

# Evaluation of Trainees' Post-Training Competency in the South African Police Service

*by Mokofeng 2 Mokofeng 2*

---

**Submission date:** 21-Feb-2024 02:47PM (UTC+0700)

**Submission ID:** 2300437109

**File name:** 34-64\_mokofeng.docx (134.41K)

**Word count:** 11105

**Character count:** 63343

## Evaluation of Trainees' Post-Training Competency in the South African Police Service

Zitha Moitsadi<sup>1</sup>, Mmabath<sup>20</sup> P. Aphane<sup>1</sup>, Lerato Mofokeng<sup>2</sup>, Jacob T. Mofokeng<sup>\* 2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>University of South Africa (UNISA), Pretoria, South Africa

<sup>2</sup>Tshwane University of Technology (TUT), Pretoria, South Africa

\*Corresponding Author E-mail: [mofokengjt@tut.ac.za](mailto:mofokengjt@tut.ac.za)

### Abstract

24  
This paper presents the findings on the respondents' perceptions of trainees' competency after completing training. A survey was conducted among 329 respondents from 13 police stations in the Johannesburg policing area using a questionnaire. The findings revealed that contextual factors, namely effectiveness, training environment and trainer's skills as well as adequate resources towards development have a positive impact on the programme conducted at the training centres. Furthermore, the findings highlighted that the respondents were of the view that, since the inception of new methods of training after the 1994 democratic elections, the South African Police Service (SAPS) had demonstrated a progressive development towards responding to community matters. However, there were gaps in the training and development programmes such as lack of resources, the blanket approach to training and the training models focusing on current challenges rather than future trends. To address these challenges within the SAPS and ensure that there is effective training and development for organisational performance, there is a need to ensure that there are adequate resources for training and development. The training and development procedures within the SAPS also need to adopt international standards. The management at 53 Johannesburg Training Centre also needs to come up with an effective strategy to identify the needs and skills gaps of employees and ensure that these are 11 addressed in an ever-changing and improving training and development strategy. This study provides critical input and makes a contribution to the literature related to training in the SAPS in South Africa.

Keywords: Competence, community, skills, performance, police, training

### INTRODUCTION

18  
Regardless of the type of training any organisation offers to equip its employees, all courses have the same basic goal; to help learners develop new skills and implement them as soon as possible. Without a post-training evaluation, it can be difficult to know whether that organisation's 18 human capital is effective and whether the trainees feel they are acquiring the skills they need. 11 Training and its effectiveness have been a topic of attention and concern no matter what the type of organisation or its activity's nature was. Organisations have understood the importance of

5  
\* Copyright (c) 2024 Zitha Moitsadi et.al

This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/).

Received: July 31, 2023; Revised: February 14, 2024; Accepted: February 19, 2024

training and the significant role it plays in enhancing the job performance and employee's efficiency. It also provides the organisation with the ability to survive, especially with the hard competition nowadays. Employee training is viewed as a systematic process intended to increase police officers' competence while advancing their skills, knowledge and contributing to their overall behavioural attitudes (Gill & Sharma, 2013, p. 36). It is practically impossible for any organisation be it either in the public or private sector to achieve its objectives in terms of its vision and mission statements if its employees do not have sufficient skills and are not competent to perform their duties. The South African Police Service's (SAPS) strategic plan of 2014-2019 is clearly rooted in the National Development Plan (NDP) Vision 2030 on building safer communities. The NDP Vision 2030 clearly emphasises the police as being a well-resourced professional institution staffed with highly skilled officers who value their work, serve the community, protect the peaceful against violence and respect the rights of all to equality and justice (South Africa, 2011 as cited in Mofokeng & Aphane, 2022, p. 489). Mofokeng and Aphane (2022, p. 489) posit that "this futuristic plan focuses on professionalising the police through strategic outcome-oriented goals, which include an efficient, effective, and developmental-oriented public service. In order to improve employee performance and motivation, the SAPS managers should utilise training to improve police officers' capabilities. Therefore, there should be a paradigm shift regarding the quality of training programmes offered by the SAPS."

Therefore, implementation of training and development programmes in the workplace is important to enhance employee performance. Training and development improve individual competencies that will assist employees to effectively execute their functions. It is therefore necessary that the skills and knowledge of employees are maximised to achieve organisational goals and objectives, thus sustaining optimal performance. The SAPS Division of Human Resource Development, previously known as Training, has undergone many changes in the past 15 years. Over the years, there has been restructuring of the SAPS. This, a functional analysis and Provincial Head Office: Training was included in this exercise. As a result of this analysis a Decentralised Human Resource Development Training Centre was established in all nine provinces to conduct training and service training for all SAPS members. In the Gauteng province there have been seven decentralised training centres established due to increased demand for training and retraining of members. These include Johannesburg, Pretoria, Vaal, Soweto, Krugersdorp, Benoni and Tembisa. These centres equip the SAPS members with essential skills required to perform their duties. New recruits are trained at the national training colleges situated in Pretoria, Cape Town, Durban and the Eastern Cape province. The decentralised training

centres offer different courses ranging from management to train the trainer and detective, junior management, client service centre, domestic violence, tactical and street survival courses. These decentralised training centres conduct their own annual needs analysis to identify the courses they need to offer and formulate a training plan. This is forwarded to the provincial office for approval as the province funds the courses. Community Service Centres (CSC), often referred to as police stations, nominate their members to attend courses according to their work placement.

Mdhloose (2020, p. 53) reflecting from various sources, posits that many organisations do not evaluate their training undertakings and those who do, repeatedly evaluate training inadequately. Moreover, Niazi 2011 in Mdhloose (2020, p. 53) claims inadequate significance given to evaluation of training in comparison to planning and implementation. The effectiveness of training and development initiatives within the SAPS has been questioned over the years signifying the challenges of such initiatives. The fact that police officers and officials' competency is being called into question, even after they have attended training, suggests that the SAPS Training Centres have certain shortfalls. It has been found that generating evidence-based knowledge on the effectiveness of police training plays a principal role in understanding "what works, how and why it works" (Wolfe, McLean, Rojek, Alpert & Smith 2019, p. 202). There appears to be a gap between the training environment and the curriculum offered at the training centres and expectations by the regions as well as the SAPS community. There is a knowledge void in terms of understanding how training and development initiatives are interpreted and managed in the SAPS Training Centres. An initial research search confirmed that very little research has been conducted on how training and development initiatives at the training centres are interpreted and managed internally, towards improved service quality. Current management research is too far removed from the world of practice; it is overly theoretical and abstract and, hence, cannot be applied to real life situations that could lead to the improvement of performance in the SAPS.

## LITERATURE REVIEW

30

### Competency Experience-Based Training (CEBT) Model

The study conducted by Prasongmanee, Wannapiroon and Nilsook (2022, p. 46) provides valuable information regarding the Competency Experience-Based Training (CEBT) Model. These authors, posit that CEBT refers to a course-based training method in which trainees acquire substantive knowledge from their experience in performing tasks and work from the source of science or the source provided to achieve the goal. Furthermore, Prasongmanee et al.



(2022, p. 147) point out that the result of training is competence in performing various tasks that meet the needs of the profession. CEBT model comprise of three main processes and 10 sub-steps. The first process is training planning, consisting of 1) Orientation, is a process which introduces employees to their responsibilities including describing the purpose of the experience that they will face at some point and provide them with context, presents situations, define tasks, identify resources, media and facilities and identify anticipated results 2) Pre-training assessment is a process that evaluates an employees past experience by assessing them with tasks that are work related. The second process is to conduct training that affords trainees to demonstrate their experience through the following steps: 3) Confront, 4) Advancing, 5) Blending and 6) Subdue. The third process is the evaluate if trainees are able to contextualise the knowledge obtained and demonstrate critical thinking, including, 7) Progress report: an update report that informs relevant stakeholders whether the training goals were addressed and were aligned to the tasks provided 8) Presentation: Reporting on the outcome of the training exercise that the trainees were tested with, including their experiences and development, 9) Summary: this phase concludes the reporting of the training experience and provided an in-depth overview of the findings of the experience and 10) Evaluating after training: this is process where trainees are tested and an analysis is conducted to evaluate whether training provided was effective and aligned to the organisations needs (Prasongmanee et al., 2022, p. 147). The International Labour Organisation ([ILO], 2020, p. 12) posits that:

"Competency is defined as the demonstrated ability to apply knowledge, skills, and attitudes in order to successfully complete work activities to a defined standard of performance, as expected in a real-life workplace environment. Under this definition, knowledge is defined as possessing the required information for a task. Skills are the ability to carry out a task with pre-defined results, often within a given amount of time with limited energy. An attitude is the stance or approach undertaken by an individual towards a certain idea, object, person, or situation, as conditioned by their system of principles, beliefs and habits. Competencies are classified into: (a) technical/professional competencies; and (b) transversal/general competencies (skills and attitudes the individual is expected to display while performing tasks), which are also coined as life skills/ core work skills/soft skills/employability skills, etc. They are important for specific occupations, but also for strengthening labour mobility."

Wongnaa and Boachie (2018, pp. 2-3), citing several sources, define the concept 'competence' as an evolving concept; therefore, it has different meanings for different people and nations, depending on their institutional structures and labour processes. For some authors, competence is defined as the ability to perform particular tasks and roles to the expected standards or the capacity to accomplish the key occupational tasks that characterise a profession to satisfactory standards Kouwenhoven, 2010 as cited in Wongnaa & Boachie (2018, pp. 2-3).

Reflecting on the latest development regarding how this concept had evolved, Wongnaa and Boachie (2018, p. 3) point out that the word competence has also been explained by Haddouchane, Bakkali, Ajana and Gassemi (2017) as "the ability to do something successfully or efficiently" or "a proven ability in a particular subject area as a result of the amount of knowledge possessed which can be assessed". These definitions view competence as functional, task-oriented and industry-focused preparation with which individuals can apply the relevant skills and attitudes in a required workplace environment. Competency-based training (CBT) is an approach that allows students to earn qualifications through demonstration of skills and knowledge in a required subject area using a series of carefully designed assessments. Under this, students take tests, write papers, complete assignments, and undertake industrial attachment. With this model, instead of focusing on credit hours, qualifications are awarded through tangible evidence of learning.

### Theoretical and conceptual background

Effective policing is recognised throughout the world as an essential element to the economy of the country (Chauke, Motalekgosi & Mofokeng, 2022; Melwich & Mofokeng, 2020; Modise, Taylor, & Raga, 2022; Mofokeng, 2020; Mofokeng & Aphane, 2022). Mvuyisi and Mbukanma (2023, p. 96) posit that "skilled and engaged people result in high job satisfaction, commitment and hence retention, advantages of staff improvement and engagement. Regardless of whether an organisation has established, functional training programmes, staff growth can never be effective until the work environment allows for and encourages ongoing learning". Thus, it is through training and development that police officers would be able to respond adequately to the demands of the public. Choudhury and Sharma (2019, p. 2) posit that training effectiveness results in the benefits that institutions and employees derive from acquiring new skills. The term 'behaviour' is used in a broad sense to include any knowledge and skills acquired. Brantingham and Brantingham (2017) Training and development is the process of pinpointing, ensuring, and enhancing individuals' essential skills through organized learning activities. These activities aim to enable employees to effectively carry out their current responsibilities and prepare them for future roles within the organization. Employees are vital assets to any company, but their development can be a significant investment.

The above is supported by Kleygrewe, Oudejans, Koedijk and Hutter (2022, p. np), Police training is essential for the growth and proficiency of police officers. It encompasses a range of educational elements and adheres to specific organizational protocols, making it a multifaceted

and intricate subject. Wolfe, McLean, Rojek, Alpert and Smith (2019, p. 1) Police officers undergo diverse training programs throughout their careers, covering topics such as the use of force and emergency driving. While police leaders are increasingly relying on research evidence to tackle crime issues, the same level of evidence-based decision-making is not always applied to selecting training programs. The political landscape of policing often compels police managers to introduce new training initiatives in response to contentious officer-citizen interactions, aiming to address and mitigate associated challenges.

The South African Police Service (SAPS) serves as the primary law enforcement agency and plays a crucial role in safeguarding citizens. Its strategies encompass both operational and organizational priorities. The SAPS Strategic Plan for 2020-2022 is firmly aligned with the National Development Plan (NDP) Vision 2030, which aims to create safer communities. The NDP Vision 2030 underscores the importance of the police force as a well-equipped and professional institution staffed by competent officers who prioritize their duties, serve the community, safeguard peace, uphold equality, and ensure justice for all (South Africa, 2011). This forward-looking plan centers on enhancing the professionalism of the police force through strategic goals geared towards achieving efficient, effective, and development-oriented public service. To boost employee performance and motivation, SAPS managers ought to leverage training initiatives aimed at enhancing the capabilities of police officers (Mofokeng & Aphane, 2022). The NDP Vision 2030 underscores the significance of training and skills development" (South Africa, 2011). Training and development in the SAPS are governed by various pieces of legislation and authorities in South Africa.

**These pieces of legislation and authorities are outlined as follows:**

**The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996):** According to Section 195 of the Constitution, public administration must adhere to democratic principles and values, including effective human resource management and career advancement (South Africa, 1996). Achieving this necessitates ongoing training and development of SAPS employees. Chapter 2, Section 29, subsection (1) of the Constitution establishes education, adult basic education, and further education as fundamental rights. Moreover, Chapter 10, Section 195, subsection (1) emphasizes the importance of fostering career development practices and sound human resource management to optimize human potential. These constitutional principles are particularly relevant to education, training, and development (ETD) practitioners, forming part of the eight values and principles outlined in Chapter 10 that govern public administration, including ETD practitioners.

To effectively fulfill its mandate, the industry must ensure it has skilled employees capable of meeting organizational objectives and future challenges.

**SAPS Act (No. 68 of 1995) as amended:** The SAPS Act of 1995 grants authority to the minister to establish regulations regarding the training, appointment, promotion, and transfer of members (Mokoena, 2018; Mokoena, Pfeiffer & Mofokeng, 2022). Chapter 8 of the Act specifies that the minister has the power to mandate members' attendance at training courses. While the SAPS operates within the public sector, it is governed by the SAPS Act (68 of 1995) for certain employees, while others fall under the jurisdiction of the Public Service Act (103 of 1994). This differentiation is based on the nature of duties performed. Under the SAPS Act (68 of 1995), the minister is empowered to regulate training appointments, promotions, transfers, and training attendance for SAPS employees. Additionally, the National Commissioner is responsible for determining the training that SAPS members or employees must undergo.

**Skills Development Act (No. 97 of 1998):** The Skills Development Act (97 of 1998) is a critical component of the National Skills Development Strategy, aimed at tackling social and economic challenges in South Africa" (Mnisi, 2015, as cited in Mokoena et al., 2022, p. 67). This legislation is pivotal in addressing skills development and forms part of broader efforts to address social and economic issues. Rodriguez and Walters (2017) argue that training and development play a crucial role in enhancing individual and institutional competitiveness. In the South African context, skills development initiatives must be viewed in light of the country's social, political, and economic landscape, where reconstruction and development remain top priorities. The introduction of the Skills Development Act (97 of 1998) was prompted by the recognition of a shortage of skilled workers and the need to address discriminatory practices in training and employment opportunities. High unemployment rates persisted due to a mismatch between labor market demands and the skills of the workforce, exacerbated by insufficient training provided by employers. The primary objective of the Skills Development Act (97 of 1998) is to enhance the skills of the South African workforce, with the legislation outlining specific aims and provisions.

1. To improve the quality of life of workers, their prospects of work and labour mobility;
2. To improve productivity in the workplace and competitiveness of the employers;
3. To promote self-employment and to increase the levels of investment in education and training
4. To encourage employees use available resources and acquire new skills that will enable them to excel in their tasks;



5. To empower employees who are new in the workplace with skills and opportunities to enhance their knowledge<sup>1</sup>
6. To promote participation in learnership and other relevant training programmes.

The purpose of the Skills Development Act (97 of 1998) is to establish a framework for devising and implementing national, sectoral, and workplace strategies aimed at enhancing and upgrading the skills of the South African workforce. A key focus of the act is to enhance the employment prospects of previously disadvantaged individuals through education and training" (Van Dyk, Nel & Haasbroek, 2001 as cited in Modise et al., 2022, p. 306). According to Mnisi (2015, p. 46), training and development are pivotal in enhancing both individual and institutional competitiveness. In the South African context, it is essential to consider skills development and training within the broader social, political, and economic context, where reconstruction and development remain prominent national priorities<sup>49</sup>

**Skills Development Levies Act (No. 9 of 1999):** The Skills Development Levies Act of 1999 states that every employer must pay a skills development levy to the South African Revenue Service (SARS), which is responsible for administering the Act. The SAPS has a registered skills development facilitator (SDF) at police station level (Davis et al., 2016). The purpose of the SDF is to consolidate workplace learning needs at station level and report them to the provincial SDFs so that they can nominate members with skills deficiencies for workplace learning programmes, monitor individuals' skills needs and assist members to compile individual development plans (Mokoena, 2018; Mokoena et al., 2022).

**Sector Education and Training Authority (SETA):** SETA is a body that encompasses numerous delegates in labour, employees, central government department members, professional bodies, and bargaining forums from business industry sectors (Davis et al., 2016). The main function of the SETA is to contribute to the development of skills.

**The South African Qualifications Authority (SAQA):** SAQA is tasked with establishing the National Qualifications Framework (NQF) and national standards bodies to establish training standards that ensure the progression and transferability of qualifications, meaning that qualifications obtained in workplace training settings hold value within formal education systems, and vice versa" (Mohlala, 2011). The SAPS aims to enhance service delivery, particularly in areas like crime investigation and arrests, necessitating learning programs that are tailored to meet specific needs and circumstances. SAQA's role is crucial in ensuring the development and implementation of the NQF, which contributes to the holistic development of learners and the broader social and economic progress (Meyer, 2007, p. 28). SAQA also oversees the

accreditation processes of learning programs by SETAs and monitors the implementation of standards, certifies national qualifications and credits, and approves secondary accreditation for providers and assessors (Mohlala, 2011, p. 48). The primary functions of SAQA include :

1. Supervise the implementation of the National Qualifications Framework (NQF) through a multi-year strategic plan, budget, and implementation framework.
2. Propose level descriptors to the minister based on recommendations from each Quality Council (QC).
3. Suggest policy frameworks to the minister for the development, registration, and publication of qualifications within each sector, as well as for assessment, recognition of prior learning, and credit accumulation and transfer, considering input from each QC.
4. Register qualifications recommended by a QC if they meet specified criteria.
5. Advise the minister on policy frameworks for recognizing professional bodies and registering professional designations, following consultations with expert practitioners and considering proposals from each relevant body.
6. Recognize professional bodies and register their professional designations if they meet established criteria.
7. Maintain a national learner's records database containing registers of national qualifications, standards, learner achievements, professional bodies, professional designations, and related information.
8. Offer evaluation and advisory services for foreign qualifications (Jiang et al., 2016).

It's important to note that SAQA offers essential mechanisms for evaluating learning programs to ensure they meet established national standards and norms (Mohlala, 2011: p. 49). The SAPS is committed to enhancing service delivery, particularly in areas like arrests and investigations. The National Qualifications Framework (NQF) serves as a comprehensive framework guiding the development of a unified system of recognized qualifications, integrating education and training on a national scale (Mokoena, 2018). The Safety and Security Sector Education and Training Authority (SASSETA) is a SETA established to oversee education and training specifically tailored for various safety and security providers in South Africa, including the military, police, and diplomatic sectors. According to the SAPS Education, Training, and Development Policy (Mokoena, 2018), the Divisional Commissioner: Training within the SAPS is responsible for ensuring the development, implementation, and management of a quality management system aligned with criteria set forth by SAQA or SASSETA. Additionally, every

education, training, and development institution within the SAPS is required to regularly report all learning interventions offered to the Divisional Commissioner: Training on a quarterly basis.

17

## RESEARCH METHODS

This study was carried out using a descriptive research design. The study describes the opinions of the respondents with regard to the factors influencing training effectiveness in the public sector and operational practices of the SAPS in the Johannesburg policing area, Gauteng province. Ethical considerations are an important aspect of any research, especially research that deals with human participants. Hence, all research requires ethical clearance and approval to be conducted. For the purposes of this study, ethical clearance was granted by the university, initially on the condition that the SAPS approved the request to conduct research. This was later changed to full ethical clearance following the approval of the research request by the SAPS. In agreement with the pre-selected police stations, permission was requested and granted by the Gauteng Provincial Office, in accordance with the National Instruction of 2006. The Gauteng Provincial Office communicated with the selected police stations to provide the lead researcher with contact details and allow the researcher to continue with the research. The sample unit are those police officials who work within the study area and were aware of the training activities and to what extent this concept applied to their respective policing areas, or even more, influence crime prevention, towards the attainment of organisational goals.

A survey was conducted among 329 respondents from 13 police stations in the Johannesburg policing area using a structured questionnaire. The collected data were analysed using descriptive analysis and the chi-square goodness of fit test to draw inferences. The responses were captured in Excel and exported to the Statistical Programme for Social Sciences (SPSS) for coding and further analysis. A chi-square test of independence ( $X^2$ ) was used to test the relationships or associations between the demographic variables and opinions of the respondents, if there were any. In a broader context, the chi-square test evaluates whether distributions of categorical variables differ from each other. This test involves defining null and alternate hypotheses for the datasets being compared (Fourie & Chimusoro, 2018, p.150). The chi-square value is then computed and compared with a critical value obtained from a chi-square table. If the chi-square value is less than the critical value, there is no significant difference, and the null hypothesis is rejected in favor of the alternate hypothesis.

Furthermore, Phi and Cramer's V coefficients are utilized to assess the strength of association, ranging between -1 and +1. Associations with values of 0.7 and above are

considered very strong positive associations, while those between 0.5 and 0.64 are deemed fair, and associations below 0.3 are regarded as weak (Bezuidenhout, Davis & Du Plooy-Cilliers, 2014, p.137). Hypotheses serve as statements or proposed explanations based on limited evidence, serving as a starting point for further investigation. They may also take the form of proposed alternative facts' or states of affairs, helping establish relationships between dependent and independent variables (Blaikie & Priest, 2019). Hypotheses can follow principles of deductive logic, drawing conclusions from general knowledge to specific cases. In the present study, three research hypotheses were tested:

**H1:** There is a positive relationship between the quality of training and performance of police officials.

**H2:** There is a positive relationship between the training environment and the quality of the training.

**H3:** There is a positive relationship between the monitoring and evaluation of the programme and the quality of the training in general.

### Demographic characteristics of respondents

The sample included African, White and Coloured respondents, all employed in terms of the Police Act. The ranks comprised of Constables: 38 percent (n=126; 38.4%); Sergeants: 29 percent (n=95; 28.9%) and Warrant Officers: 13 percent (n=41; 12.5%). The commissioned officers, namely Captains, Lieutenant Colonels, Colonels and Brigadiers, comprised of 20 percent (n=67; 20.4%) combined. Males constituted 70 percent (n=172; 70.4%) respondents, whereas female respondents were the least represented group at 30 percent (n=157; 29.6%). Not only were females minimally represented, but they were also likely to be found in the lowest ranks. This might be linked to the history of the policing profession or other factors. The  $p$ -value is 0.043 < 0.05 and suggests a link between gender and rank. It is also noted that worldwide trends show that fewer females than males consider policing as a profession (Hau-Nung & Ka-ki, 2013, p. 489; Helfgott, Gunnison, Murtagh & Navejar, 2018, p. 237; Rabe-Hemp, 2009, p. 114). The majority of the subordinates were aged 20–30 (n=293; 90.9%), followed by ages 31–40 (n=11; 3.3%). Few respondents were over 41 years old (n=19; 5.8%). All subordinates were equally represented, with all age groups decreasing as the responsibility of policing decreases. The  $p$ -value 0.040 < 0.05 indicates a significant link between age and experience or service. The distribution of the respondents by area of employment indicated that the majority were from Detective Training



Academy (n=154; 46.8%), followed by Visible Policing (n=149; 45.29%) and lastly, (n=26; 7.9%) constituted support staff.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### Statement 1: Perceptions on the use of knowledge and skills in the work environment

**Table 1. Respondents' perceptions on whether trainees are able to use the knowledge and skills acquired in their work by years of service**

Years of Service	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total
0 – 3	12(24.49)	30(61.22)	4(8.16)	1(2.04)	2(4.08)	49(100)
4 – 6	5(12.50)	28(70.00)	4(10.00)	3(7.50)	0(0.00)	40(100)
7 – 9	13(20.31)	40(62.50)	10(15.63)	0(0.00)	1(1.56)	64(100)
10 – 12	5(19.23)	12(46.15)	4(15.38)	3(11.54)	2(7.69)	26(100)
13	19(12.75)	94(63.09)	25(16.78)	7(4.70)	4(2.68)	149(100)
Total	54(16.46)	204(62.20)	47(14.33)	14(4.27)	9(2.74)	328(100)

Source: 24. researchers' illustration

Table 1 shows that 79% of the respondents across all years of service felt that trainees were able to use the knowledge and skills acquired in the workplace. In line with the underlying principles of CBT, the training programme was perceived to provide respondents with the use of knowledge and skills necessary to deliver effective service delivery to the communities in the area of the study. Drawing on experiential learning principles (Kolb, 2014), respondents seemed to have been provided with concrete experiences that they could reflect on, with the reflections being used to drive abstract conceptualisation and active experimentation of the course content that could be applied to their practice. This also meant that the SAPS Training Centre followed Smith's (1999) recommendation that CBT training, as part of staff development, should be contextualised for the trainees' student groups, something that was particularly important given the escalation of crime where members of the community, expected to be provided with quality service. From the result it seems as if the training was delivered through a combination of structured activities, group discussions and tutor-led presentations. An example activity, designed to enable participants to implement their knowledge of CBT and assessment, from the results, could have involved respondents receiving a piece of student work such as but not included to a 2500 word essay and the accompanying assessment specification. In the first part of the activity, the participants could have worked in small groups to create an assessment tool of their choice (either a rubric, checklist, or grading scale) that could be used to assess the sample student's work. It is encouraging that the respondents' responses indicated that after the training course had been developed, it was reviewed by experts in CBT.

Table 2 indicates how respondents in different categories responded to this statement. Commanders differed significantly in their responses with a P-value of 0.014, while the rest of the respondents' views did not differ significantly. With regard to courses attended, there were also no significant differences in the responses, with most respondents agreeing with the statement. Police members who received good training will be confident in dealing with clients. When faced with challenges, they will know how to address them. This is important as officers sometimes book off sick due to frustration arising from a lack of training. The range of competencies required can differ based on an individual's role, and their level of proficiency may also vary. Advancing along the development continuum may entail attending workshops focused on guideline development, participating in self-directed learning, and contributing to guideline efforts. At each stage, learners are expected to demonstrate the milestones required for that level, as well as those at lower levels if relevant.

The degree of expertise and dedication of a company's workforce in striving towards organizational objectives is a crucial determinant of its distinctive competence. Employees who lack sufficient training are prone to underperforming in their roles and experiencing heightened levels of work-related stress. Addressing absenteeism in the workplace has long been a challenging issue for both employers and employees. This research aimed to uncover the underlying causes and consequences of absenteeism, with the findings expected to offer valuable insights for human resource management and help mitigate absenteeism among employees in workplaces. In his study Munro (2007 as cited in Kipangule, 2017, p. 3), Dhlewayo, Bello and Mofokeng (2021) It is imperative to conduct research to evaluate the extent of perceptions and actual loss of working hours due to absenteeism. Absenteeism occurs when employees purposefully miss work. While occasional absences are common in most workplaces, persistent absenteeism poses significant challenges for organizations. When employees consistently miss work, it can create difficulties for the organization as other team members may need to cover for their absence or essential tasks may remain undone. This can result in decreased productivity and the inability to deliver intended services, which can negatively impact the company's reputation and standing (Kipangule, 2017).

Where a commanding officer directs a member to undergo training, and the order is lawful, reasonable, and falls within the member's responsibilities, it is reasonable for the commanding officer to expect compliance with the order. Refusal to obey a lawful and reasonable training directive would typically constitute insubordination, which could lead to disciplinary action. However, there are circumstances in which an employee may be justified in refusing to participate

in training, particularly if they have a disability that prevents them from fulfilling the request. In such cases, initiating disciplinary measures for failure to comply with a training request could potentially be deemed unlawful discrimination. Additionally, if reasonable adjustments are not made to the training arrangements to accommodate the disabled employee, it may also constitute disability discrimination. If the training request itself is unreasonable, such as requiring the employee to undergo training during their own free time, they should reasonably be able to decline without facing disciplinary action. This could also apply if the training presents unreasonable travel or childcare challenges, such as when the training location differs from the employee's usual workplace. The circumstances and overall context will play a significant role, as not every refusal can be automatically justified or condemned. Unscheduled absenteeism significantly hinders organizational progress, resulting in decreased productivity, increased expenses from hiring additional staff, and reduced employee morale. It is perceived as a management issue with financial implications. Absenteeism influences the proficiency, profitability and control of an institution (Boer, Elpine, Bakker, Syroit & Schaufeli, 2002 as cited in Khan, Nawaz, Qureshi & Khan, 2016, p. 6). It reflects the employee's lack of commitment and loyalty to the organization. Efforts to improve employee productivity should adopt a holistic approach that includes initiatives to enhance employee well-being and engagement strategies. In today's highly competitive global economy, organizations require a healthier and more engaged workforce (Godin & Kittel, 2004 as cited by Khan et al., 2016, p. 6). Therefore, managers are implementing various programs aimed at promoting employee welfare and enhancing job performance.

**Table 2. Respondents' perceptions on whether trainees are able to use the knowledge and skills acquired in their work by category and courses attended**

Category	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total	Chiz	PV
Commander	6 11.11	18 8.82	11 23.40	5 35.71	0 0.00	40 12.20	16.222	0.014
Supervisor	6 11.11	32 15.69	8 17.02	2 14.29	1 11.11	49 14.94	0.981	1.000
Trainee	37 68.52	133 65.20	22 46.81	6 42.86	8 88.89	206 62.80	11.408	0.112
Trainer	3 5.56	20 9.80	4 8.51	0 0.00	0 0.00	27 8.23	3.247	1.000
Others	2 3.70	29 14.22	12 25.53	3 21.43	2 22.22	48 14.63	10.593	0.158
<b>Total</b>	<b>54</b>	<b>232</b>	<b>57</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>370</b>		
Courses Attended	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total	Chiz	PV
Detectives	13 24.53	64 32.65	15 34.88	4 33.33	3 33.33	99 31.63	1.570	1.000
Mentor	4 7.55	28 14.29	4 9.30	3 25.00	2 22.22	41 12.10	4.373	1.000
Train the trainer	1 1.89	23 11.73	6 13.95	0 0.00	1 11.11	31 9.90	6.678	1.000

Junior Management	4 7.55	27 13.78	6 13.95	1 8.33	1 11.11	39 12.46	1.774	1.000
National Certificate	8 15.09	29 14.80	4 9.30	2 16.67	2 22.22	45 14.38	1.451	1.000
Senior Management	4 7.55	12 6.12	1 2.33	1 8.33	1 11.11	19 6.07	1.770	1.000
CSC	18 33.96	48 24.49	7 16.28	3 25.00	1 11.11	77 24.60	4.995	1.000
Other	15 28.30	58 29.59	14 32.56	6 50.00	5 55.56	98 31.31	4.932	1.000
<b>Total</b>	<b>67</b>	<b>289</b>	<b>57</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>449</b>		

Source: Researchers' illustration

According to Delery and Roumpi (2017), Human capital is a fundamental asset for gaining a competitive edge, as it cannot be replicated or purchased in the market. Training plays a crucial role in enhancing individual performance by providing abilities, knowledge, and skills, ultimately contributing to organizational performance. This study posits that training programs with well-defined objectives can effectively address knowledge gaps, skill deficiencies, and negative attitudes. Inadequate communication may lead to trainees showing less enthusiasm or even a negative attitude toward the program. Additionally, the depth of trainers' knowledge significantly impacts the effectiveness of training. Ensuring timely organization of training is a serious concern for the SAPS in updating employees' knowledge and skills. The authors also expressed concern about whether the knowledge, skills, and attitudes acquired from training programs can be successfully applied to the job.

**Statement 2: Perceptions on whether the training programme enhanced trainees' confidence**

**Table 3. Respondents' perceptions on whether the training programme enhanced trainees' confidence by years of service**

Source: Researchers' illustration

Years of Service	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total
0 – 3	10(20.41)	34(39.69)	3(6.12)	1(2.04)	1(2.04)	49(100)
4 – 6	4(10.00)	28(70.00)	4(10.00)	4(10.00)	0(6.00)	40(100)
7 – 9	11(17.19)	43(67.19)	9(14.06)	0(0.00)	1(1.56)	64(100)
10 – 12	4(15.38)	13(50.00)	6(23.08)	2(7.69)	1(3.85)	26(100)
13	20(13.42)	97(65.10)	22(14.77)	8(5.37)	2(1.34)	149
Total	49(13.34)	215(65.55)	44(13.41)	15(4.57)	5(1.52)	329(100)

Table 3 reveals that the majority of the respondents (79%) agreed that the training programme enhanced trainees' level of confidence, while 6% disagreed and 13% were uncertain. The analysis showed that across all courses attended, members felt that the training improved their confidence levels. As previously mentioned, it is crucial to ensure that training is mutually beneficial for both employees and the organization. This can be accomplished by aligning training objectives with the needs of both employees and the organization. Upon soliciting feedback from employees about their training experiences and whether the program enhanced their confidence,



the majority of respondents expressed appreciation for the training and rated it as excellent, definitely agree, or agree. However, a few employees rated the training as very poor, indicating that they still derived some benefit from it. Some respondents admitted that the training they received was not effective for their specific job requirements. This could be attributed to the fact that these respondents were not consulted about their training needs, and instead, management imposed the training on them. Additionally, some participants noted that the training did not improve their skills or performance, leading them to rate it as ineffective. The table below illustrates the diverse responses regarding their training experiences.

**Table 4. Respondents' perceptions on whether the training programme enhanced trainees' confidence by category and courses attended**

Category	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total	Chiz	PV
Commander	6 12.24	23 10.70	9 20.45	2 13.33	0 0.00	40 12.20	3.966	1.000
Supervisor	8 16.33	35 16.28	4 9.09	1 6.67	1 20.00	49 14.94	2.471	1.000
Trainee	30 61.22	137 63.72	25 56.82	10 66.67	4 80.00	206 62.80	1.533	1.000
Trainer	3 6.12	18 8.37	5 11.36	1 6.67	0 0.00	27 8.23	1.363	1.000
Others	2 4.08	27 12.56	13 29.55	4 26.67	2 40.00	48 14.63	17.254	0.009
<b>Total</b>	<b>49</b>	<b>240</b>	<b>56</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>370</b>		
Courses Attended	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total	Chiz	PV
Detectives	14 28.57	69 33.66	11 26.83	5 38.46	0 0.00	99 31.63	3.633	1.000
Mentor	5 10.20	30 14.63	5 12.20	1 7.69	0 0.00	41 13.10	1.902	1.000
Train the trainer	4 8.16	21 10.24	5 12.20	1 7.69	0 0.00	31 9.90	1.055	1.000
Junior Management	6 12.24	27 13.17	5 12.20	1 7.69	0 0.00	39 12.46	1.082	1.000
National Certificate	9 18.37	32 15.61	2 4.88	2 15.38	0 0.00	45 14.38	4.742	1.000
Senior Management	5 10.20	13 6.34	1 2.44	0 0.00	0 0.00	19 6.07	3.606	1.000
CSC	15 30.61	48 23.41	10 24.39	2 15.38	2 40.00	77 24.60	2.346	1.000
Other	17 34.69	58 28.29	14 34.15	6 46.15	3 60.00	98 31.31	4.528	1.000
<b>Total</b>	<b>75</b>	<b>298</b>	<b>53</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>449</b>		

Source: Researchers' illustration

However, Table 4 shows that respondents in the category, 'others' differed significantly in their views ( $P = 0,009$ ) from commanders, supervisors, trainees and trainers on the question of whether the training programme enhanced trainees' confidence. Monitoring mechanisms should be adopted at station level to assess the impact of training. In pursuing transformation, SAPS should accord training high priority. Stations should consider sending a whole shift to attend training together rather than sending one member who, on his/her return finds that he/she is

unable to change the rest of the team and reverts back to the old way of doing things. In terms of courses attended, there were no significant differences among the respondents. The above responses clearly showed that respondents are more productive when they are fully knowledgeable about what they are supposed to do, how they are supposed to do it and when they are supposed to do it.

The skills and the knowledge that they acquire about the job are what makes them more efficient and effective. The response above also showed that training can be very effective in improving job performance, changing attitude and behaviour towards individual job. Commenting on that aspect, Stevenson et al. (2014) noted that training and development systems make employees become more conscious of their roles and responsibilities when it comes to achieving organisational goals and targets. They argue that employees who are trained to work as a team are more likely to undertake the organisational goals and strategic objectives.

**Statement 3: Perceptions on whether training enables trainees to meet their performance objectives**

**Table 5. Respondents' perceptions on whether training enables trainees to meet their performance objectives by years of service**

Source: Researchers' illustration (Chi-square = 24.0957 P = 0.087)

Years of Service	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total
0 – 3	12(24.49)	30(61.22)	3(6.12)	3(6.12)	1(2.04)	49(100.00)
4 – 6	2(5.00)	28(70.00)	6(15.00)	4(10.00)	0(0.00)	40(100.00)
7 – 9	10(15.63)	45(70.31)	8(12.50)	0(0.00)	1(1.56)	64(100.00)
10 – 12	6(23.08)	12(46.15)	4(15.38)	3(11.54)	1(3.85)	26(100.00)
13	13(8.72)	100(67.11)	24(16.11)	10(6.71)	2(1.34)	149(100.00)
Total	43(13.11)	156(65.55)	45(13.72)	20(6.10)	5(1.52)	328(100.00)

Table 5 shows that 75% of the respondents agreed that the training programme enabled trainees to meet their performance objectives, while 8% disagreed. The respondents did not differ significantly in their responses to this question. This suggests that after training, employees should be placed in posts where they are best able to use their newly acquired skills. Respondents' views especially commanders and commissioned officials were important as they have extensive experience. However, this should not be taken to mean that the views of those with less service are of less value. The results of the survey showed that the overall perceptions of respondents indicating that generally the SAPS members agreed and had a positive perception of the potential of CBT in instilling members' skills. The results also showed that the probability of adoption of CBT is positively influenced by participation in CBT workshops, effective supervision or mentorship of trainees after undergoing training, availability of teaching aids and availability of incentives.

Feedback on the impact of training on employees' skills revealed that it improved their skills and technical knowledge, ultimately enabling them to perform their duties more effectively. This enhancement in skills is seen as crucial for improving the quality of employees' productivity. Greer (2021) It is argued that organizations that prioritize investing in their human resources view training as an opportunity to enhance long-term productivity. This perspective is valid, given that training can address various organizational challenges such as subpar quality of work resulting from skills gaps and high employee turnover. Consequently, training aligned with organizational objectives typically improves the quality of products produced by employees (Laudon & Laudon, 2017).

**Table 6. Respondents' perceptions on whether training enables trainees to meet their performance objectives by category and courses attended**

Category	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total	Chiz	PV
Commander	4 9.30	20 9.30	12 26.67	4 20.00	0 0.00	40 12.20	12.650	0.066
Supervisor	4 9.30	36 16.74	5 11.11	4 20.00	0 0.00	49 14.94	3.427	1.000
Trainee	33 76.74	136 63.26	22 48.89	10 50.00	5 100.00	206 62.80	11.691	0.099
Trainer	0 0.00	21 9.77	5 11.11	1 5.00	0 0.00	27 8.23	5.747	1.000
Others	3 6.98	30 13.95	10 22.22	3 15.00	2 40.00	48 14.63	6.749	0.749
Total	44	243	54	22	7	370		
Courses Attended	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total	Chiz	PV
Detectives	12 27.91	70 33.82	11 27.50	5 27.78	1 20.00	99 31.63	1.485	1.000
Mentor	6 13.95	27 13.04	6 15.00	2 11.11	0 0.00	41 13.10	0.971	1.000
Train the trainer	0 0.00	24 11.59	5 12.50	2 11.11	0 0.00	31 9.90	6.271	1.000
Junior Management	3 6.98	27 13.04	6 15.00	3 16.67	0 0.00	39 12.46	2.490	1.000
National Certificate	6 13.95	30 14.49	4 10.00	5 27.78	0 0.00	45 14.38	4.096	1.000
Senior Management	4 9.30	13 6.28	0 0.00	2 11.11	0 0.00	19 6.09	4.514	1.000
CSC	15 34.88	48 23.19	7 17.50	6 33.33	1 20.00	77 24.60	4.558	1.000
Other	15 34.88	61 29.47	13 32.50	6 33.33	3 60.00	98 31.31	2.556	1.000
Total	61	300	52	31	5	449		

Source: Researchers' illustration

Table 6 shows that the responses of commanders and trainees differed significantly from those of supervisors and trainers. This suggests that if the same study were to be repeated, the results would differ. In terms of courses attended, the responses did not differ significantly.

**Statement 4: Perceptions on whether the working environment allows trainees to practice what they have learnt.**

**Table 7. Respondents' perceptions on whether the working environment allows trainees to practice what they have learnt by years of service**

Source: Researchers' illustration (Chi-square = 25.0436 P = 0.069)

Years of Service	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total
0 – 3	14(28.57)	24(49.98)	7(14.29)	3(6.12)	1(2.04)	49(100.00)
4 – 6	6(15.00)	24(60.00)	4(10.00)	4(10.00)	2(5.00)	40(100.00)
7 – 9	10(15.63)	37(57.81)	16(25.00)	0(0.00)	1(1.56)	64(100.00)
10 – 12	4(15.38)	12(46.15)	4(15.38)	4(15.38)	2(7.69)	26(100.00)
13	17(11.41)	75(50.34)	36(24.16)	17(11.41)	4(2.68)	10(100.00)
Total	51(15.55)	172(52.44)	67(20.43)	28(8.54)	14(4.30)	328(100.00)

Table 7 show that 68% of the respondents across all categories of years of service agreed that the working environment allows trainees to apply what they learnt in training, while 11% disagreed. Training serves no purpose if employees are not given a chance to practice what they have learnt. It is essential for participants' learning to have the capability to remember basic rules and possess a variety of factual knowledge related to the job area. Even more critical is the ability to analyze specific situations, identify key elements, and make decisions regarding the most effective procedure, such as determining whether Procedure A is preferable to Procedure D. Regarding necessary skills, it is crucial to select the most suitable procedure or approach based on factors such as the nature of the problem and the organizational context (Romiszowski, 2016).

Table 8 shows that commanders, supervisor, trainees and trainers did not differ significantly in their responses to the question of whether management allows trainees to practice what they learnt in training. However, the views of the 'others' category differed significantly with a P- value of 0.032. In terms of courses attended, there were no significant differences.

**Table 8. Respondents' perceptions on whether the working environment allows trainees to practice what they have learnt by category and courses attended**

Category	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total	Chiz	PV
Commander	6 11.76	18 10.47	12 17.91	4 14.29	0 0.00	40 12.20	4.037	1.000
Supervisor	5 9.80	30 17.44	10 14.93	3 10.71	1 10.00	49 14.94	2.491	1.000
Trainee	38 74.51	108 62.79	34 50.75	17 60.71	9 90.00	206 62.80	10.380	0.172
Trainer	1 1.96	14 8.14	9 13.43	3 10.71	0 0.00	27 8.23	6.182	0.930
Others	2 3.92	21 12.21	18 26.87	5 17.86	2 20.00	48 14.63	13.982	0.032
Total	52	191	83	32	12	370		
Courses Attended	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total	Chiz	PV
Detectives	14 29.17	54 32.14	22 34.92	7 28.00	2 22.22	99 31.53	6.991	1.000



Mentor	3 6.25	23 13.69	10 15.87	5 20.00	0 0.00	41 13.10	4.858	1.000
Train the trainer	2 4.17	19 11.31	9 14.29	1 4.00	0 0.00	31 9.90	5.464	1.000
Junior Management	4 8.33	25 14.88	8 12.70	2 8.00	0 0.00	39 12.46	3.392	1.000
National Certificate	10 20.83	25 14.88	5 7.94	4 16.00	1 11.11	5 14.38	3.914	1.000
Senior Management	4 8.33	12 7.44	0 0.00	3 12.00	0 0.00	19 6.07	6.965	1.000
CSC	15 31.25	42 25.00	14 22.22	4 16.00	2 22.22	77 24.60	2.375	1.000
Other	13 27.08	48 28.57	21 33.33	11 44.00	5 55.56	98 31.31	5.436	1.000
<b>Total</b>	<b>65</b>	<b>248</b>	<b>89</b>	<b>37</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>449</b>		

Source: Researchers' illustration

**Statement 6: Perceptions on whether trainees are competent to handle their job after training****Table 9. Respondents' perceptions on whether trainees are competent to handle their job after training by years of service**

Source: Researchers' illustration (Chi-square = 27.2164 P = 0.039)

Years of Service	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total
0 – 3	12(25.00)	29(60.42)	3(6.25)	3(6.25)	3(6.25)	3(6.25)
4 – 6	6(15.00)	21(42.50)	7(17.50)	5(12.50)	5(12.50)	5(12.50)
7 – 9	14(21.88)	36(56.50)	12(18.75)	1(1.56)	1(1.56)	1(1.56)
10 – 12	5(19.23)	11(42.31)	4(15.38)	4(15.38)	4(15.38)	4(15.38)
13	15(10.07)	75(50.4)	41(27.52)	11(7.38)	11(7.38)	11(7.38)
Total	52(15.90)	172(52.60)	67(20.49)	24(7.34)	24(7.34)	24(7.34)

Table 9 indicates that 68 % of the respondents across the different years of service agreed that trainees were competent to handle their job after training, while 10% disagreed. The association between the above statement and years of service is not significant at 5 % level of significance with a P-value of 0.039. This suggests that the respondents have confidence in the training provided.

Only the 'others' category differed significantly from the rest of the groups, with a P-value of 0.010. Training should build confidence and skills that enable an employee to perform better. Organisations send staff for training because they seek to improve productivity. While few of the respondents attended the senior management course, their responses did not differ significantly from the other categories. Regarding courses attended, the views of respondents who attended the mentorship and national certificate courses differed significantly from those that attended other courses. Research indicates that many professionals and scholars utilize Kirkpatrick's (1998) taxonomy to assess the outcomes of training programs. Kirkpatrick identifies four levels: (1) trainees' reactions to the training; (2) the extent to which they have acquired new knowledge or skills; (3) whether this learning is effectively applied on the job and leads to improved performance and capability; and (4) the broader impact on business outcomes or the environment. Here, our focus is on the third level, which examines whether the application of trained knowledge, skills,

and attitudes in the workplace enhances job task performance and overall work performance. In this context, Xiao (1996) discusses how training contributes to enhancing employee productivity efficiency. Additionally, Blanchard and Thacker (2023) It is argued that training programs are designed to provide opportunities for enhancing essential skills required for both current and future job roles. This suggests that training programs not only aim to improve the quality of current tasks and work performance but also aim to support trainees in developing competencies to adapt to future challenges. The results presented in Tables 8 and 9 indicate that, firstly, the findings of this study affirm the significance of post-training workplace experiences. Specifically, how trainees perceive the work environment three months after training serves as a stronger indicator of knowledge transfer compared to perceptions immediately following the training. The results underscore that commanders who offer support to trainees in implementing what they have learned during training sessions facilitate the transfer of training to the workplace. Additionally, supervisor support and job autonomy directly influence the transfer of training.

The fact that SAPS trainees are employed during their training could explain why they may rely less on their supervisors in the workplace while undergoing training compared to after they return to their jobs. It has become evident that for trainees to effectively transfer their training, they require supervisory support after the training period. Therefore, their experience of support from the work environment upon returning to their workplace will significantly impact the extent of training transfer. Interestingly, none of the preferred support, supervisor support, or job autonomy at the end of the training directly influences training transfer, whereas preferred support, supervisor support, and job autonomy after training do.

**Table 10. Respondents' perceptions on whether trainees are competent to handle their job after training by category and courses attended**

Category	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total	Chiz	PV
Commander	4 7.69	18 10.40	13 19.40	4 17.39	1 8.33	40 12.23	5.486	1.000
Supervisor	5 9.62	28 16.18	13 19.40	2 8.70	1 8.33	49 14.98	3.530	1.000
Trainee	37 71.15	114 65.90	33 49.25	13 56.52	8 66.67	205 62.69	7.980	0.462
Trainer	4 7.69	12 6.94	7 25.37	3 13.04	1 28.33	27 8.23	1.540	1.000
Others	4 7.69	17 9.83	17 25.37	7 30.43	3 25.00	48 14.68	16.977	0.010
<b>Total</b>	<b>54</b>	<b>189</b>	<b>83</b>	<b>29</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>369</b>		
Courses Attended	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total	Chiz	PV
Detectives	11 22.00	60 35.93	21 34.43	4 18.18	3 25.00	99 31.73	5.864	1.000
Mentor	2 4.00	26 15.57	8 13.11	5 22.73	0 0.00	41 13.14	8.09	0.701
Train the trainer	3	18	7	2	1	31	1.212	1.000

	6.00	10.78	11.48	9.09	8.33	9.94		
Junior Management	5 10.00	21 12.57	9 14.75	4 18.18	0 0.00	39 12.50	2.934	1.000
National Certificate	9 18.00	24 14.37	4 6.56	7 31.82	0 0.00	44 14.10	11.174	0.197
Senior Management	4 8.00	11 6.59	2 3.28	2 9.09	0 0.00	19 6.09	2.359	1.000
CSC	13 26.00	37 22.16	17 27.87	5 22.73	5 41.67	77 24.68	2.861	1.000
Other	17 34.00	52 31.14	19 31.15	5 22.73	5 41.69	19 31.41	1.519	1.000
<b>Total</b>	<b>64</b>	<b>249</b>	<b>87</b>	<b>34</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>448</b>		

Source: Researchers' illustration

**Statement 7: Perceptions on lack of discipline amongst trainees which affects training**

In terms of years of service, the responses were divided on this issue, with 38% agreeing that a lack of discipline among trainees affects training, while 36% disagreed. The responses differed significantly by years of service, with  $P = 0.081$ , which indicates that if the research were to be repeated, the responses would differ.

Table 12 shows that commanders differed significantly in their responses to this question, with a P-value of 0.538. In terms of courses, the majority of the respondents attended detective and CSC courses and their responses differed significantly with a P-value of 0.238. This means that some respondents believed that trainees lack discipline and that this affects their performance in training. Management needs to take strong action against any trainee that exhibits ill-discipline during training.

**Table 11. Respondents' perceptions on lack of discipline amongst trainees which affects training by years of service**

Source: Researchers' illustration (Chi-square = 24.4066 P= 0.081)

Years of Service	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total
0 – 3	5(10.20)	15(30.61)	10(20.410)	12(24.49)	7(14.29)	49(100.00)
4 – 6	5(12.50)	9(22.50)	12(30.00)	9(22.50)	5(12.50)	40(100.00)
7 – 9	10(15.63)	23(35.94)	16(25.00)	13(20.31)	2(3.13)	64(100.00)
10 – 12	5(19.23)	9(34.62)	5(19.23)	5(19.23)	2(7.69)	24(100.00)
13	6(4.05)	37(25.00)	40(27.03)	52(35.14)	13(8.78)	148(100.00)
Total	31(9.48)	93(28.44)	83(25.38)	91(27.83)	29(8.87)	327(100.00)

Tables 11 and 12 indicated that respondents reported their concerns about the different views of discipline from the perspective of administrators. The findings highlighted that the commanders focused on some aspects other than performance that related to social behaviour. The commanders expected trainees to be nice and respectful to trainers and other fellow trainees, to protect training centre's property and to wear their uniform properly where necessary. These concerns reflected the fact that from commanders' perspectives, the training facilities are



4 somehow seen as separate settings where trainers are assumed to have total control of discipline issues, for which the SAPS training centres policies might not have clear rules. Minor disruptive behaviours such as chatting or playing while in class have become part of the daily routine of the classroom, since no consequences follow due to the lack of time and trainers to implement centres' code regulations in large classes. 4 These comments give a sense of despair or discouragement that reflects the gap between the stated discipline policies and what really happens in the classroom.

4 This implies a need for trainers' empowerment programmes to prepare new trainers for those challenges providing them with skills to cope with the unexpected events that might arise in a classroom with discipline problems and expose them to teaching as early as possible in the corresponding training programme. 4 The term "discipline problems" is multifaceted, carrying different meanings depending on the perspective of those involved in the teaching process. Trainers, administrators, and trainees often have varying interpretations of discipline issues in the classroom and respond differently based on their roles and circumstances. For teachers, discipline involves managing class behavior and facilitating active interaction; for administrators, it pertains to maintaining order, good conduct, and a peaceful environment; and for students, it relates to adherence to rules, instructions, and policies. This diversity in understanding discipline underscores the importance of policymakers and school administrators providing teachers with consistent support and clear guidelines to ensure a conducive teaching environment at all levels. Addressing discipline issues promptly is essential for achieving the quality standards set by the educational system (Corzo & Contreras, 2011).

**Table 12. Respondents' perceptions on lack of discipline amongst trainees which affects training by category and courses attended**

Category	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total	Chiz	PV
Commander	0 0.00	9 9.57	13 15.66	15 16.67	3 10.36	40 12.23	7.593	0.538
Supervisor	3 9.68	16 17.02	14 16.87	15 16.67	1 3.45	49 14.98	4.452	1.000
Trainee	23 74.19	630 67.02	47 56.63	52 57.78	20 68.97	205 62.69	5.229	1.000
Trainer	4 12.90	6 6.38	7 8.43	6 6.67	3 10.34	26 7.95	1.811	1.000
Others	2 6.45	10 10.64	16 19.28	14 15.56	5 17.24	47 14.37	4.564	1.000
<b>Total</b>	<b>32</b>	<b>104</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>102</b>	<b>32</b>	<b>367</b>		
Courses Attended	Definitely agree	Agree	Uncertain	Disagree	Definitely disagree	Total	Chiz	PV
Detectives	9 29.03	34 36.96	25 33.33	23 24.74	8 28.57	99 31.73	2.469	1.000
Mentor	3 9.68	11 11.96	9 12.00	16 18.60	2 7.14	41 13.14	3.656	1.000
Train the trainer	1 3.23	8 8.70	5 6.67	12 13.95	5 17.86	31 9.94	6.128	1.000



Junior Management	2 6.45	12 13.04	8 10.67	15 17.44	2 7.14	39 12.50	3.947	1.000
National Certificate	1 6.45	22 11.96	10 13.33	15 17.44	7 25.00	45 14.42	5.294	1.000
Senior Management	3 9.68	7 7.61	5 6.67	2 2.33	2 7.14	19 6.09	3.298	1.000
CSC	8 25.81	21 22.83	18 24.00	23 26.74	6 21.43	76 24.36	0.554	1.000
Other	10 32.26	19 20.65	22 29.33	37 43.02	10 35.71	98 31.41	10.727	0.238
<b>Total</b>	<b>38</b>	<b>123</b>	<b>102</b>	<b>143</b>	<b>42</b>	<b>448</b>		

Source: Researchers' illustration

## CONCLUSION

This article is focused more specifically on the understanding of the respondents' perceptions, learning, learning transfer and experience of the learning programme. The findings from the responses highlighted that most respondents were satisfied with the quality of learning during the facilitation, transfer of learning to the workplace and intervention mechanisms. This study focused on trainees' post-training competency. Most of the respondents agreed that trainees use the knowledge and skills acquired at work and that they are competent to handle their job after training. The challenges encountered are discussed in this study under recommendations. Management's efforts should be directed at promoting behaviour and performance that enable SAPS to achieve its mission and objectives. Apart from appointing high quality trainers and deploying strategies that unlock members' potential, management also needs to show that it looks after employees. This will inspire all to give their best.

## REFERENCES

- Bezuidenhout, R., Davis, C. and Du Plooy-Cilliers, F., (2014). Research matters. *Quantitative data analysis*, pp.228–251.
- Blaikie, N., & Priest, J. (2019). *Designing social research: The logic of anticipation*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Blanchard, P. N., & Thacker, J. W. (2023). *Effective training: Systems, strategies, and practices*. SAGE Publications.
- Brantingham, P. L., & Brantingham, P. J. (2017). 21 Nodes, paths and edges: Considerations on the complexity of crime and the physical environment. In *Social, ecological and environmental theories of crime* (pp. 363–388). Routledge.

- Chauke, C., Motlalekgosi, P., & Mofokeng, J. (2022). Exploring police methods and challenges of identifying human trafficking activities in the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality, South Africa. *International Journal of Research in Business and Social Science* (2147–4478), 11(9), 250–264. <https://doi.org/10.20525/ijrbs.v11i9.2203>.
- Choudhury, G. P. & Sharma. V. (2019). Review and comparison of various training effectiveness evaluation models for R & D Organization performance. Comparison of training effectiveness evaluation models for R&D. *PM World Journal Comparison of training effectiveness evaluation models for R&D* Vol. VIII, Issue II – February 2019.
- Corzo, J. Q. & Contreras, O. R. (2011). Understanding and facing discipline-related challenges in the English as a foreign language classroom at public schools. *Profile: Issues in Teachers' Professional Development*, 13 (2), 59-72.
- Davis, A., Jansen van Rensburg, M., & Venter, P. (2016). The impact of managerialism on the strategy work of university middle managers. *Studies in Higher Education*, 41(8), 1480–1494.
- Delery, J. E., & Roumpi, D. (2017). Strategic human resource management, human capital and competitive advantage: is the field going in circles? *Human Resource Management Journal*, 27(1), 1–21.
- Dhlewayo, N.M., Bello, P.O. & Mofokeng, J.T. (2021). Missing in action: Perspectives on employee absenteeism in the South African Police Service. *Cogent Social Sciences*, 1-17. DOI: 10.1080/23311886.2021.1964200.
- Fourie, C. J., & Chimusoro, O. (2018). AN Examination of the relationship between Supply Chain Management Practices and Business Performance: A Case Analysis of a Passenger Rail Company. *South African Journal of Industrial Engineering* August 2018 vol 29(2), pp 141-152.
- Gill, M., & Sharma, G. (2013). Evaluation of Vocational Training Program from the Trainees' Perspective: An Empirical Study. *Pacific Business Review International* Volume 6, Issue 5, November 2013.
- Greer, C. R. (2021). *Strategic human resource management*. Pearson Custom Publishing.
- Haddouchane, Z. A., Bakkali, S., Ajana, S., & Gassemi, K. (2017). The application of the competency-based approach to assess the training and employment adequacy problem. *International Journal of Education*, 5(1):1–18.
- Hau-Nung, C.A. & Ka-ki, L. (2013). Women police officers in Hong Kong: Femininity and policing in a gendered organization. *Journal of Comparative Asian Development* 12(3): 489-515.
- Helfgott, J.B., Gunnison, E., Murtagh, A. & Navejar, B.(2018).BADASSES: The Rise of Women in Criminal Justice. *Women & Criminal Justice*,28(4):235-261.

- International Labour Organization. (2020). Competency-Based Training (CBT): An Introductory Manual for Practitioners. International Labour Office, CH-1211 Geneva 22, Switzerland.
- Jiang, T., Geller, J., Ni, D., & Collura, J. (2016). Unmanned Aircraft System traffic management: Concept of operation and system architecture. *International Journal of Transportation Science and Technology*, 5(3), 123–135.
- Khan, I., Nawaz, A., Qureshi, Q.A & Khan, Z.A. (2016). The Impacts of Burnout, Absenteeism and Commitment on Intention to Leave. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 7(1), 5-9.
- Kipangule, R.A. (2017). *An assessment on the impact of employees absenteeism on performance in local government authorities: A case of Busokelo District Council*. A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Human Resource Management of the Open University of Tanzania.
- Kleygrewe, L., Oudejans, R.R.D., Koedijk, M., & Hutter, R.I.V. (2022). Police Training in Practice: Organization and Delivery According to European Law Enforcement Agencies. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 12:798067. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2021.798067.
- Kolb, D. A. (2014). *Experiential learning: Experience as the source of learning and development*. FT press.
- Kirkpatrick, D. L. (1998). *Evaluating Training Programs: The Four Levels* (2nd edn.). (San Francisco, CA: Berrett-Koehler).
- Laudon, K. C., & Laudon, J. P. (2017). *Essentials of management information systems*. Pearson
- Mdhlalose, D. (2020). An Evaluation of the Impact of Training and Development on Organisational Performance: A Case Study of the Gauteng Provincial Department of Economic Development. *Journal of Human Resource and Sustainability Studies*, 8, 48-74. <https://doi.org/10.4236/jhrss.2020.81004>.
- Melwich, W.A., & Mofokeng, J.T. (2020). Middle managers' influence as role models upon employees' morale in the South African Police Service. *Acta Criminologica*, 33(1), 59-74.
- Mnisi, B.N. (2015). *An evaluation of training and development for the South African Police Service: A case of Vereeniging Cluster*. (Unpublished master's mini-dissertation). North-West University, Potchefstroom.
- Modise, J.M., Taylor, D., & Raga, K. (2022). Monitoring and Evaluation of Training Programmes in the South African Police Service: Case Study of the Northern Cape Province. *Advances in Applied Sociology*, 12, 299-316. <https://doi.org/10.4236/aasoci.2022.127024>

- Mofokeng, J., & Aphane, M. (2022). Exploring influence between employee motivation and service quality in the South African Police Service. *International Journal of Research in Business and Social Science*, 11(2), 487–497. <https://doi.org/10.20525/ijrbs.v11i2.1692>.
- Mofokeng, J.T. (2020). Learning to forget: A critical review of knowledge management and knowledge exchange initiatives in the Detective Service. *International Journal of Criminology & Sociology*, 9, 1660-1675.
- Mohlala, G. (2011). *Effects of the Skills Development Act 97 of 1998 on transforming management training and development: A case study of the Greater Tubatse Local Municipality*. (Unpublished master's mini-dissertation). University of South Africa, Pretoria.
- Mokoena, M.M., Pheiffer, D.C., & Mofokeng, J.T. (2022). "Going nowhere slowly" – An exploration of the South African police service's promotion policy. *European Journal of Economics, Law and Social Sciences*, 6(1), 63-76. IIPCCL Publishing, Graz-Austria. <https://iipccl.org>.
- Mokoena, M.M. (2018). *An examination of police promotion policy: The case study of Gauteng Central Region*. (Unpublished master's dissertation). Tshwane University of Technology, Pretoria.
- Mvuyisi, M., & Mbukanma, I. (2023). Assessing the impact of on-the-job training on employee performance: A case of integrated tertiary software users in a rural university. *International Journal of Research in Business and Social Science*, 12(1), 90–98. <https://doi.org/10.20525/ijrbs.v12i1.2248>.
- Prasongmanee, C., Wannapiroon, P. & Nilsook, P. (2022). Competency Experience-Based Training (CEBT) Model with Ubiquitous Community of Practice (U-CoP) to Enhance Transformation Digital Supervisor. *International Education Studies*, 15(5), 146-152.
- Rodriguez, J., & Walters, K. (2017). The importance of training and development in employee performance and evaluation. *World Wide Journal of Multidisciplinary Research and Development*, 3(10), 206–212.
- Romisowski, A. J. (2016). *Designing instructional systems: Decision making in course planning and curriculum design*. Routledge
- South Africa. (1995). *Police Service Act No 68 of 1995*. Government Printer.
- South Africa. (2011). *National Development Plan 2030: Our future – make it work*. Pretoria: Government Printer.
- South African Police Service (SAPS). (2015). *National Instruction 3 of 2015: Promotion and grade progression of employees of the service from post level 1 to 12 and from constable to colonel*. Pretoria: SAPS.



- Stevenson, W. J., Hojati, M., & Cao, J. (2014). *Operations management*. McGraw-Hill Education New York.
- Wolfe S.E., McLean K., Rojek J., Alpert G.P., & Smith M.R. (2019). Advancing a theory of police officer training motivation and receptivity. *Justice Quarterly*, 1–23. doi: 10.1080/07418825.2019.1703027.
- Wongnaa, C.A., Boachie, W.K. (2018). Perception and adoption of competency-based training by academics in Ghana. *IJ STEM Ed* 5, 52. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40594-018-0148-x>.
- Xiao, J. (1996). The relationship between organizational factors and the transfer of training in the electronics industry in Shenzhen, China. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 7, 55–73.

# Evaluation of Trainees' Post-Training Competency in the South African Police Service

## ORIGINALITY REPORT

26%

SIMILARITY INDEX

25%

INTERNET SOURCES

11%

PUBLICATIONS

12%

STUDENT PAPERS

## PRIMARY SOURCES

1	<a href="http://www.ssbfnnet.com">www.ssbfnnet.com</a> Internet Source	7%
2	<a href="http://researchspace.ukzn.ac.za">researchspace.ukzn.ac.za</a> Internet Source	2%
3	<a href="http://stemeducationjournal.springeropen.com">stemeducationjournal.springeropen.com</a> Internet Source	2%
4	<a href="http://revistas.unal.edu.co">revistas.unal.edu.co</a> Internet Source	1%
5	<a href="http://journal.uinsgd.ac.id">journal.uinsgd.ac.id</a> Internet Source	1%
6	<a href="http://irep.ntu.ac.uk">irep.ntu.ac.uk</a> Internet Source	1%
7	<a href="http://files.eric.ed.gov">files.eric.ed.gov</a> Internet Source	1%
8	<a href="http://www.scirp.org">www.scirp.org</a> Internet Source	1%
9	Pham, Nga T. P., Mien S. R. Segers, and Wim H. Gijssels. "Effects of work environment on	1%

transfer of training: empirical evidence from Master of Business Administration programs in Vietnam : Work environment and transfer of training", International Journal of Training and Development, 2013.

Publication

---

10	<a href="https://repository.nwu.ac.za">repository.nwu.ac.za</a> Internet Source	1 %
11	<a href="http://www.journals.univ-danubius.ro">www.journals.univ-danubius.ro</a> Internet Source	1 %
12	<a href="http://ssbfnet.com">ssbfnet.com</a> Internet Source	1 %
13	<a href="http://www.readkong.com">www.readkong.com</a> Internet Source	1 %
14	<a href="https://scholar.sun.ac.za">scholar.sun.ac.za</a> Internet Source	1 %
15	Lucy R. Betts, Bethany Huntington, Lai-Sang Iao, Gayle V. Dillon, Thom Baguley, Phil Banyard. "Developing a competency-based education training programme for university tutors", The Journal of Competency-Based Education, 2019 Publication	1 %
16	<a href="https://repository.up.ac.za">repository.up.ac.za</a> Internet Source	<1 %
17	<a href="http://lifescienceglobal.com">lifescienceglobal.com</a>	

---

<1 %

18

[www.coursehero.com](http://www.coursehero.com)

Internet Source

<1 %

19

Submitted to Higher Education Commission  
Pakistan

Student Paper

<1 %

20

Paulus van Eeden, M.M. Dichaba, Stephen  
Tong. "Professional development of police  
commanders: From classroom to work  
environment for adult learners", Cogent  
Social Sciences, 2018

Publication

<1 %

21

Submitted to University of Stellenbosch,  
South Africa

Student Paper

<1 %

22

Submitted to 48370

Student Paper

<1 %

23

[hdl.handle.net](http://hdl.handle.net)

Internet Source

<1 %

24

[gbata.org](http://gbata.org)

Internet Source

<1 %

25

Submitted to North West University

Student Paper

<1 %

26

[bjsep.org](http://bjsep.org)

Internet Source

<1 %



27	<a href="http://ndl.ethernet.edu.et">ndl.ethernet.edu.et</a> Internet Source	<1 %
28	Submitted to Regenesys Business School Student Paper	<1 %
29	<a href="http://pure.rug.nl">pure.rug.nl</a> Internet Source	<1 %
30	Chutirut Prasongmanee, Panita Wannapiroon, Prachyanun Nilsook. "Competency Experience-Based Training (CEBT) Model with Ubiquitous Community of Practice (U-CoP) to Enhance Transformation Digital Supervisor", International Education Studies, 2022 Publication	<1 %
31	Submitted to Universiti Teknologi MARA Student Paper	<1 %
32	<a href="http://getd.libs.uga.edu">getd.libs.uga.edu</a> Internet Source	<1 %
33	<a href="http://www.iiste.org">www.iiste.org</a> Internet Source	<1 %
34	<a href="http://www.ajhtl.com">www.ajhtl.com</a> Internet Source	<1 %
35	<a href="http://journals.gujaf.com.ng">journals.gujaf.com.ng</a> Internet Source	<1 %
36	Amira Mustaffa, Surianti Lajuma, Walton Wider. "Employee engagement during COVID-	<1 %

---

37 Jacob Tseko Mofokeng. "Learning to Forget: A Critical Review of Knowledge Management and Knowledge Exchange Initiatives in the Detective Service", International Journal of Criminology and Sociology, 2022

Publication

---

38 [bspace.buid.ac.ae](http://bspace.buid.ac.ae) <1 %

Internet Source

---

39 [www.researchgate.net](http://www.researchgate.net) <1 %

Internet Source

---

40 [core.ac.uk](http://core.ac.uk) <1 %

Internet Source

---

41 [uir.unisa.ac.za](http://uir.unisa.ac.za) <1 %

Internet Source

---

42 [espace.etsmtl.ca](http://espace.etsmtl.ca) <1 %

Internet Source

---

43 [www.knysna.gov.za](http://www.knysna.gov.za) <1 %

Internet Source

---

44 D. M. Gorman, P. J. Gruenewald, P. J. Hanlon, Igor Mezic et al. "Implications of Systems Dynamic Models and Control Theory for Environmental Approaches to the Prevention of Alcohol- and Other Drug Use-Related Problems", Substance Use & Misuse, 2004

- 
- |    |   |                |
|----|---|----------------|
| 45 | <p>Jane Kerr, Petra Brysiewicz, Busi Bhengu.<br/>"DEVELOPING GUIDELINES FOR MANAGING<br/>A NURSING WORKFORCE INFECTED WITH<br/>HIV AND TB IN SOUTH AFRICAN HOSPITALS",<br/>Africa Journal of Nursing and Midwifery, 2016</p> <p>Publication</p> | <p>&lt;1 %</p> |
|----|---|----------------|
- 
- |    |  |                |
|----|--|----------------|
| 46 | <p><a href="http://dera.ioe.ac.uk">dera.ioe.ac.uk</a></p> <p>Internet Source</p> | <p>&lt;1 %</p> |
|----|--|----------------|
- 
- |    |  |                |
|----|--|----------------|
| 47 | <p><a href="http://dspace.nwu.ac.za">dspace.nwu.ac.za</a></p> <p>Internet Source</p> | <p>&lt;1 %</p> |
|----|--|----------------|
- 
- |    |  |                |
|----|--|----------------|
| 48 | <p><a href="http://hydra.hull.ac.uk">hydra.hull.ac.uk</a></p> <p>Internet Source</p> | <p>&lt;1 %</p> |
|----|--|----------------|
- 
- |    |  |                |
|----|--|----------------|
| 49 | <p><a href="http://nomsa.org">nomsa.org</a></p> <p>Internet Source</p> | <p>&lt;1 %</p> |
|----|--|----------------|
- 
- |    |  |                |
|----|--|----------------|
| 50 | <p><a href="http://pmg-assets.s3-website-eu-west-1.amazonaws.com">pmg-assets.s3-website-eu-west-1.amazonaws.com</a></p> <p>Internet Source</p> | <p>&lt;1 %</p> |
|----|--|----------------|
- 
- |    |  |                |
|----|--|----------------|
| 51 | <p><a href="http://scholarworks.waldenu.edu">scholarworks.waldenu.edu</a></p> <p>Internet Source</p> | <p>&lt;1 %</p> |
|----|--|----------------|
- 
- |    |  |                |
|----|--|----------------|
| 52 | <p><a href="http://univendspace.univen.ac.za">univendspace.univen.ac.za</a></p> <p>Internet Source</p> | <p>&lt;1 %</p> |
|----|--|----------------|
- 
- |    |  |                |
|----|--|----------------|
| 53 | <p><a href="http://v-des-dev-lnx1.nwu.ac.za">v-des-dev-lnx1.nwu.ac.za</a></p> <p>Internet Source</p> | <p>&lt;1 %</p> |
|----|--|----------------|
- 
- |    |  |  |
|----|--|--|
| 54 | <p><a href="http://www.publicatie-online.nl">www.publicatie-online.nl</a></p> <p>Internet Source</p> |  |
|----|--|--|

<1 %

55

bdigital.unal.edu.co

Internet Source

<1 %

Exclude quotes      On

Exclude matches      Off

Exclude bibliography      On