

Global Social Movements (GSMs) and Non-Governmental Organizations: Investigating the Impact on Global Social Change

by Muhammad Septiadi

Submission date: 20-Feb-2024 06:44PM (UTC+0700)

Submission ID: 2265779956

File name: 65-89_nandy.pdf (261.21K)

Word count: 9769

Character count: 57061

3 **Global Social Movements (GSMs) and Non-Governmental Organizations: Investigating the Impact on Global Social Change**

Debasish Nandy

29
Kazi Nazrul University Asansol, West Bengal, India
E-mail: debasishnandy.kc@gmail.com

Abstract

Global Social Movements (GSMs) have become integral to the study of Sociology and International Politics, reflecting the interconnectedness of global communities on diverse issues. Orchestrated by NGOs and INGOs, GSMs encompass environmental, women's, human rights, racial, fair trade, and refugee movements, among others, reflecting the breadth of global concerns. However, challenges arise from political affiliations between civil society members and state authorities, as well as pressures from donor countries and ruling elites in economically disadvantaged nations. This study, employing content analysis methodology, aims to delineate the causes of GSMs, investigate the roles of INGOs and civil society, and explore the interplay between GSMs and global governance. Through critical analysis, it provides insights and recommendations to enhance the effectiveness and inclusivity of GSMs in addressing global challenges, thus contributing to the advancement of global democracy and governance structures.

Keywords: global social movements, civil society, NGO, INGO, social change, global community.

INTRODUCTION

Global social movements have become a significant topic in the field of International Politics in recent times. These movements are organized by the global community across various regions and countries, addressing issues that are specific to a particular country, region, or the world at large. The involvement of NGOs and INGOs is crucial in these movements, which have different dimensions, aspects, and strategies. The movements are often categorized based on their general character of strategy and tactics. In the era of globalization, global social movements are interrelated with the concept of global governance, with some scholars arguing that they contribute to democracy in the global arena, while others refute this argument. The major global social movements include environmental,

women's, human rights, racial, fair trade, and refugee movements, among others, and are also linked to the North-South debate. The role of civil society in social movements is essential, but political connections between civil society members and state authorities or political parties have negatively impacted global social movements. Capitalist states often disrupt these movements, and economically challenged and debt-strapped countries face impediments due to the pressure of donor countries and ruling elites.

The involvement of civil society in social movements is crucial; however, it has been observed that political affiliations between civil society members and state authorities or political parties have had adverse effects on global social movements. The capitalist states often disrupt global social movements, and economically challenged and debt-stricken countries face obstacles due to the pressure exerted by donor countries and ruling elites. The emergence of social movements worldwide has added a new dimension to the study of International Relations, and ongoing debates surround their trends. Although social movements have been recognized in the theoretical discourse of International Relations, their considerable diversity is manifested differently due to the nature of state actors and the various structures of the world order. R.B.J Walker (1994) has noted that social movements face a dilemma between their 'inner-societal' nature and the 'outer-societal' nature of global politics. The location of social movements, the response of civil society, and the nature of politics determine the sustainability and nature of social movements worldwide. If civil society positively corresponds to social movements, it indicates an actively working pro-democratic culture.

This paper aims to achieve five objectives: (1) to delineate the causes of global social movements, (2) to investigate the role of INGOs in global social movements, (3) to explore the role of domestic and international civil society in social movements, (4) to identify the interrelations between global governance and global social movements, and (5) to identify representational deficiencies in GSMs. This paper will address 5 research questions, such as (1) What are the basic reasons for global social movements? What is the role of INGOs in global social movements? (2) What is the role of domestic and international civil society in global social movements? (3) What is the relationship between global governance and global social movements? And (5) What are the representational deficiencies in GSMs?

LITERATURE REVIEW

Some literature has been reviewed to develop this paper. P. Almeida and C. C. Dunn (2018) in their research paper titled 'Globalization and Social Movements' published in *Annual Review of Sociology* have argued that in the era of globalization, social movements have been globalized. J. Beinín (2014) in a research paper titled 'Civil Society, NGOs, and Egypt's 2011 Popular Uprising' published in *South Atlantic Quarterly* discussed the role of NGOs and civil society during the popular uprising in Egypt. S.M. Buechler (2000) In his book titled *Social Movements in Advanced Capitalism. The Political Economy of the Cultural Construction of Social Activism* has delineated the degree of social movements in the capitalist system. B. Buzan, and G. Lawson (2016) in their research paper titled 'Theory, History, and the Global Transformation' published in *International Theory analyzed the theory, history, and global transformation of social movements* they discussed on history of the global transformation of social movements. A.M. Peña and T. Davies (2019) argued in their research paper titled 'Social Movements and International Relations: A Relational' Framework published in the *Journal of International Relations and Development* that there is an impact of global social movements in International Relations. Tabar (2016) discussed critically in this research paper titled 'Gaza's humanitarianism problem' published *Journal of Palestine Studies* discussed on humanitarian problem of Gaza. C. Rootes (1999) in his paper titled 'Environmental movements: From the Local to the Global' published in *Environmental Politics* argued for the essence of social movements from local to global. M. Zin (2016) in his paper titled 'Politics of Civil Society in Hybrid Regime' published in *Myanmar Quarterly* analyzed about the role of civil society in Myanmar.

RESEARCH METHODS

In this investigation, the utilization of content analysis and observation techniques will be implemented. The primary objective of this essay is to undertake a critical examination of novel perspectives on the worldwide social movement and propose recommendations for unexplored avenues of investigation. The research methodology employed in this study involves the application of content analysis and observation methods. Within the framework of content analysis, diverse sources including books, journals, newspapers, and various reports are scrutinized based on their existing content. Content analysis serves as a valuable approach

to identifying specific terms, ideas, or themes within a qualitative dataset. This study utilizes content analysis to gauge and explore the occurrence, importance, and interrelationships of specific words, notions, or themes. Content analysis has been molded and characterized, in part, by the field of content analysis. This methodology commences with scrutinizing the text's conceptual attributes, subsequently delving into areas such as unitization and sampling. Ultimately, it furnishes readers with an illustration of how to execute the analytical procedures and employ evaluation techniques. Over the years the trends of global social movements have been observed through media and the nature of the movements has been detected differently. However, this study has borrowed various reports, books, journals, and newspaper sources.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A Background of the Global Social Movements

The contribution of the English School and social systems theory to the study of global social movements in international relations is significant. The English School offers a comprehensive perspective on the orientations of social movements within the world political structure. Ian Clark recognizes social movements as a sub-differentiation within a world society that necessitates a holistic approach in its interaction with the international society of states (Clark 2007). The English School raises questions regarding the autonomy of world society and presents a normative approach that suggests interaction with various structural domains. This approach is crucial in diversifying the understanding of structural phenomena in International Relations (Buzan and Lawson 2016). Neorealist thinkers face confusion regarding the visibility and causal relations between civil society and International Relations. White (2019) argues that their state-centric approach to intergovernmental cooperation overlooks the role of non-state actors such as social movements.

Similarly, Mansbach & Ferguson (2021) accuses Constructivists of also adopting a 'state-centric' approach. However, it is interesting to note that they acknowledge the significance of ideas in international learning and social change. Most theories indirectly recognize the role of civil society in social movements. Paul (2018) emphasizes that Classical Liberal Theory highlights the importance of public opinion as a means to address international problems. This

theory views public opinion as a remedy for resolving such issues. It is important to note that social movements should not be solely understood as pressure groups, as Lebow (2020) argues. He emphasizes the connection between social movements and ideologies of peace and war, highlighting the participation of both pacifists and anti-pacifists. Furthermore, he suggests that militarist ideology can also be reflected in social movements, thereby presenting a wider variety of sociopolitical perspectives.

European and American scholars have been emphasizing social movements from a political perspective. For the last two decades, they have been trying to mobilize social movements politically. Comprehensively, scholars of Western countries are trying to contextualize social movements in national, regional, and local political contexts. Bretos & Marcuello (2017) argued that globalization infers the formation and escalation of worldwide social relations that link different localities. The advancement of communication enormously helped to establish interconnectivity among the various social movements and actors. The across-national political conflicts have been manifested in international relations through global social movements. The activities of supranational political institutions, and relevant issues of international, and national politics have been an integral part of the global social movement ⁴¹ in the era of globalization. The social movements are not new, but it has been organically started in the 1970s and 1980s to address the various social crises.

However, ⁶ social movements have a deep history that is often ignored by social movement studies. The roots of social movements have been laid in European history. In the ⁶ eighteenth century, revolutions found a powerful voice in nineteenth-century labor movements and gathered pace with the advances of mass democracy in the twentieth century. In the 1970s, the notion of new social movements was started across the globe, and later on, it was popularized in academic discourse. Conventionally, ⁷ the traditional doctrine of state sovereignty differentiates between private and public domains. It was thought that the only state could hold sovereignty and no anti-state demonstration was permitted within the state. Globalization makes the state answerable for its activities. Smith et al (2017) opined that ⁷ the activities of various opposition and anti-system movements offer one such path. Due to numerous reasons, social movements were started across the globe to address the issues related to state policies and the enormous growth of capitalism. Now, the state is concurrently

nested in both the international and domestic systems. With a rational outlook, the state tries to coexist there with societal actors to avoid the hazards.

Why Global Social Movements?

The nature of social movement has been changed in the 1990s. The social movements emerged as a reaction to globalization. Global Social movements are inevitable in the era of globalization for several reasons– (1) to protest against the neoliberal global economy, (2) to demonstrate against capitalism. (3) Global social movements are essentially required to protect human rights, (4) to stop global warming, and to protect the environment. (5) to stop violence against women. (6) to stop nuclear competition and stop war and violence peace movement is required. In an era of globalization, the states are interdependent, so the effect of any issue affects another country. Issues like the aggressive nature of capitalism, over environmental or ecological disasters, have been very alarming for human society. The dignity of the individual or a particular community can be protected by the global social movement. There are some common issues on which the global community can be united to protect the deprived section of society.

Various Global Social Movements

The inevitability of social movements in the study of international politics has been noticed. The growth of various social movements has inevitably affected the contemporary theories of social movements. New approaches and concepts have been developed to address the problems of new social movements. Until the 1960s, mainstream theories viewed social movements mostly in terms of collective behavior, but now alternative theories have been created to justify the variability of diverse social movements. Now, global social movements are based on human rights, gender disparity, identity crises, environmental or ecological disasters, armaments, nuclearization, or state operations. Almeida (2019) has identified six types of social movements—**Firstly**, Resistance in everyday forms of movement, **Secondly**, some movements emanated from the local level which are grassroots movements, **Thirdly**, every country has been experiencing national social movements, **Fourthly**, waves of movements create multiple movements, **Fifthly**, some movements are revolutionary, and **Sixthly**, transnational social movements which operated in transboundary level. All types of these movements are linked with politics. The nature of the

politics of a country is very vital in considering the space of the movement. There is a common perception that in a liberal democratic country, the variety of social movements is much wider than the military regime, autocratic, or monarchical regimes. However, this does not apply to all so-called liberal countries. The nature of the constitution often defers from the nature of the politics of a country.

The very nature of the ruling elites can make obstacles to the free exercise of social movements. Several political issues were raised for the collective ²²efforts of transnational social movements, INGOs, and transnational advocacy (Smith et al., 2018). Three more things are very important for transnational social movements ¹⁵(1) First because international organizations have little coercive power at their disposal, they must rely on soft enforcement mechanisms involving information, and persuasion. (2) The dynamics and interactions of social movements at a national and international level are varied. (3) The national-level organizations try to extend ²²their cooperation and influence across borders to propagate the social movements to get international support. However, the major social movements in the globalized world economic-issue-based.

1. **Feminist movements or women's movements** have achieved prior attention by social scientists. The feminist movements are multidimensional. In the study of International Relations, the Women's movements have been viewed from the perspective of globalization and structural adjustment policies (Crossley and Hurwitz, 2013). Women activists and Feminist ideologues argued that the subjugation of women is a hard fact that is present around the globe. In society, the economic sphere, politics, and even in the workplace women are very marginalized. In private sectors or corporate sectors, the jobs of women are very uncertain and they are often being assaulted by male colleagues. The lagging dignity of women around the globe has been a common phenomenon. In Bangladesh, a large portion of women are working in garment industries, but in terms of human security and dignity, they are in very vulnerable conditions. So, they often demonstrate for the betterment of the working workplace. ¹²In Mexico, women are demonstrating for better work conditions and higher wages. In Uruguay, after a long struggle, domestic women workers have gained legal status with ⁵the country's formal workforce. In India, launched Narmada Bachao movement to build an environmentally sound dam in the 1970s and onwards.

That movement also continued to organize for land and water rights for the displaced people. Kimura (2019) argued that women can be manifested in the form of anti-militarization. The nature and orientation of Feminist movements immensely depend upon economic, and cultural processes, religious, social, ethnic, age, caste, identities, racial and demographic factors.

5 The women's movements have a wide variety—some are unique and some are hybrid. 5 Feminist movements seek to advance the status of women and are informed by feminist ideologies. The vibrancy and effectiveness of women's movements are highly dependent 16 upon the nature of the civil society and state, the rate of literacy, and the overall socio-economic 16 conditions of the respective country. All women's movements do not have intellectual support from the Feminists. 5 In the 1960s and 1970s, feminist movements were classified as liberal, radical, or socialist (Crossley and Hurwitz, 2013). The occurrence of antifeminist opposition through history across the implication 12 of the family, sexuality, reproduction, and outdated gendered measures for the maintenance of the leading social order 5 Women's movements mobilize not only to make claims against the state and the government, but they also target other institutional and cultural arenas (Basu, 2018). The global women's rights movements 23 argue to end gender violence ensure sexual choice and promote reproductive rights and women's health (Nandy, 2023). After the Beijing Conference on Women (1995) the issue of women's empowerment and security started to get priority. Due to overwhelming pressure on governments by worldwide women's organizations to eliminate gender disparity, about 189 states in the world have promised to make a common program for women. After the Beijing conference, the women's movement started to receive support and recognition from various international forums. From 8th March 2000 to 19th October 2000, in 140 countries millions of women demonstrated against the developmental model for women in the globalized world.

1. **Environmental movements** have been universal social movements. Today, environmental movements and environmental organizations have been key issues of contemporary international politics. These two not only strongly influenced global politics but also immensely helped the revitalization of civil society (Teo, 2023). There are several problems with the environment. In the post Cold-War era, environmental crisis, ecological disasters, and global warming got momentum (Nandy, 2020). Due to massive industrialization, urbanization, the use of motor vehicles, and modernization

of social life pollution and global warming are rapidly increasing. The emission of greenhouse gases makes the environment highly polluted. Various gasses, particularly carbon dioxide and carbon monoxide are emitted into the air. With the rapid use of air conditioners, Frieze, and increasing the number of motor vehicles temperature of the earth is gradually increasing. The sea level is increasing due to the melting of ice of mountains. In the name of modernization and urbanization, the process of deforestation is rapidly increasing across the globe. Another alarming effect of global warming is the reduction of ozone layers. The extensive use of fossil fuels caused a high level of pollution. Numerous environmental movements took place in different countries. The level of environmental movements is in two-way directions—from local to global and global to local.

There is a long history of human concern about the environment. Enduring efforts have been made to conserve natural resources, and several protests were made against air pollution. To stop the devastating testing of nuclear weapons many campaigns and protest moments took place across the globe. Environmental activism has been shown at different times ³⁶for various reasons and in various forms. The German environmental movement is the pioneer of alerting the universe about the importance of the environment. The environmental movements have been an integral part of mainstream politics. For the last 40 years, the environmental movements have gained remarkable speed due to worldwide environmental conferences, and transnational agreements on environmental protection. Global Environment Facility and WTO have been inevitable non-state actors in the interaction between environmental-related NGOs ¹³(Martinez-Alier et al., 2016).

World-wide awareness ²⁶has been increased due to the rapid growth of the ecological crisis which led to widespread protest movements by civil society members and organizations. The Bhopal gas tragedy of India (1984), the nuclear disaster in Russia ¹⁸(1986), the Alaskan oil spill from the Exxon Valdez tanker in 1989, the Gulf War in the early 1990s, the Fukushima Daiichi nuclear accident of Japan (2011), Visakhapatnam gas linkage incident of India (2020) is some examples of ecological hazards. Since the 1970s, the concerns of the environment have produced new social, political, and ecological movements (Martinez-Alier et al., 2016). The environmental movements are being considered as 'new social movements. Because these movements are not economic or class-based. All sections of the people are associated

with these movements. The conservation movements have been started as a part of environmental movements that aim to conserve natural resources and forests. Several environmental protection organizations have been formed for the protection and preservation organizations, such as Green Network the Greenpeace Friends of the Earth, etc. The UNO is seriously concerned about the importance of the environment. In 1972, the first conference on the human environment was organized by the UNO in Stockholm. The most significant environmental conference was held in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil in 1992 to discuss the crucial issues of environmental disaster. Around one thousand NGOs participated in that conference.

1. **The Human Rights Movement** as a social movement occupies a prime position in the study of Social Science. The human rights movement emerged as a social movement from the 1960s onwards (Stammers, 2009). In the post-World War II period, civil society actors have been working with strong countries to ensure human rights for the global community. Human rights are not only violated in post-colonial Afro-Asian states but also in so-called developed countries. In Pakistan, human rights are grossly violated due to non-democratic forces (Nandy, 2017). The same thing is also happening in Afghanistan (2024). The black movement in the USA and South Africa is not only considered a simple anti-racial movement but also treated as a human rights movement. The overextending goals of the human rights movement can give rise to a strong backlash against human rights principles (McGregor, 2019). Human rights NGOs are not impartial and non-biased. The Israeli human-rights NGOs are never critical of the Israeli aggression on Palestine. Israel actively promotes the humanitarian frame-based movement, but itself violates the human rights of the Palestine people through regular military attacks (Tabar, 2016). On the other hand, Palestinian NGOs are working on the issue of human rights violations in Palestinian people (Montell, 2016).

Human rights are highly vulnerable in West Asia, Afghanistan, Pakistan, and Myanmar due to so many reasons. The war-torn West Asian countries and Afghanistan have experienced casualties of reckless wars and terrorism. Pakistan has witnessed state-sponsored terrorism and militancy which resulted in thousands of deaths. People of Yemen, Jordan, Syria, Lebanon, and Iraq have had the experience of hunger, health crisis, and the crisis of shelter. Many people fled to relatively safe countries. Human

rights are seriously challenged in these countries. There are a few indigenous NGOs in these countries that are strongly protesting the violation of human rights, but INGOs across the globe are actively struggling to ensure human rights for the people of these countries. However, in the 1970s, human rights became a concern of NGOs and NGOs started to pressure their governments to protect human rights. Activists created organizations promoting the rights of prisoners, leftists, Islamists, dissidents, women, and the poor.

In West Asia, human rights have been challenging due to overwhelmingly undemocratic acts of the political masters. However, despite obstacles, from the 1980s onwards some human rights movements were conducted by lawyers, political partisans, and intellectuals across the region to advocate human rights. Many NGOs are very supportive of the Palestinian struggle. There are basic reasons for human rights violations in West Asia-(1) the Absence of democratic regimes, (2) the absence of vibrant civil society, (3) wars and civil wars, and (4) terrorism. The autocracy of Mummer Gadhafi of Libya resulted in gross human rights violations. It was very difficult to protest against Gadhafi during his time for violation of human rights. It was also a tough task for NGOs or INGOs to work in Libya for work for victimized people. During the regime of Saddam Hussain, a massive human rights violation was found. During 1988-1989, the Iraqi force was directed by President Saddam Hussein to kill the Kurds of Iraq. More than 3000 villages were destroyed, and more than 182000 people were murdered by the army & and security forces, telecommunication forces, and intelligence (Zadeh, and Shafiee, 2017). This is the worst example of state-sponsored human rights violations.

The post-Saddam era also witnessed a massive human rights violation. After occupying Iraq, the US forces arrested suspected criminals and sent them to Abu Ghraib prison. Massive mistreatment of prisoners of war at Abu Ghraib generated huge criticism. The role of the USA has been questioned due to violations of human rights in Iraq. In a fragile state system where democracy does not work properly, and people are scattered with ethnoreligious identities, then vibrant human rights movement cannot be formed. Presently, approximately 40,000 Marsh Arabs are living in refugee camps in Iran. There are a few organizations in Iraq that used to protest for human rights violations and work for the protection of human rights. In 2005, the Hammurabi Human Rights Organization was established in Iraq as an NGO to work on

ensuring human rights, not for only Iraqi people but also for the Yezidis, Sabian, Manddaen, Tucuman, Armenians, and others.

In Tunisia, Palestine, Egypt, and Morocco human rights activists initiated to form NGOs for launching the human rights movement. These countries were among the first that had succeeded in establishing national NGOs to serve the purposes. In 1967, the Tunisian League for Human Rights was founded. Other human rights-based NGOs were formed in subsequent years, and LTDH is one of them. The Moroccan Association for Human Rights was founded in 1979 to organize civil demands. In Morocco, after the end of the 1980s there was a new change in activities of human rights-based NGOs due to the formation of the Moroccan Organisation for Human Rights (Ashford, 2015). The issue of the human rights movement in Myanmar is questionable. For a long time, the human rights movement was not permitted in Myanmar due to brutal military regimes. Even, for a long time, the peaceful assembly for human rights was not bothered by the military government.

In 2013, after the passing of The Peaceful Assembly and Peaceful Procession Act, the people of Myanmar gathered and demanded public concern. But it is very restricted, before going for any demonstration taking advance approval from the government is mandatory. The origin of civil society in Myanmar is deeply rooted in social, and cultural norms and religious practices. Before 2011, there was no visibility of civil society. The civil society during and democratic transition of 2011 (Zin, 2016). However, human rights in Myanmar are severely challenged by state-imposed restrictions. The role of weak civil society and local NGOs is questionable due to silence on Rohingya persecution. It was expected that After the establishment of democracy, irrespective of ethnicity, religion, language, and other identities all would be equally protected. However, after violent acts of the state apparatus over the Rohingya community, the NGOs and civil society did not react on humanitarian grounds. The human rights movement in China and North Korea is not allowed. In Japan, South Korea, the Philippines, and Singapore, the role of civil society and NGOs in promoting human rights is quite satisfactory. The role of civil society and NGOs or INGOs is immensely dependent upon the nature of the society and state.

1. **The anti-nuclear movement** is one of the most powerful movements in the post-World War II era. Armament, arms race, and nuclear competitions among the nation-states got started after World War II. After the horrific experience of nuclear bombs in

Japan in 1945, the entire global community was afraid of the further use of nuclear weapons. The world has witnessed several tests of nuclear weapons. Nuclear power is simultaneously used both for mankind and military purposes. The anti-nuclear movement was started in the 1970s. So many initiatives were taken by the UNO, and other international agencies, even by the states. Several international forums have argued for non-proliferation and not using nuclear devices. This is a very interesting thing that nuclear-powered countries like France have also witnessed the anti-nuclear protests by civilians. In terms of electricity production in the 1980s, France had become the world's foremost nuclear power country. The anti-nuclear movement was also found in Germany, but the anti-nuclear energy movement was not so strong there. Finland has a great contribution to minimizing nuclear completions in the world. In 1960, the international nuclear weapons pacifism was formed in Finland.

The United Nations initiated multilateral disarmament negotiations. However, with a global outlook, the anti-nuclear movement is multidimensional because of its connections with the pacifist movement, ideological movement, environmental movement, and human security-based movement. In the 1980s, the communist groups in the USA demonstrated against Ronald Regan's nuclear policy and well war policy. The Anti-Vietnam movement was also raised in the USA and Europe. In the USA, several professional-based organizations such as associations were hard-core against Reagan's politics. The anti-nuclear weapons movement was encouraged by European mass demonstrations. After the testing of nuclear bombs at Pokhran of Rajasthan in 1974 and 1998, the anti-nuclear NGOs demonstrated for post-effect of radiation. The anti-nuclear movement has been collectively propelled by international pacifist groups, like Greenpeace, the International Peace Bureau, the International Association of Lawyers against Nuclear Arms, the International Networks of Engineers and Scientists Against Proliferation, and other associations(Smetana, 2020).

1. **Arab Spring** (2011) can be considered a social movement. Was the Arab Spring a social movement or a strong angry crowd? This question has been raised among the scholars of Social Science. Della Porta and Diani (2006) argued that a social movement should be based on collective identities that will beyond any particular events and initiatives. For considering a movement as a social movement it is required that the movement must be collective behavior and collective action-oriented. Indeed, social

movement cannot be organized without collective action. If the spontaneous collective actions manifested as mass panic from individuals for restructuring and redefining the norms and values of society, then social movement can be organized (Drury, 2020). In the case of the Arab uprisings, cooperative action was occasioned in social movement because the uprisings mechanized into more than a modest protest or the amassing of angry or violent crowds. Sarihan (2014) has argued during the Arab uprisings, true social movements emerged because of general dissatisfaction among specific classes or classes.

The relative deprivation theory is applied to the Arab Spring to justify it as a social movement. Bouayad (2019) provides four criteria for assessing the sources of discontent, possessions, status, behavior, and worth. These four things may generate frustration among the people and they can move to topple the existing regimes with mass social support. The deprived citizens can move against the rulers to seek greater social and political justice toward their rulers. The rise of social movements in a society is a symptom of discontent with the existing social order. After identifying the real facts of deprivation, the dissatisfied people try to collectively share their dissatisfaction with the greater society which poses a strong social movement. Pleyers (2023) argued that social movement is impulsive but not shapeless, ethical, and coherent but not institutional. In January 2011, the Arab Spring started with the overthrow of the Tunisian head of state, Zine el Abidine Ben Ali. Later on, it moved to Egypt and forced the resignation of Hosni Mubarak. Gaddafi in Libya and Ali Abdullah Saleh in Yemen were also toppled by the Arab Spring. The role of civil society organizations was very minimal in propelling the Arab Spring. Beinin (2014) argued that the Egyptian and other Arab popular revolutions were not the outcome of proliferating NGOs.

Globalization and Transnational Movements

The crux of globalization is the market economy which argues for stateless interference of state authority control. Indeed, globalization weakened the authority of the state that has been positively impacted by transnational social movements. The state is unable to impose its sovereign 'property rights' which helps to generate new social space to bypass its control. The loose control of the state authority provides room for civil society and transnational social

movements. Market dealings help to produce a private sphere where state power is minimal and private actors can flourish in a cooperative relationship. The alliance between the liberal market and social performers alongside the state has been interrogated. The state certifies cross-border communications that it ponders as economically and socially benevolent. In the era of globalization, the actors in civil society become matters in their own right. The competition between the society, state, and market gives a triangular game both inside and between nations. Almeida and Dunn (2018) emphasized the role of globalization processes in determining mutual action and social movements.

Buecher (2000) considered globalization as the machine of self-directed transnational spaces. He critically observed that social movements are the reflection of the configuration and dynamics of the world system. He also argued that globalization has made transnational social movements more strong and more independent in their specific right. Economic liberalization raised many challenges that have been addressed by social activists (Laksana & Abduh, 2023). Millward & Takhar (2019) argued for a deep-rooted opposition to the centralized and legal form of social action within social movements. In the era of globalization, a certain degree of institutionalization is to be enhanced in social movements to make effective communication links between leadership and grassroots elements. Because social movements are now more complicated. Ashford (2015) has mentioned that the anti-globalization movement has maintained a distance from the political arena and it is run by NGOs and other civil society-based organizations. Due to privatization millions of people have lost their jobs. The unemployed youths and workers demonstrated across the globe their financial uncertainty.

1. **The Tobin Tax Movement** is very significant. This movement took place due to the speedy growth in financial uncertainty and instability of markets. With the introduction of globalization, many developing and least-developed countries have to face enormous challenges. The basic argument of this movement was a tax on foreign exchange and FDI would bring additional hazards to the national economy of the developing countries. It was also speculated that market economy-based globalization emphasizes privatization which resulted in the reduction of public financing for social development. The members of civil society organizations initiated this movement which was later propelled by political leaders, trade unionists, journalists, and intellectuals. The International Movement for Democratic Control of Financial Markets

and their Institutions demonstrated for Tobin tax. 38 countries took part in this movement from different regions, such as Africa, Europe, and Latin America. It was an anti-capitalist movement against the doctrinal nature of the market. This movement has successfully addressed the currency transaction tax. This movement has an enduring effect due to the assertion of strong protest against the Global North for creating barriers to the production of the Global South.

2. **The Global Justice Movement** has emerged as an important social movement in the era of globalization. In the 1990s, globalization emerged as a controversial issue. The new 'neoliberal order' changed the existing relations between state actors and social actors. In the international arena, globalization posed protests on various issues. Globalization generates movements for the pro-capitalist activities of G8, WTO, or IMF. Several movements were raised due to the growing pro-capitalist activities of the G-8, WTO, and IMF. Globally social activists initiated several complex movements against globalization. The anti-globalization activists protested due to the process of globalization from above. In the era of globalization, the epistemic community across the globe has argued to change the attitude toward social movements. Through a new outlook, the epistemic community negates the framework of nation-state-dominated social movements. Globalization has propelled many social movements. Globalization introduced some new waves of movements like global justice and solidarity movement, global democracy movement, LGBT movement, and human security movements which are anti-globalization movements. The actual motto of these movements is opposing the negative effects of neoliberal globalization.

The nature and strategies of these movements are quite different from each other. Despite having differences, ideologically most of the movements stand on the same opinion. From the anti-globalist perception, social activists move against multinational corporations, international financial institutions, neoliberal trade policies, privatization, FDI, global retail chains, SEZs, etc. Globalization has brought immense changes in the global socio-economic structure. Anti-globalization social movements have appeared in many parts of the world (Khawas, 2016). India has witnessed many kinds of social movements in various forms against globalization. The left political parties of India launched several anti-globalist movements in the early 1990s. Stacher (2018) explained that anti-globalization is a term of propaganda that

should be dismissed with ridicule. The entire world has witnessed the various movements through different voices on the issue of human rights, environmental conservation, and protection of citizens' liberty (Buyse, 2018).

The social movements of Brazil facilitate political mobilization against the process of globalization and market-economy-based liberalization. The Brazilian social movements also raised for ¹⁷ negotiations of a trade agreement in the Americas. anti-globalist demonstrations were found in different parts of the globe, like Seattle, Prague, Nice Genoa, and other places. The World Social Forums led the social movements addressing the global socio-economic and environmental issues in many important cities in the world. The World Social Forum encouraged to conduct of demonstrations in Mumbai and other cities around the world. In a broader context, globalization has made a diverse dimension in the world for social mobilization ³⁷ (Della Porta and Tarrow 2005). The issue of social justice has ¹⁷ been one of the key issues in global social movements. El Khoury (2015) argued that ¹⁷ global social justice became the dictum of global social movements in world politics. The global social justice movement has gained new momentum for the comprehensive effort of civil society. Through continuous propaganda, it achieved global expression with the advocacy of the UNO. The UNO and its interactions within global social justice movements now take a comprehensive shape.

1. Another related movement was the **Trade Justice Movement** of the UK. Around 50 civil society organizations were associated with this movement. It was estimated that the trade justice movement had ² nine million members who demanded a fundamental change in unjustified rules and instructions on international trade.
2. **The International Anti-Corruption Movement** ² has occupied an important place in the era of globalization across the globe. Anticorruption and economic governance issues have increasingly become popular themes of international meetings among bilateral and multilateral agencies. ² Some civil society groups also work toward the implementation of multilateral conventions and monitor compliance. Transparency International is a leading anticorruption organization, bringing together numerous civil society organizations as well as governments, donor agencies, and business groups in over 80 countries. ² The International Initiative on Corruption and Governance, with networks in Africa, Asia, and Latin America, for example, argues that leading financial institutions use corruption and governance issues as a powerful tool to impose

² economic and political conditionality (Laksana & Abduh, 2023). But fair trade is more
than an economic campaign.

²⁸ Linkage between Transnational Social Movements and Social Movements

Since the end of the Cold War, transnational social movements have been a very important part of global politics. Indeed, in the era of globalization, the transitional movements have gained more attention among scholars of International Relations. Transitional social movements are interlinked with social movements which have been characterized by the mobilization of people. ²⁵ As social movements in general, transnational social movements are characterized by the mobilization of people ²⁴ (Eschle, and Stammers, 2004). in a sustained manner for the promotion of social and political change objectives. To be specific, transitional social movements have distinctive features that are beyond the boundary in nature. Despite relations, the objectives of social movements are different than transnational social movements and social movements. The activities of international nongovernmental organizations (INGOs) related to greater socio-political change are the parts of transitional social movements.

Transitional social movements aim to promote politics and society through an international network. There is no doubt, the 21st century has witnessed institutional crises. In the era of globalization, governments are either incapable of addressing the socio-economic problems or reluctant to resolve those problems. So, INGOs are very instrumental in sparking the people to organize movements on crucial issues, like democratic deficiency, human rights violations, armaments, global warming, etc. The Arab Spring (2011) was such type of vibrant movement. The pro-democratic transnational social movements include a vast area of problems. Issues like ⁴³ democracy, environmentalism, feminism, human rights, labor standards, peace, ethnic violence, hunger, literacy. have been very crucial in contemporary times. Eschle and Stammers (2004) argued that social movements are getting fragmentation due to the harsh division of global politics, which is known as the North-South debate.

The global South is often accused by the global North of global warming, violation of human rights, and human security. But, issues like non-nuclearization, non-proliferation, and human rights violations are being violated by the superpowers and Western developed countries. The voice of the state authorities of the global North is quite different than INGOs and international public opinion. Even civilians of the concerned developed countries are also

well aware of the activities of their state authority. They also used to protest domestically against all of these odds. In the era of globalization, due to the advancement of information technology, INGOs are influencing those sections of civil society that are very active in the relevant socio-political and economic dimension-based demands of the people. So, the domestic voice links with the international milieu through the INGOs. In this way, transitional social movements work. A development in International Relations has been noticed in the interaction between social movements and INGOs, multinational corporations, and transnational organizations ¹³ in the 1990s and early 2000s.

The cultural convergence ¹ between globalization and civil society created a new dimension in global social movements. Transnational social movements are global. When a common issue represents the whole universe and becomes inevitable then it transforms from social movements to transnational movements. Unless any fundamental shift is found, then social movement remains stands at the national or local level. It has been argued that ¹ the relationship between global change and social movements is relatively new. The impact of globalization on social movements is unprecedented. The most powerful and highly propagated social movements gained momentum in the era of globalization. It is also noticeable that the neoliberal aspects of economic globalization create several social movements (Eschle, and Stammers, 2004).

The Role of NGOs in Global Movements

The global social movements have intensified after the unimpeded process of globalization. Globalization poses several challenges in a global society. The INGOs and country-based NGOs have played a significant role in global social movements. ¹⁴ In 1987, Richard Falk identified five types of social movements -- (1) The NGOs and INGOs have started social movements on the issue of ecological and environmental protection. (2) ¹⁴ movements by NGOs to pressure states to punish perpetrators of egregious human rights violations. (3) State operation is a common feature of international politics. The NGOs of different countries used to move against the state operation. (4) globalization is based on the market economy and consumerism. In the era of globalization, consumer protection-based movements have started across the globe. (5) Peace and disarmament have been raised by the NGOs internationally and nationally. Apart from these movements, feminist movements have been led by NGOs

and INGOs in different parts of the globe. The role of NGOs has been noticed significantly since the adoption of UDHRN. The NGOs perform in different fields, The NGOs can make a bridge between larger socio-political forces and individuals.

In Tunisia, Libya, Yemen, and Palestine the NGOs are working to address the discontent and instability of citizens and states respectively. In Palestine, the NGOs have been actively working since the early nineteen nineties. Through professional activism, local NGOs are trying to organize popular mobilization to contain the conflict. In Yemen, NGOs are working on sectarian violence. Lewis et al (2020) has mentioned in the Arab world, for many years, NGOs have devoted themselves to bringing social change, but the scope and resources are relatively limited. The NGOs in West Asia have paid attention to stopping systematic violations in Libya, Yemen, Syria, Egypt, Tunisia, and Saudi Arabia.

The Civil Society Response to Global Social Movements

Civil society has been an indispensable part of Political Studies. The trends and success of global civil movements immensely depend upon the ¹ nature of civil society. The role of civil society in various states is often very nominal invisible or restricted. ¹ Civil society is a non-governmental forum where a wide range of apolitical citizens united for the greater interests of the society. In a broad spectrum of social, economic, and cultural fields the conscious and responsive citizens form a civil society for various interests. ¹ In the twentieth century, the meaning of civil society had implied two things (1) popular participation and (2) civic-mindedness. ¹ They shed light on social capital, the public sphere, social capital, culture, and community respectively. There are various aspects concepts and elements of civil society. The major aspects of civil society are values, norms, tolerance, etc. ¹ The role of the mass media and intellectuals is vital to run a civil society very well. The vibrancy of civil society depends upon peoples' participation and civic engagement.

¹ The intellectual discourse of civil society started in eighteenth-century Europe. ¹ In earlier times, there was no space between the society and the state. These two were synonymous. The voice of citizens was not allowed to reach the state authority as well as the bigger society. The response of the civil society is varied across the globe. The success of global social movements is immensely influenced by civil society. A vibrant and apolitical civil society response is required for global social movements. In most cases, the apolitical civil society is

null. The liberals considered the 'civil society' as a potential reservoir of richer moral justifications for the new hegemony of the market. Experts of International Relations theorists like Martin Shaw, Ronnie Lipschutz, Richard Falk, and Laura Macdonald have worked on global civil society to delineate the nature and role of global civil society in global politics.

The success of the global social movement is dependent upon civil society response. It is a fact that social movements usually flourish in a more advanced liberal democratic system. At the same time, it is also true that in many cases, some liberal democracies were not so supportive of all social movements for socio-cultural myths and perception. In many countries in Europe, it was found that women had to fight for their rights. Usually, in liberal democratic countries, civil society is comparatively vibrant and responsive. When any issue appears related to greater society then civil society uses to respond promptly. Some social movements, such as women's movements, LGBTQ movements, and movements of specific ethnic and racial groups have reacted differently in different societies (Almeida, 2019). Some countries consider it through the class equation; some countries consider it a traditional value system. Civil society is not only vibrant in most advanced democracies. It is very active in developing countries also.

CONCLUSION

The capitalist economy generates both cooperation and competition among capitalists and between them and political authorities, which is widely acknowledged to have an impact on popular movements. The role of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) varies across different countries, depending on the nature of the states and public awareness. In post-colonial societies that are least developed, civil society is often absent, politicized, or inactive. Establishing a global civil society is a necessary but challenging task. State authorities often consciously or unconsciously neglect social movements, and there is limited coordination between different social movements. Global politics frequently hurt global social movements, which are characterized by diversity and politicization. While the role of NGOs is generally commendable, the effectiveness of country-specific civil societies is questionable due to their lack of apolitical nature and vibrancy. The scholarship on social movements has traditionally been biased towards either leftist or rights perspectives, neglecting other viewpoints. The concept of 'global civil society' has yet to be fully developed. The success of global social movements depends on the active involvement of national civil society, the vibrancy of global

civil society, and the effectiveness of NGOs and international non-governmental organizations (INGOs). Alongside, the role of states in peace movements is very important. It depends upon the nature of the government (Nandy, 2022). Local social issues can influence the global context, and vice versa. Activists must address social problems directly and operate in an apolitical manner to achieve meaningful results.

REFERENCES

- Almeida P. and Dunn, C. C. (2018) Globalization and Social Movements. *Annual Review of Sociology*. 44, pp. 189-211.
- Almedia, P. (2019). *Social Movements: The Structure of Collective Action*. California: University of California Press, pp. 1-224.
- Ashford, D. E. (2015). *Political change in Morocco*. Princeton University Press.
- Basu, A. (2018). *Women's movements in the global era: The power of local feminisms*. Routledge.
- Beinin, J. (2014). Civil Society, NGOs, and Egypt's 2011 Popular Uprising. *South Atlantic Quarterly*. 113(2), 396-397.
- Bouayad, A. (2019). The Cactus and the Anthropologist: The Evolution of Cultural Expertise on the Entheogenic Use of Peyote in the United States. *Laws*, 8(2), 12.
- Bretos, I., & Marcuello, C. (2017). Revisiting globalization challenges and opportunities in the development of cooperatives. *Annals of Public and Cooperative Economics*, 88(1), 47-73.
- Buechler, S.M. (2000). *Social Movements in Advanced Capitalism. The Political Economy of the Cultural Construction of Social Activism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp.61- 78.
- Buyse, A. (2018). Squeezing civic space: Restrictions on civil society organizations and the linkages with human rights. *The International Journal of Human Rights*, 22(8), 966-988.
- Buzan, B., and Lawson, G. (2016). Theory, History, and the Global Transformation. *International Theory*. 8 (3), pp. 503-22.
- Clark, I. (2007). *International Legitimacy and World Society*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, p.186.

- Crossley, D. A. and Hurwitz, M. H. (2013). *Women's Movements*. In David A. Snow, Donatella Della Porta, Bert Klandermans, and Doug McAdam (Eds.) *The Wiley-Blackwell Encyclopaedia of Social and Political Movements*. Blackwell Publishing Ltd, pp.2-10.
- Della, Porta, D. (2005). *Multiple belongings, tolerant identities, and the construction of 'Another Politics': Between the European Social Forum and the Local Social Fora*. In D. Della Porta and S. Tarrow (Ed.) *Transnational Protest and Global Activism*. Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, New York, p.21.
- Della Porta, D., & Diani, M. (2006). *Social movements: An introduction*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Drury, J. (2020). Recent developments in the psychology of crowds and collective behaviour. *Current Opinion in Psychology*, 35, 12-16.
- El Khoury, A. (2015). *Globalization Development and Social Justice: A propositional political approach*. Florence: Taylor and Francis.
- Eschle, C., & Stammers, N. (2004). Taking Part: Social Movements, INGOs, and Global Change. *Alternatives*, 29(3), 333-372. <https://doi.org/10.1177/030437540402900305>.
- Khawas, B. (2016). Globalization and Social Movement: Critique of Critique. *Mainstream*. 54(54), pp.1-3.
- Kimura, M. (2019). Protesting the AFSPA in the Indian Periphery: The Anti-Militarization Movement in Northeast India. *Law and Democracy in Contemporary India: Constitution, Contact Zone, and Performing Rights*, 147-168.
- Laksana, M. W., & Abduh, M. (2023). The Power of Social Movements: Activism in the Age of Connectivity. *Journal of Current Social and Political Issues*, 1(1), 18-23. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jcspi.v1i1.441>
- Lebow, R. N. (2020). *Between peace and war*. Springer Nature.
- Lewis, D., Kanji, N., & Themudo, N. S. (2020). *Non-governmental organizations and development*. Routledge.
- Mansbach, R. W., & Ferguson, Y. H. (2021). *Populism and globalization: The return of nationalism and the global liberal order*. Springer.
- Martinez-Alier, J., Temper, L., Del Bene, D., & Scheidel, A. (2016). Is there a global environmental justice movement? *The Journal of Peasant Studies*, 43(3), 731-755.

- McGregor, L. (2019). Looking to the future: The scope, value and operationalization of international human rights law. *Vand. J. Transnat'l L.*, 52, 1281.
- Millward, P., & Takhar, S. (2019). Social movements, collective action and activism. *Sociology*, 53(3), NP1-NP12.
- Montell, J. (2016). Learning from what works: Strategic analysis of the achievements of the Israel-Palestine human rights community. *Hum. Rts. Q.*, 38, 928.
- Nandy, D. (2017). *Understanding Pakistan*. Kunal Books, New Delhi, pp. 1-170.
- Nandy, D. (2020). *Revisiting India's Post-Cold War Foreign Policy: Since 1991 to Present Day*, Avenel Press, Kolkata, p.33.
- Nandy, D. (2022). Peacebuilding Process in Some Selected Countries of South Asia: The Role of State Actors. In R. Baikady et al. (eds.). *The Palgrave Handbook of Global Social Problems (Living Reference)*, Palgrave Macmillan, pp.1-16.
- Nandy, D. (2023). Human Rights in the Era of Surveillance: Balancing Security and Privacy Concerns. *Journal of Current Social and Political Issues*, 1(1), 13-17.
- Nandy, D. (2024). Human Security and Livelihood in Afghanistan. In Debasish Nandy and Debtanu Majee (eds.) *Human Security in Asia: Interrogating State, Society, and Policy*. Palgrave Macmillan, Singapore, pp. 229-252.
- Paul, T. V. (2018). Assessing change in world politics. *International Studies Review*, 20(2), 177-185.
- Peña, A. M., & Davies, T. (2019). Social Movements and International Relations: A Relational Framework. *Journal of International Relations and Development*. 24, pp. 5176, <https://doi.org/10.1057/s41268-019-00180-w>.
- Rootes, C. (1999). Environmental movements: From the local to the global. *Environmental Politics*. 8(1), 1-12, DOI: 10.1080/09644019908414435.
- Pleyers, G. (2023). Alain Touraine, a sociologist of the production of society by itself. *Fórum Sociální Politiky*, 2, 45-46.
- Sarihan, A. (2014). In Search of the Arab Uprisings: Social Movement, Revolution, or Democratization? *Turkish Journal of Politics*. 5(1), Summer, p. 41.
- Smetana, M. (2020). India and the Aftermath of Pokhran-II Nuclear Tests. *Nuclear Deviance: Stigma Politics and the Rules of the Nonproliferation Game*, 191-216.

- Smith, J., Gemici, B., Plummer, S., & Hughes, M. M. (2018). Transnational social movement organizations and counter-hegemonic struggles today. *Journal of World-Systems Research*, 24(2), 372-403.
- Smith, J., Plummer, S., & Hughes, M. M. (2017). Transnational social movements and changing organizational fields in the late twentieth and early twenty-first centuries. *Global Networks*, 17(1), 3-22.
- Stacher, J. (2018). Fragmenting states, new regimes: militarized state violence and transition in the Middle East. In *After the Arab Uprisings* (pp. 67-83). Routledge.
- Stammers, N. (2009). New Movements? Old Wrongs? In His (ed.) *Human Rights and Social Movements*. London: Pluto Press, pp. 1-296.
- Tabar, L. (2016). Disrupting development, reclaiming solidarity: The anti-politics of humanitarianism. *Journal of Palestine Studies*, 45(4), 16-31.
- Teo, T. (2023). In the aftermath of globalization: Antiglobalizing and deglobalizing forms of subjectivity. *Theory & Psychology*, 33(2), 193-208.
- White, J. I. (2019). A Critical Reflection on Sovereignty in International Relations Today. *E-International Relations*, 1-6.
- Zadeh, E.S.A and Shafiee, E. (2017). The Study of the Human Rights Situation in Iraq During Saddam Hussein Era. *Journal of Politics and Law*. 10(2), p.217.
- Zin, M. (2016). Politics of Civil Society in Hybrid Regime. *Myanmar Quarterly*. 1(1), pp.1-20.

Global Social Movements (GSMs) and Non-Governmental Organizations: Investigating the Impact on Global Social Change

ORIGINALITY REPORT

14%
SIMILARITY INDEX

11%
INTERNET SOURCES

8%
PUBLICATIONS

3%
STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	dokumen.pub Internet Source	3%
2	www.files.ethz.ch Internet Source	1%
3	theses.gla.ac.uk Internet Source	1%
4	journal.uinsgd.ac.id Internet Source	1%
5	Alison Dahl Crossley, Heather McKee Hurwitz. "Women's Movements", Wiley, 2013 Publication	1%
6	www.palgrave.com Internet Source	1%
7	Raimo Väyrynen. "Chapter 18 Sovereignty, Globalization, and Transnational Social Movements", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2022 Publication	<1%

8	"Globalization and Social Movements", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2001 Publication	<1 %
9	academic.oup.com Internet Source	<1 %
10	www.cejiss.org Internet Source	<1 %
11	core.ac.uk Internet Source	<1 %
12	Alison Dahl Crossley, Heather McKee Hurwitz. "Women's Movements", Wiley, 2022 Publication	<1 %
13	ebin.pub Internet Source	<1 %
14	www.globalization101.org Internet Source	<1 %
15	www.britannica.com Internet Source	<1 %
16	"Building Sustainable Communities", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2020 Publication	<1 %
17	Carlos R. S. Milani, Ruthy Nadia Laniado. "Transnational Social Movements and the Globalization Agenda: A Methodological Approach Based on the Analysis of the World	<1 %

Social Forum", Brazilian Political Science Review, 2007

Publication

18

www.igi-global.com

Internet Source

<1 %

19

Michal Smetana. "Nuclear Deviance", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2020

Publication

<1 %

20

Submitted to St. Francis Borgia Regional High School

Student Paper

<1 %

21

Submitted to Johns Hopkins University

Student Paper

<1 %

22

doku.pub

Internet Source

<1 %

23

vdoc.pub

Internet Source

<1 %

24

Submitted to City University

Student Paper

<1 %

25

Submitted to University of Witwatersrand

Student Paper

<1 %

26

www.nagalanduniv.ndl.iitkgp.ac.in

Internet Source

<1 %

27

Elizabeth Anne Bennett. "Global Social Movements in Global Governance",

<1 %

Globalizations, 2012

Publication

-
- | | | |
|--|---|----------------|
| <div style="background-color: #008080; color: white; padding: 5px; display: inline-block; width: 40px; text-align: center;">28</div> | Submitted to King's College
Student Paper | <1 % |
|--|---|----------------|
-
- | | | |
|--|--|----------------|
| <div style="background-color: #008000; color: white; padding: 5px; display: inline-block; width: 40px; text-align: center;">29</div> | djs.du.ac.bd
Internet Source | <1 % |
|--|--|----------------|
-
- | | | |
|--|--|----------------|
| <div style="background-color: #8B4513; color: white; padding: 5px; display: inline-block; width: 40px; text-align: center;">30</div> | Diliana Stoyanova. "chapter 8 Digital Media, Secrecy, and International Lawmaking", IGI Global, 2016
Publication | <1 % |
|--|--|----------------|
-
- | | | |
|--|---|----------------|
| <div style="background-color: #8B4513; color: white; padding: 5px; display: inline-block; width: 40px; text-align: center;">31</div> | intersections.tk.mta.hu
Internet Source | <1 % |
|--|---|----------------|
-
- | | | |
|--|---|----------------|
| <div style="background-color: #000080; color: white; padding: 5px; display: inline-block; width: 40px; text-align: center;">32</div> | www.elgaronline.com
Internet Source | <1 % |
|--|---|----------------|
-
- | | | |
|--|--|----------------|
| <div style="background-color: #800080; color: white; padding: 5px; display: inline-block; width: 40px; text-align: center;">33</div> | "Understanding Post-COVID-19 Social and Cultural Realities", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2022
Publication | <1 % |
|--|--|----------------|
-
- | | | |
|--|--|----------------|
| <div style="background-color: #008000; color: white; padding: 5px; display: inline-block; width: 40px; text-align: center;">34</div> | Julie Kalil Schutten. " Invoking : New Social Movements, Hidden Populations, and the Public Screen ", Western Journal of Communication, 2006
Publication | <1 % |
|--|--|----------------|
-
- | | | |
|--|---|----------------|
| <div style="background-color: #000080; color: white; padding: 5px; display: inline-block; width: 40px; text-align: center;">35</div> | Thomas Olesen. "World politics and social movements: the Janus face of the global democratic structure", Global Society, 2005
Publication | <1 % |
|--|---|----------------|
-

36	digitalscholarship.unlv.edu Internet Source	<1 %
37	eprints.whiterose.ac.uk Internet Source	<1 %
38	mau.diva-portal.org Internet Source	<1 %
39	reubenstanley.blogspot.com Internet Source	<1 %
40	silo.pub Internet Source	<1 %
41	www.knu.ac.in Internet Source	<1 %
42	www.mobt3ath.com Internet Source	<1 %
43	www.oxfordbibliographies.com Internet Source	<1 %
44	"The History of Social Movements in Global Perspective", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2017 Publication	<1 %
45	Ty Solomon. "Up in the air: Ritualized atmospheres and the global Black Lives Matter movement", European Journal of International Relations, 2023 Publication	<1 %

46

serval.unil.ch

Internet Source

<1 %

47

www.cespi.it

Internet Source

<1 %

Exclude quotes On

Exclude matches Off

Exclude bibliography On