, the evaluation approach used can include formative and summative evaluation. Formative evaluation focuses on improving the program while the program is underway. This involves collecting data throughout program implementation to identify weaknesses and strengths and make necessary changes. Meanwhile, a summative evaluation is carried out after the program is completed, to evaluate the overall impact and results of the program. The combination of these two approaches can provide a comprehensive understanding of the effectiveness of education and training programs.

Evaluation indicators are a key element in assessing program effectiveness. These indicators are used to measure aspects relevant to the program, such as increases in knowledge, and skills and changes in behavior of program participants. For example, indicators could include increased participation rates in training programs, attendance rates, or improved test results after program completion. These indicators must be carefully designed to be relevant to the program's objectives and provide an accurate picture of its impact.

Data collection and analysis is an important stage in program evaluation methodology. Data can be obtained through a variety of methods, including surveys, document analysis, interviews, and performance measurements. Surveys can be used to collect data from program participants and related stakeholders. Document analysis involves searching for program-related documents, such as training materials and internal evaluation reports. Interviews can help in understanding program participants' and stakeholders' perceptions of program benefits. Performance measurements can be carried out before and after the program to identify changes that occur.

The use of various evaluation methods in this methodology provides a more complete and accurate picture of the impact of education and training programs for local government officials. Formative evaluation allows for ongoing monitoring during program implementation, allowing for immediate improvement of aspects that may not be working as planned. Meanwhile, summative evaluation helps in assessing the long-term impact of the program,

including whether long-term goals such as improving bureaucratic performance have been achieved. Thus, this approach allows researchers to combine the benefits of both approaches in an overall assessment of program effectiveness.

In addition, the development of appropriate evaluation indicators is very important to ensure that education and training programs can be evaluated properly. Good indicators must be under the program objectives, can be measured objectively, and be relevant to the expected results. By paying attention to this aspect, the program evaluation methodology can produce strong and reliable data that allows researchers to draw in-depth conclusions about the effectiveness of education and training programs in improving bureaucratic performance at the regional level.

Development of Education and Training Programs

The development of education and training programs for local government officials has undergone a significant transformation over time. Initially, these programs may focus only on providing basic knowledge and understanding of local government tasks. However, as government policies have evolved and needs have become more complex, education and training programs have evolved to become more comprehensive. They now cover a wide range of training materials that reflect the dynamics of change within regional bureaucracies, including public financial management, human resource management, and innovation in public services. Thus, the evolution of these programs reflects efforts to ensure that local government officials are prepared to face the increasingly complex challenges in the local government environment.

Apart from developments in training materials, the content of education and training programs also includes the teaching methods and curriculum used. These programs have evolved to include more interactive and application-oriented teaching methods. It includes a more practical and applied approach that allows program participants to relate theoretical concepts to real situations in local government. Additionally, the curriculum has been enriched with elements that promote leadership, ethics, and effective communication skills. All of this is a response to increasing demands on local government officials to be competent and innovative leaders in solving local government problems.

This development is an indication of the regional government's commitment to ensuring that their officials continue to develop and adapt to ongoing changes in the regional bureaucratic environment. This also reflects efforts to improve the quality of public services and decision-making at the local level. By continually updating and improving their education and training programs, local governments can better meet the demands of society and face the increasingly complex challenges of local governance.

In addition to the evolution of teaching materials and methods, changes in information technology have also played a significant role in the development of education and training programs for local government officials. Now, these programs are increasingly integrating technology into their training approach. Training materials that were previously delivered conventionally are now often available in digital format, which allows program participants to access them flexibly and independently. Online training is also becoming more common, allowing wider access, especially in situations where face-to-face meetings may be limited. By utilizing technology, education and training programs can reach participants more efficiently and accommodate various learning styles.

In addition, current local government education and training programs also tend to emphasize sustainable approaches. Such programs can include curricula that focus on long-

term career building, with advanced training offerings that enable local government officials to continually improve their qualifications throughout their careers. This reflects an understanding that education and training should not only focus on improving initial qualifications but also consider the long-term development needs of local government officials. Thus, education and training programs continue to adapt to changes in the environment and the demands of local government officials to play an effective role in the dynamic regional government bureaucracy.

Challenges in Program Implementation

Challenges in implementing education and training programs for local government officials are often things that must be overcome to ensure the success of the program. One of the main challenges is financial constraints. These programs require sufficient funding allocation to carry out comprehensive and quality training. A lack of budget can hinder optimal program implementation, especially in situations where local governments experience significant budget pressure. Therefore, planning and managing financial resources is key to overcoming this obstacle.

In addition to financial constraints, resistance from some local government officials can be a challenge. Some officers may feel uncomfortable with the changes presented by education and training programs, or they may feel that the programs are not relevant to their jobs. Building support and commitment from relevant local government officials is an important element in overcoming resistance. Additionally, a deeper understanding of the needs and concerns of program participants can also help design programs that better suit their context.

On the other hand, successful education and training programs can bring various benefits to local governments and their participants. Success factors in program implementation involve strong leadership support, which encourages full commitment to the program. Additionally, programs that offer relevant and practical learning experiences for local government officials tend to be more successful. In this context, education and training programs must be designed to provide knowledge and skills that can be directly applied to participants' daily tasks. By understanding these success factors, local governments can optimize the implementation of their education and training programs and improve bureaucratic performance at the local level.

Challenges in implementing education and training programs are also often related to environmental factors that may be beyond the control of local governments. Changes in national policy or changes in local politics may affect the sustainability and focus of these programs. In some cases, changes in leadership in local government can also result in changes in priorities and budgets that can affect program continuity. Therefore, education and training programs must be designed with flexibility to be able to cope with these changes and remain relevant in various political and social contexts.

However, not all challenges in program implementation are negative. Sometimes, these challenges can be opportunities to improve the program. For example, challenges in the form of policy changes or developments in information technology can encourage programs to become more responsive and innovative. Success factors in overcoming these challenges involve the ability to adapt and change programs to new demands. By remaining open to change and utilizing challenges as opportunities, education and training programs can become more effective and relevant in supporting the development of bureaucratic performance in local government.

The Impact of Education and Training Programs on Bureaucratic Performance

The impact of education and training programs on bureaucratic performance in local government is very important to evaluate. One of the most striking impacts is the improvement in the performance of local government officials. Effective training programs can help improve the qualifications, knowledge, and skills of officers, which in turn can bring about positive changes in the performance of their duties. This can be reflected in increased efficiency, improved decision-making processes, and higher-quality public services. In the long term, this performance improvement can also have a positive impact on local government governance and provide significant benefits for the community.

Apart from improving the performance of local government officials, the impact of education and training programs can also be felt by the community. Successful programs can lead to improvements in the quality of public services provided by local governments. This creates higher public satisfaction because people receive more efficient and effective services. Additionally, improvements in governance and transparency that may be achieved through training programs can also increase people's trust in their local government. Therefore, the impact of education and training programs is felt not only within the bureaucracy but also throughout the community, creating positive changes in the quality of public services and the relationship between local governments and their communities.

The positive impact of education and training programs can also be seen in increasing the ability of local government officials to respond to changes occurring in the external environment. Communities and surrounding environments are always changing, and skilled and trained local government officials are better able to deal with these changes. Effective training programs can provide the knowledge and skills necessary to adapt to new developments, whether in terms of technology, public policy, or societal demands. This enables local governments to remain relevant and efficient in providing services and carrying out their duties, even amidst a rapidly changing environment.

In addition, the positive impact of education and training programs can be seen in improving relations between officials and stakeholders in local government. These programs often create opportunities for officials from various units and levels to interact and collaborate. This can result in strong networks and relationships between local government officials, which in turn can help solve problems more effectively and stimulate innovation. By fostering cooperation and mutual support, education and training programs can strengthen cohesion within the bureaucracy and support collective efforts to improve local government performance.

Influence of External Factors

The influence of external factors in education and training programs for local government officials cannot be ignored. One aspect that needs to be considered is the linkage of these programs with existing national and regional policies. Education and training programs in local government must be in line with national policy directions which may set certain priorities in the development of human resources in the government sector. These linkages are important to ensure that local programs support the larger goals of the country or region. For example, if national policy emphasizes innovation in public services, training programs in local government should reflect this focus and help local government officials develop relevant innovation skills.

In addition, external factors such as economic, demographic, and social conditions can also influence the impact of education and training programs. In tough economic times,

sometimes resources for training programs may be limited, and local governments must find creative solutions to maintain training quality. Demographics also play a role, as changes in the composition of local government officials retiring or joining the bureaucracy can influence training needs. Meanwhile, social factors, such as societal dynamics and public expectations, can influence the focus of training programs, with programs perhaps having to respond to popular or controversial issues. Therefore, understanding and adapting to these external factors is important to maintain the relevance and positive impact of education and training programs in an ever-changing context.

In the context of links with national policies, cooperation between local governments and central or regional governments is very important. Education and training programs in local government must be able to communicate and coordinate with relevant government agencies responsible for policy and human resource development at the national or regional level. This enables the exchange of knowledge and best practices that can support education and training programs in local government. By building strong collaboration, these programs can become more efficient and better aligned with broader goals.

The importance of understanding the economic, demographic, and social context should not be overlooked. Education and training programs must be able to respond to external dynamics that may influence community needs and demands as well as economic development. For example, in situations where the public expects public services to be more responsive and efficient, training programs must be able to produce local government officials who are ready to face this challenge. Additionally, in the face of demographic changes, training programs can be designed to help local governments manage the succession of retiring officials and prepare a new generation of officials. With a deep understanding of these external factors, education and training programs can be better targeted and have a greater positive impact.

Conclusion

In the context of education and training programs for local government officials, the conclusion that can be drawn is that these programs have a significant impact on the performance of the bureaucracy and public services at the local level. The evolution of education and training programs reflects the commitment of local governments to respond to increasingly complex demands and ongoing changes in the local government environment. Comprehensive program content and innovative teaching methods have provided improved qualifications and skills of local government officials, which in turn increased effectiveness in their duties. This positive impact also permeates society through better public services, which creates higher public satisfaction and improves relations between local governments and their communities. However, in implementing education and training programs, local governments must face several challenges. Financial constraints and resistance from some local government officials may slow the implementation of these programs. However, successful programs have the support of strong leadership and can handle resistance by understanding the needs of local government officials. External factors such as national policies, economic conditions, demographics, and social demands also influence the impact of education and training programs. By adapting to these changes and exploiting challenges as opportunities, education and training programs can be more efficient in achieving their goals and support improved bureaucratic performance and public services in local governments. In conclusion, education and training programs play a vital role in the formation of a more competent, efficient, and responsive bureaucracy at the local government level, which ultimately provides benefits to society and the entire community.

References

- Adriani, Z., & Hikmah, N. (2022). Human Resources in Education: Training and Work Motivation on Teacher Performance. *Indonesian Research Journal in Education/IRJE/*, 6(1), 155-167.
- Akan, M. (2023). A confiscated trajectory of secularism: revisiting the critical case of Turkey. *Politics, Religion & Ideology*, 1-25.
- Alzoubi, H. M., Ghazal, T. M., Sahawneh, N., & Al-kassem, A. H. (2022). Fuzzy assisted human resource management for supply chain management issues. *Annals of Operations Research*.
- Atmoko, A. D. (2022). Influence Of Organizational Culture, Education, And Training On Employee Performance With Motivation As Variable Intervention. *International Journal of Economics, Business and Accounting Research (IJEBAAR)*, 6(3), 2169-2176.
- Bryant, J., & Thomson, G. (2021). Learning as a key leverage point for sustainability transformations: a case study of a local government in Perth, Western Australia. *Sustainability Science*, 16, 795-807.
- Chaves-Avila, R., & Gallego-Bono, J. R. (2020). Transformative policies for the social and solidarity economy: The new generation of public policies fostering the social economy in order to achieve sustainable development goals. The European and Spanish cases. *Sustainability*, 12(10), 4059.
- Ding, R. X., Palomares, I., Wang, X., Yang, G. R., Liu, B., Dong, Y., ... & Herrera, F. (2020). Large-Scale decision-making: Characterization, taxonomy, challenges and future directions from an Artificial Intelligence and applications perspective. *Information fusion*, 59, 84-102.
- Dutta, A., & Fischer, H. W. (2021). The local governance of COVID-19: Disease prevention and social security in rural India. *World Development*, 138, 105234.
- Fagan, A. A., Bumbarger, B. K., Barth, R. P., Bradshaw, C. P., Cooper, B. R., Supplee, L. H., & Walker, D. K. (2019). Scaling up evidence-based interventions in US public systems to prevent behavioral health problems: Challenges and opportunities. *Prevention Science*, 20, 1147-1168.
- Fernandez, M. E., Ten Hoor, G. A., Van Lieshout, S., Rodriguez, S. A., Beidas, R. S., Parcel, G., ... & Kok, G. (2019). Implementation mapping: using intervention mapping to develop implementation strategies. *Frontiers in public health*, 7, 158.
- Hariyanto, H. (2022). Implications of State Policy Through Village Funds Towards the Cultural Values of Mutual Cooperation in the Village. *De Lega Lata: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum*, 7(1), 46-64.
- Hendri, M. I. (2019). The mediation effect of job satisfaction and organizational commitment on the organizational learning effect of the employee performance. *International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management*, 68(7), 1208-1234.
- Hennink, M., & Kaiser, B. N. (2022). Sample sizes for saturation in qualitative research: A systematic review of empirical tests. *Social science & medicine*, 292, 114523.
- Karakose, T., Polat, H., & Papadakis, S. (2021). Examining teachers' perspectives on school principals' digital leadership roles and technology capabilities during the COVID-19 pandemic. *Sustainability*, 13(23), 13448.

- Manoharan, A. P., Ingrams, A., Kang, D., & Zhao, H. (2021). Globalization and worldwide best practices in E-Government. *International Journal of Public Administration*, 44(6), 465-476.
- Morley, G., Field, R., Horsburgh, C. C., & Burchill, C. (2021). Interventions to mitigate moral distress: A systematic review of the literature. *International Journal of Nursing Studies*, 121, 103984.
- Omrani, O. E., Dafallah, A., Paniello Castillo, B., Amaro, B. Q. R. C., Taneja, S., Amzil, M., ... & Ezzine, T. (2020). Envisioning planetary health in every medical curriculum: an international medical student organization's perspective. *Medical teacher*, 42(10), 1107-1111.
- Permatasari, Y., Jinaratana, A., Hadiwinata, C., Yapputro, P. A., & Najmi, M. S. (2023). Regional Autonomy in the Context of Regional Regulations. *Asian Journal of Social and Humanities*, 1(09), 431-439.
- Purwanto, A. (2022). Tourist satisfaction and performance of tourism industries: how the role of innovative work behaviour, organizational citizenship behaviour?. *Journal of Industrial Engineering & Management Research*.
- Putra, A. R., Hariani, M., Nurmalasari, D., Irfan, M., & Al Hakim, Y. R. (2020). Role of Work Environment and Organizational Culture to Job Performance. *Journal of Islamic Economics Perspectives*, 1(2), 1-13.
- Saunders, A., Messer, L. H., & Forlenza, G. P. (2019). MiniMed 670G hybrid closed loop artificial pancreas system for the treatment of type 1 diabetes mellitus: overview of its safety and efficacy. *Expert review of medical devices*, 16(10), 845-853.
- Tao, R., Su, C. W., Naqvi, B., & Rizvi, S. K. A. (2022). Can Fintech development pave the way for a transition towards low-carbon economy: A global perspective. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 174, 121278.
- Yaïci, W., Krishnamurthy, K., Entchev, E., & Longo, M. (2021). Recent advances in Internet of Things (IoT) infrastructures for building energy systems: A review. *Sensors*, 21(6), 2152.
- Yunida, H., & Sarifah, I. (2023). Meta Analysis of the Influence of Training on Work Productivity. *East Asian Journal of Multidisciplinary Research*, 2(6), 2605-2618.
- Zhang, X., Wong, J. L., & Wang, X. (2022). How do the leadership strategies of middle leaders affect teachers' learning in schools? A case study from China. *Professional Development in Education*, 48(3), 444-461.